Our Ref. S. 09/KKH-1/2012

To:
Mr. John E. Scanlon
Secretary General
CITES

Re: Indonesia’s Objection on Registration of Operation that Breed Appendix I Animal Species in Captivity for Commercial Purposes

Dear Sir,

With reference to the CITES Secretariat’s Notification No. 2011/045 dated 11 October 2011 regarding Registration of Operation that Breed Appendix I Animal Species in Captivity for Commercial Purposes of four Indonesian Cacatua species proposed by the Philippines, the CITES Management Authority of Indonesia would like to draw your attention on the following issues:

1. Founded on the objections that were made by Indonesia for the period of 2004-2008, Indonesia would like to again question the legality of the parent stock which has not been clarified. Indonesia is aware that the Philippines has claimed the pre-convention status of the four Indonesian Cacatua species. However, according to our observation, neither records for the export of Cacatua moluccensis nor for the Cacatua sulphurea specimens in the late 1970s or early 1980s could be found and since 1994 catch quota of the species is zero. In addition, the four Indonesian Cacatua species have been fully protected under Indonesian law since 1999.

2. Recalling the comments made by the Chair for Animal Committee at the last Philippines registration (Notification No. 2008/002 on Control of Operation That Breed Appendix I Animal Species for Commercial Purposes:Annex 2) which underlines that Philippines can establish cooperation with Indonesian CITES authorities, and considering the increased trend in illicit trafficking/smuggling of species included in the CITES Annexes; Indonesia and the Philippines signed the MoU concerning the collaboration on in-situ conservation of Indonesia Cacatua Species on 18 June 2009. The signing of the aforementioned MoU serves as an exemplary action between the two parties to develop greater cooperation on conservation of Indonesian Cacatua species. One major point emanating from the MoU is that both parties agreed to develop a plan of action to fully implement the MoU.
3. On 1 August 2011, Indonesia submitted the draft Plan of Action to the Philippines. To this end, we have never received any written reply on the above mentioned draft from the Philippines.

4. On the 61st Session of the Standing Committee the Indonesian delegation made an intervention on requesting the Philippines to postpone the registration until there is an agreement between Indonesia and the Philippines on action plan and its implementations. According to the resolution Conf. 13.9, Indonesia views that the review of the feasibility of the Plan of Action should be established prior to the Philippines’ submittance of the registration. Herewith the proposed action plan as attached.

Based on the above mentioned issues, the Indonesian Management Authority of CITES would like to present our objection on the Phillipines’ Registration of Operation that Breed Appendix I Animal Species in Captivity for Commercial Purposes of four Indonesian Cacatua species. Furthermore, we look forward to your good offices in considering our objection to be included in the CITES Secretariat’s assessment on the Philippines registration.

Thank you for your kind attention and consideration,

Sincerely yours,

Dr. Novianto Bambang Wawandono
Director of Biodiversity Conservation
For CITES Management Authority of Indonesia

CC.
1. Secretary General, Ministry of Forestry
2. H.E. Mr. Dian Triansyah Djani, Permanent Representative/Ambassador Extraordinary and Plenipotentiary of the Republic Indonesia to the United Nations, WTO and other International Organizations in Geneva
3. Director General of Forest Protection and Nature Conservation, Ministry of Forestry
4. Director General for Multilateral Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
5. Director General for Legal Affairs and International Treaties, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
6. Director of Research Center for Biology, Indonesia Institute of Sciences (CITES Scientific Authority of Indonesia), Cibinong, Bogor.
PLAN OF ACTION
on Collaboration between the Philippines and Indonesia
concerning Conservation of Indonesia Cacatua Species for 2011 – 2015

Background
1. Referring to article 3.3 of the MoU between The Government of the Republic of the Philippines and The Government of the Republic of Indonesia concerning Collaboration on in-situ Conservation of Indonesia Cacatua Species; this action plan/project document is an integral part of MoU.
2. Resolution of the Conf. 13.9 concerning Encouraging Cooperation Between Parties with Ex-Situ Breeding Operations and Those with In-Situ Conservation Programmes;
5. Resolution of the Conf. 5.10 (Rev. CoP15) Definition of Primarily Commercial Purposes
6. Resolution of the Conf. 10.16 (rev) concerning Specimen of Animal Species Bred in Captivity.

Objectives
1. To support and improve in-situ conservation of the Indonesian Cacatua species based upon resources from ex-situ breeding operations
2. To strengthen the enforcement of CITES-listed species by enhancing the legality and sustainability of Indonesia Cacatua Species in both ex-situ breeding and in-situ conservation programs/projects

Action Plan
The approaches propose to implement the action plan are premised on, but not limited to :
1. Status of Parent Stocks
2. Support and improve In-Situ Conservation
3. Support and Improve Ex-situ Conservation
4. Strengthen the enforcement of CITES-listed Species
5. Marketing and Building Image

Those approaches are implemented through several activities, among others technical support, contribution of funds, capacity-building and training, technology transfer, combating illicit/illegal wildlife trade, infrastructure development, and other conservation measures
Plan of Action for 2011 – 2015 (Draft as of August 2, 2011)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Action</th>
<th>Activities</th>
<th>Implementing Body, partners</th>
<th>Time-line</th>
<th>Source of Fund</th>
<th>Remarks</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Status of Parent Stocks (birds as parent stocks are owned by Indonesia in the scheme of breeding loan status)</td>
<td>1.1. Field visit to captive breeding facilities of BII, the Philippines</td>
<td>IND &amp; PHI BII</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>IND PHI</td>
<td>The amount of parent stocks obtained from Indonesia and their productivity level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.2. Documenting parent stock of Indonesian Cacatua species in BII</td>
<td>IND &amp; PHI BII</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>IND PHI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.3. Dealing number of the offspring that will be returned to Indonesia</td>
<td>MA IND &amp; PHI</td>
<td>2011</td>
<td>PHI</td>
<td>Numbers of the offspring to be returned by BII are at least as equal as the amount of parents stocks obtained from Indonesia. The offspring are returned to Indonesia should be pair born, productive, easily traceable genealogical records, and haven been sexing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.4. Returning the offspring from captive breeding of BII for parent stocks purposes at: - Sanctuary - Sister Company</td>
<td>MA PHI &amp; BII MA IND BTNM PS &amp; SC</td>
<td>2012-2013</td>
<td>PHI</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Support and improve In-Situ and Ex-situ Conservation</td>
<td>2.1. Infrastructure development of <em>Cacatua spp.</em> sanctuary in Maluku Province</td>
<td>BTNM</td>
<td>2012-2015</td>
<td>PHI</td>
<td>Activity also includes conditioning a conservation area at the natural habitat of <em>Cacatua spp.</em> as a tourist attraction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.2. Habitat rehabilitation and restoration of <em>Cacatua spp.</em></td>
<td>BTNM CRD CFR</td>
<td>PHI IND</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.3. Research and Development of Indonesian <em>Cacatua spp.</em> - Monitor and inventory population of <em>Cacatua spp.</em> at its natural habitat and captive breeding - Research on genetic mapping of <em>Cacatua spp.</em></td>
<td>SA IND CRD CFR</td>
<td>2012-2015</td>
<td>PHI IND</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.4. Infrastructure development of captive breeding of <em>Cacatua spp.</em> (research/laboratory scale)</td>
<td></td>
<td>PHI</td>
<td>Transfer of technology by PHI to IND including grant for infrastructure development</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5.</td>
<td>Inspection and patrol</td>
<td>PHI</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6.</td>
<td>Release and re-introduction of <em>Cacatua spp.</em> into its natural habitat</td>
<td>MA-SA Indonesia</td>
<td>2014 2015</td>
<td>MA IND</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| 3. Development of commercial captive breeding | 3.1. Identification and Selection sister company (ies) in Indonesia | IND PS & SC | 2011 | IND |
| 3.2. | Training for Captive breeding of *Cacatua spp.*  
- Comparative study and field visit  
- Internship | 2012 - 2013 | PHI/IND PHI |
| 3.3. | Conduct the National Workshop on Captive breeding of Indonesian Cacatua Species | 2012 2014 | IND PHI | Organize two National workshop in Indonesia |
| 3.4. | Field pre-condition, develop model/design, standard procedures and management of captive breeding | 2011 - 2012 | PHI IND |
| 3.5. | Technical assistance and transfer of technology | MA-SA IND PS&SC | 2012-2015 | BII Transfer of technology (whenever necessary) |

| 4. Strengthen the enforcement to combat illegal wildlife trade | 4.1. Capacity building for forestry officers, forest rangers, customs | IND, PHI BII, PS & SC | 2011-2012 | PHI IND |
| 4.3. | Export Data Exchange | 2012-2015 | PHI IND |
| 4.4. | Monitoring of import and inform to Indonesia the suspicious cases of illegal wildlife trade by the Philippines | | 2012-2015 | PHI |
| 4.5. | Return of confiscated birds to Indonesia at a cost borne by the Philippines’ importer(s) | MA IND MA PHI Customs | 2012-2015 | PHI (importer) Equipped with medical records |

<p>| 5. Marketing and Building Image | 5.1. Registration the captive breeders of Indonesia and the Philippines to CITES | MA IND &amp; PHI BII | 2014 (2015) | PHI IND Registration to CITES Secretariat would be carried out together |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Secretariat</th>
<th>PS &amp; SC</th>
<th>between BII and sister company(ies) in Indonesia. Registration is done and can only be done if the sister company(ies) in Indonesia are also ready to register.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5.2. Statement by the Philippines to do not market <em>Cacatua sp.</em> come from their captive breed into Indonesia</td>
<td>2013</td>
<td>PHI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3. Join Campaign to world market concerning the healthy and legality of birds of captive breeding in Indonesia and the Philippines, especially the <em>Cacatua sp.</em></td>
<td>2012 - 2015</td>
<td>PHI IND</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:**

1. **MA** = Management Authority
2. **SA** = Scientific Authority
3. **IND** = Indonesia
4. **PHI** = the Philippines
5. **BII** = the Bird International
6. **CRDCFR** = Centre on Research and Development of Conservation and Forest Rehabilitation
7. **BTNM** = Office of Manusela National Park, Maluku Province
8. **BKSDA Mal** = Office of Conservation and Natural Resources, Maluku Province
9. **PS & SC** = Private Sector and/or Sister Company in Indonesia

In witness whereof, ..................in .................................................................

For the Protected Areas and Wildlife Bureau, the Philippines         For the Directorate of Biodiversity Conservation, Indonesia

????
Director

????
Director