### CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Sixteenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties Bangkok (Thailand), 3-14 March 2013

#### Summary record of the sixth session of Committee I

7 March 2013: 9h15-12h00

Chair: C. Caceres (Canada)

Secretariat: D. Morgan Rapporteurs: S. Delany

S. Glaser J. Gray

C. Rutherford

#### Interpretation and implementation of the Convention

#### Amendments of the Appendices

#### 77. Proposals to amend Appendices I and II

Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia, introduced proposal CoP16 Prop. 1 to transfer *Rupicapra pyrenaica ornata* (Abruzzo chamois) from Appendix I to Appendix II, noting that the proposal had resulted from the Periodic review of the Appendices. It pointed out that whilst some biological criteria for Appendix-I listing might be met, the taxon was not in trade (trade appearing in the trade database being due to errors in reporting) and the current listing was not in line with the guidelines for split-listing. The proposal was <u>accepted</u> by consensus.

Ecuador introduced proposal CoP16 Prop. 2 (Rev. 2) to transfer the populations of *Vicugna vicugna* (vicuña) of Ecuador from Appendix I to Appendix II, and drew attention to document CoP16 Inf. 45, which provided further details on the management procedures in place for the species in Ecuador. It pointed out that the annotation proposed was in line with those applicable to other vicuña populations listed in Appendix II and referred to the latest version of the proposal (Spanish only) that had been sent to the Secretariat, which provided amended wording of the proposed annotation as follows:

Transfer from Appendix I to Appendix II of the vicuña population of Ecuador, for the exclusive purpose of allowing international trade in wool sheared from live vicuñas and in cloth and items made thereof, including luxury handicrafts and knitted articles. The reverse side of the cloth must bear the logotype adopted by the range States of the species, which are signatories to the Convenio para la Conservación y Manejo de la Vicuña, and the selvages the words 'VICUÑA ECUADOR'. Other products must bear a label including the logotype and the designation 'VICUÑA ECUADOR-ARTESANÍA'.

The proposal was supported by Argentina, the Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela, Chile, Colombia, Costa Rica, Mexico, Peru, Senegal and Qatar. Mexico congratulated Ecuador and recommended that their proposed annotation include, as in previous proposals related to vicuña, a sentence at the end that clarified that all specimens from other populations should continue to be considered in Appendix I. In response, Ecuador stated it would amend the proposal by adding: All other specimens shall be deemed to be specimens of species included in Appendix I and the trade in them shall be regulated accordingly." Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia, expressed its support of the proposal with this amendment. The amended proposal was accepted by consensus.

The United States of America introduced amendment proposal CoP16 Prop. 3 to transfer *Ursus maritimus* (polar bear) from Appendix II to Appendix I. It recognized that habitat loss caused by climate change was the principal threat to the species, noting that a two-thirds decline in population over the next three generations had been predicted. It considered the transfer to be an important step in reducing pressures on the species, particularly in light of the apparently increasing volume and value of international trade, which it considered unsustainable. It pointed out that the needs of subsistence users were recognized in the proposal.

Comoros, India, Liberia, Niger, Senegal, Russian Federation, Ukraine, the Center for Biological Diversity and the Natural Resources Defense Council, speaking also on behalf of 22 other non-governmental organizations, supported the proposal. The Russian Federation mentioned the issue of legally exported pelts from Canada being used to mask pelts poached from the Russian Arctic. Egypt provisionally supported the proposal, pending the presentation of persuasive data.

Denmark, speaking on behalf of Greenland, and supported by Canada, Iceland, Japan and South Africa opposed the proposal. It considered that proposals should be based on unequivocal scientific evidence. It did not consider the proposal met the criteria for transfer to Appendix I and believed there would be a risk to the credibility of CITES if it were accepted. It pointed out that harvest in Greenland was not market-driven but was for subsistence, based on scientific management and long-standing tradition. It urged countries to address pollution, which was leading to climate change resulting in habitat loss, the main threat to the species. Canada, in supporting Denmark, spoke of the importance of the species to Inuit culture.

Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia, stressed the importance of range States agreeing common approaches. It had had informal discussions with all five range States but had failed to reach consensus. It was proposing the following amendment to Cop16 Prop. 3 as follows:

To maintain Ursus maritimus on Appendix II with the following annotation:

For the exclusive purpose of allowing trade from range States, in specimens of wild source, only in those circumstances where the respective range State has published export quotas in line with Resolution Conf. 14.7, set at an appropriate level for each individual sub-population.

It also proposed the following draft decisions:

#### Directed to the CITES Secretariat

Liaise with the IUCN/SSC PB Specialist Group to encourage them to urgently undertake a review of the status of all subpopulations of polar bears and invite them to make this publicly available so that it can be assessed by the Animals Committee at its 27th meeting (which is due to be held in 2014).

#### Directed to the polar bear range States

- 16.xx Provide to the Animals Committee, as soon as possible and in any case in time to be considered at its 27th meeting, and to the CITES Secretariat, any available updated information regarding:
  - 1. the status and trends of their polar bear sub-populations;
  - 2. the levels of trade in polar bears and their parts and derivatives and how trade is managed and monitored, and any relevant factors influencing trade. Such information should include data on the total trade for personal purposes, including hunting trophies and other Personal and Household Effects, for commercial trade, and for scientific and educational use:
  - the sustainability and management of their polar bear harvest levels and notably how the input of the IUCN/SSC Polar Bear Specialist Group and other sources of information, including traditional ecological knowledge, and observed and projected impacts from climate change, are taken into consideration in the determination of those levels;

- 16.xx Provide the CITES Secretariat before the 65th meeting of the Standing Committee with updated information regarding the level and control of the illegal trade and harvest of polar bears, including domestic legislation addressing wildlife crime and its application in practice, and on the verification of CITES export permits.
- 16.xx Determine if a tagging system would be an effective instrument towards improving traceability of trade in polar bear hides/skins and control of illegal trade.

#### Directed to the Animals Committee

- 16.xx Instructs the Animals Committee to enter polar bears into the Review of Significant Trade as an urgent case under paragraph c) of Res. Conf. 12.8 (Rev CoP13) and to expedite the review process, using the information available from Decision 16.xx and postal procedures if necessary, such that polar bears are categorized under paragraph i) I) of the same Resolution and recommendations, if any, under paragraphs m) p) are formulated and transmitted to range States before CoP17.
- 16.xx Review at its 27th meeting the latest scientific information available on the current status and future prospects of the polar bear and its habitat, including outputs from the IUCN/SSC Polar Bear Specialist Group (if available), the CITES trade database and any other information that the Committee deems relevant.
- 16.xx Determine if other appropriate action under CITES could contribute to the long-term survival of polar bears.
- 16.xx Report to the Standing Committee at its 66th meeting (which is due to be held in 2015), at the latest, on the results of the Animals Committee's actions with recommendations to the Standing Committee for other actions that may be appropriate.

#### Directed to all Parties

16.xx Note that, ultimately, polar bears are primarily threatened by climate change and the associated loss of Arctic sea ice. Parties are encouraged to take action at all levels, including at national and international level, to mitigate against the impacts of climate change

Norway and Kuwait supported the amendment and draft decisions. Brazil also supported these, apart from the draft decision to all Parties which they opposed. Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia, agreed to withdraw this draft decision.

Botswana and Japan wished to hear the opinion of range States. Paraguay asked for advice from the IUCN/SSC Polar Bear Specialist Group. Israel, while supporting the amendment in principle, believed that it represented an increase in scope of the original proposal and was therefore not allowed under Rule of Procedure 23.5. It asserted that, in order to adhere to this Rule, and be in conformity with Resolution Conf. 11.21 (Rev. CoP15) on use of annotations in Appendices I and II, the amendment would need to specify actual export quotas from each range State.

The Chair stated that she considered the proposed amendment to represent a reduction in scope of the original proposal, which was why she had allowed it to be considered. Israel challenged the ruling and a vote was called under Rule 18. Seventy-three Parties supported the ruling of the Chair, 28 opposed it and 15 abstained [see Annex 1].

The Chair invited range State comments on the proposed amendments to the proposal. They were supported by Denmark, speaking on behalf of Greenland, and Norway, and opposed by Canada, the Russian Federation and the United States. Canada believed that they could result in the disengagement of Inuit populations from management of their local wildlife. The United States considered that the amendment simply preserved the status quo, while demand for trade was growing, and the Russian Federation feared it would help stimulate such demand.

IUCN stressed that forecasts of future declines in polar bear populations were based on uncertain models of the future habitat of the species, and noted that the guidelines for assessing proposals in Resolution Conf. 9.24 (Rev. CoP15) did not explicitly address the time period over which projected future declines

should be considered in the context of the biological criteria for inclusion in Appendix I. It urged the Parties to clarify this in any future revision of the Resolution, regardless of the outcome of the present proposal.

The observer from the Association of Western State Fish and Wildlife Agencies and the leader of the Inuit Tapiriit Kanatami opposed the original proposal and the amendment and draft decisions put forward. The latter maintained that Inuit management of polar bear populations was sustainable and reiterated views that the proposal was not in accordance with required biological criteria.

The Chair called for a vote on amendment proposal CoP16 Prop. 3, as amended by Ireland, on behalf of the Member States of the European Union and Croatia. Sixty-three Parties voted for the amendment, 43 against, and 17 abstained: it therefore failed to achieve the two-thirds' majority in favour and was <u>rejected</u> [see Annex 2]. She then put the original proposal CoP16 Prop. 3 to a vote. It was also <u>rejected</u>, with 38 Parties in favour, 42 against and 46 abstentions [see Annex 3].

The meeting was adjourned at 12h00.

## VOTE ON THE POINT OF ORDER RELATED TO AMENDMENT PROPOSAL COP16 PROP. 3 [URSUS MARITIMUS (POLAR BEAR)]

2         Albania         0         NA           3         Algeria         1         NO           4         Antigua and Barbuda         1         NV           5         Argentina         1         NV           6         Armenia         1         YES           7         Australia         1         NO           8         Austria         1         NO           9         Azerbaijan         1         NO           10         Bahamas         1         YES           11         Bohrain         1         NVP           12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA           14         Belarus         1         ABST           15         Belgium         1         NO           16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21				
3         Algeria         1         NO           4         Antigua and Barbuda         1         NV           5         Argentina         1         NO           6         Armenia         1         YES           7         Australia         1         NO           8         Austria         1         NO           9         Azerbaijan         1         NO           10         Bahamas         1         YES           11         Bahrain         1         NVP           12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA           14         Belarus         1         ABST           15         Belgium         1         NO           16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22	1	Afghanistan	0	NA
4         Antigua and Barbuda         1         NV           5         Argentina         1         NO           6         Armenia         1         YES           7         Australia         1         NO           8         Austria         1         NO           9         Azerbaijan         1         NO           10         Bahamas         1         YES           11         Bahrain         1         NVP           12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA           14         Belarus         1         ABST           15         Belgium         1         NO           16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         NO           24				
5         Argentina         1         NO           6         Armenia         1         YES           7         Australia         1         NO           8         Austria         1         NO           9         Azerbaijan         1         NO           10         Bahamas         1         YES           11         Bahrain         1         NVP           12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA           14         Belarus         1         ABST           15         Belgium         1         NO           16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         NV           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24	3		1	NO
6         Armenia         1         YES           7         Australia         1         NO           8         Austria         1         NO           9         Azerbaijan         1         NO           10         Bahamas         1         YES           11         Bahrain         1         NVP           12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA           14         Belarus         1         ABST           15         Belgium         1         NO           16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         YES           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NO           25	4	Antigua and Barbuda	1	NV
7         Australia         1         NO           8         Austria         1         NO           9         Azerbaijan         1         NO           10         Bahamas         1         YES           11         Bahrain         1         NVP           12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA           14         Belarus         1         ABST           15         Belgium         1         NO           16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         NV           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NV           25	5	Argentina	1	NO
8         Austria         1         NO           9         Azerbaijan         1         NO           10         Bahamas         1         YES           11         Bahrain         1         NVP           12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA           14         Belarus         1         ABST           15         Belgium         1         NO           16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NV           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NV           22         Brazil         1         YES           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NO           25         Burkina Faso         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           27 </td <td>6</td> <td>Armenia</td> <td>1</td> <td>YES</td>	6	Armenia	1	YES
9         Azerbaijan         1         NO           10         Bahamas         1         YES           11         Bahrain         1         NVP           12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA           14         Belarus         1         ABST           15         Belgium         1         NO           16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NV           22         Brazil         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         YES           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NO           25         Burtina Faso         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           27<	7	Australia	1	NO
10         Bahamas         1         YES           11         Bahrain         1         NVP           12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA           14         Belares         1         ABST           15         Belgium         1         NO           16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         YES           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NO           25         Burkina Faso         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           27         Cambodia         1         YES           30	8	Austria	1	NO
11         Bahrain         1         NVP           12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA           14         Belarus         1         ABST           15         Belgium         1         NO           16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         YES           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NO           25         Burkina Faso         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           27         Cambodia         1         YES           28         Cameroon         1         NO           29	9	Azerbaijan	1	NO
12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA           14         Belarus         1         ABST           15         Belgium         1         NO           16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         YES           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NO           25         Burkina Faso         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           27         Cambodia         1         YES           28         Cameroon         1         NO           29         Canada         1         YES           30         Cape Verde         0         NA	10	Bahamas	1	YES
13         Barbados         0         NA           14         Belarus         1         ABST           15         Belgium         1         NO           16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         YES           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NO           25         Burkina Faso         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           27         Cambodia         1         YES           28         Cameroon         1         NO           29         Canada         1         YES           30         Cape Verde         0         NA           31         Central African Republic         1         NV <tr< td=""><td>11</td><td>Bahrain</td><td>1</td><td>NVP</td></tr<>	11	Bahrain	1	NVP
14         Belarus         1         ABST           15         Belgium         1         NO           16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         YES           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NO           25         Burkina Faso         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           27         Cambodia         1         YES           28         Cameroon         1         NO           29         Canada         1         YES           30         Cape Verde         0         NA           31         Central African Republic         1         NV	12	Bangladesh	0	NA
15         Belgium         1         NO           16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         YES           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NO           25         Burkina Faso         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           27         Cambodia         1         YES           28         Cameroon         1         NO           29         Canada         1         YES           30         Cape Verde         0         NA           31         Central African Republic         1         NV           32         Chad         0         NA           33         Chile         1         ABST	13	Barbados	0	NA
16         Belize         1         NV           17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         YES           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NO           25         Burkina Faso         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           27         Cambodia         1         YES           28         Cameroon         1         NO           29         Canada         1         YES           30         Cape Verde         0         NA           31         Central African Republic         1         NV           32         Chad         0         NA           33         Chile         1         ABST	14	Belarus	1	ABST
17         Benin         1         NVP           18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         YES           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NO           25         Burkina Faso         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           27         Cambodia         1         YES           28         Cameroon         1         NO           29         Canada         1         YES           30         Cape Verde         0         NA           31         Central African Republic         1         NV           32         Chad         0         NA           33         Chile         1         ABST           34         China         1         YES           35         Colombia         1         NO	15	Belgium	1	NO
18         Bhutan         1         ABST           19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         YES           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NO           25         Burkina Faso         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           27         Cambodia         1         YES           28         Cameroon         1         NO           29         Canada         1         YES           30         Cape Verde         0         NA           31         Central African Republic         1         NV           32         Chad         0         NA           33         Chile         1         ABST           34         China         1         YES           35         Colombia         1         NO           36         Comoros         1         NO	16	Belize	1	NV
19         Plurinational State of Bolivia         0         NA           20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         YES           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NO           25         Burkina Faso         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           27         Cambodia         1         YES           28         Cameroon         1         NO           29         Canada         1         YES           30         Cape Verde         0         NA           31         Central African Republic         1         NV           32         Chad         0         NA           33         Chile         1         ABST           34         China         1         NO           35         Colombia         1         NO           36         Comoros         1         NO           37         Congo         1         NV	17	Benin	1	NVP
20         Bosnia and Herzegovina         1         NV           21         Botswana         1         NO           22         Brazil         1         YES           23         Brunei Darussalam         1         NO           24         Bulgaria         1         NO           25         Burkina Faso         1         NV           26         Burundi         1         NV           27         Cambodia         1         YES           28         Cameroon         1         NO           29         Canada         1         YES           30         Cape Verde         0         NA           31         Central African Republic         1         NV           32         Chad         0         NA           33         Chile         1         ABST           34         China         1         YES           35         Colombia         1         NO           36         Comoros         1         NO           37         Congo         1         NV           38         Costa Rica         1         ABST	18	Bhutan	1	ABST
21       Botswana       1       NO         22       Brazil       1       YES         23       Brunei Darussalam       1       NO         24       Bulgaria       1       NO         25       Burkina Faso       1       NV         26       Burundi       1       NV         27       Cambodia       1       YES         28       Cameroon       1       NO         29       Canada       1       YES         30       Cape Verde       0       NA         31       Central African Republic       1       NV         32       Chad       0       NA         33       Chile       1       ABST         34       China       1       YES         35       Colombia       1       NO         36       Comoros       1       NO         37       Congo       1       NV         38       Costa Rica       1       ABST	19	Plurinational State of Bolivia	0	NA
22       Brazil       1       YES         23       Brunei Darussalam       1       NO         24       Bulgaria       1       NO         25       Burkina Faso       1       NV         26       Burundi       1       NV         27       Cambodia       1       YES         28       Cameroon       1       NO         29       Canada       1       YES         30       Cape Verde       0       NA         31       Central African Republic       1       NV         32       Chad       0       NA         33       Chile       1       ABST         34       China       1       YES         35       Colombia       1       NO         36       Comoros       1       NO         37       Congo       1       NV         38       Costa Rica       1       ABST	20	Bosnia and Herzegovina	1	NV
23       Brunei Darussalam       1       NO         24       Bulgaria       1       NO         25       Burkina Faso       1       NV         26       Burundi       1       NV         27       Cambodia       1       YES         28       Cameroon       1       NO         29       Canada       1       YES         30       Cape Verde       0       NA         31       Central African Republic       1       NV         32       Chad       0       NA         33       Chile       1       ABST         34       China       1       YES         35       Colombia       1       NO         36       Comoros       1       NO         37       Congo       1       NV         38       Costa Rica       1       ABST	21	Botswana	1	NO
24       Bulgaria       1       NO         25       Burkina Faso       1       NV         26       Burundi       1       NV         27       Cambodia       1       YES         28       Cameroon       1       NO         29       Canada       1       YES         30       Cape Verde       0       NA         31       Central African Republic       1       NV         32       Chad       0       NA         33       Chile       1       ABST         34       China       1       YES         35       Colombia       1       NO         36       Comoros       1       NO         37       Congo       1       NV         38       Costa Rica       1       ABST	22	Brazil	1	YES
25       Burkina Faso       1       NV         26       Burundi       1       NV         27       Cambodia       1       YES         28       Cameroon       1       NO         29       Canada       1       YES         30       Cape Verde       0       NA         31       Central African Republic       1       NV         32       Chad       0       NA         33       Chile       1       ABST         34       China       1       YES         35       Colombia       1       NO         36       Comoros       1       NO         37       Congo       1       NV         38       Costa Rica       1       ABST	23	Brunei Darussalam	1	NO
26       Burundi       1       NV         27       Cambodia       1       YES         28       Cameroon       1       NO         29       Canada       1       YES         30       Cape Verde       0       NA         31       Central African Republic       1       NV         32       Chad       0       NA         33       Chile       1       ABST         34       China       1       YES         35       Colombia       1       NO         36       Comoros       1       NO         37       Congo       1       NV         38       Costa Rica       1       ABST	24	Bulgaria	1	NO
27       Cambodia       1       YES         28       Cameroon       1       NO         29       Canada       1       YES         30       Cape Verde       0       NA         31       Central African Republic       1       NV         32       Chad       0       NA         33       Chile       1       ABST         34       China       1       YES         35       Colombia       1       NO         36       Comoros       1       NO         37       Congo       1       NV         38       Costa Rica       1       ABST	25	Burkina Faso	1	NV
28         Cameroon         1         NO           29         Canada         1         YES           30         Cape Verde         0         NA           31         Central African Republic         1         NV           32         Chad         0         NA           33         Chile         1         ABST           34         China         1         YES           35         Colombia         1         NO           36         Comoros         1         NO           37         Congo         1         NV           38         Costa Rica         1         ABST	26	Burundi	1	NV
29         Canada         1         YES           30         Cape Verde         0         NA           31         Central African Republic         1         NV           32         Chad         0         NA           33         Chile         1         ABST           34         China         1         YES           35         Colombia         1         NO           36         Comoros         1         NO           37         Congo         1         NV           38         Costa Rica         1         ABST	27	Cambodia	1	YES
30         Cape Verde         0         NA           31         Central African Republic         1         NV           32         Chad         0         NA           33         Chile         1         ABST           34         China         1         YES           35         Colombia         1         NO           36         Comoros         1         NO           37         Congo         1         NV           38         Costa Rica         1         ABST	28	Cameroon	1	NO
31         Central African Republic         1         NV           32         Chad         0         NA           33         Chile         1         ABST           34         China         1         YES           35         Colombia         1         NO           36         Comoros         1         NO           37         Congo         1         NV           38         Costa Rica         1         ABST	29	Canada	1	YES
32       Chad       0       NA         33       Chile       1       ABST         34       China       1       YES         35       Colombia       1       NO         36       Comoros       1       NO         37       Congo       1       NV         38       Costa Rica       1       ABST	30	Cape Verde	0	NA
33       Chile       1       ABST         34       China       1       YES         35       Colombia       1       NO         36       Comoros       1       NO         37       Congo       1       NV         38       Costa Rica       1       ABST	31	Central African Republic	1	NV
33       Chile       1       ABST         34       China       1       YES         35       Colombia       1       NO         36       Comoros       1       NO         37       Congo       1       NV         38       Costa Rica       1       ABST	32	Chad	0	NA
34         China         1         YES           35         Colombia         1         NO           36         Comoros         1         NO           37         Congo         1         NV           38         Costa Rica         1         ABST	33	Chile	1	ABST
35         Colombia         1         NO           36         Comoros         1         NO           37         Congo         1         NV           38         Costa Rica         1         ABST	34	China	1	YES
36         Comoros         1         NO           37         Congo         1         NV           38         Costa Rica         1         ABST	35		1	
37         Congo         1         NV           38         Costa Rica         1         ABST	36		1	NO
38 Costa Rica 1 ABST				
		-	1	
39   Côte d'Ivoire   0   NA	39	Côte d'Ivoire	0	NA
40 Croatia 1 NO				
41 Cuba 1 NO				

		T	
42	Cyprus	0	NA
43	Czech Republic	1	NO
44	Democratic Republic of the Congo	1	YES
45	Denmark	1	NO
46	Djibouti	0	NA
47	Dominica	0	NA
48	Dominican Republic	1	NO
49	Ecuador	1	ABST
50	Egypt	1	YES
51	El Salvador	1	YES
52	Equatorial Guinea	0	NA
53	Eritrea	0	NA
54	Estonia	1	NO
55	Ethiopia	1	YES
56	Fiji	0	NA
57	Finland	1	NO
58	France	1	NO
59	Gabon	0	NA
60	Gambia	1	NO
61	Georgia	1	YES
62	Germany	1	NO
63	Ghana	1	ABST
64	Greece	1	NO
65	Grenada	1	ABST
66	Guatemala	1	ABST
67	Guinea	1	NO
68	Guinea-Bissau	0	NA
69	Guyana	1	YES
70	Honduras	1	YES
71	Hungary	1	NO
72	Iceland	1	YES
73	India	1	NO
74	Indonesia	1	NO
75	Islamic Republic of Iran	0	NA
76	Ireland	1	NO
77	Israel	1	YES
78	Italy	1	NO
79	Jamaica	1	NO
80	Japan	1	NO
81	Jordan	1	NO
82	Kazakhstan	0	NA
83	Kenya	1	YES
84	Kuwait	1	NO
85	Kyrgyzstan	0	NA
86	Lao People's Democratic Republic	1	NO
87	Latvia	1	NO
	Latria	<u>'</u>	110

	1		
88	Lesotho	0	NA
89	Liberia	1	YES
90	Libya	1	NO
91	Liechtenstein	1	NO
92	Lithuania	1	NO
93	Luxembourg	1	NO
94	Madagascar	1	NO
95	Malawi	0	NA
96	Malaysia	1	NO
98	Mali	1	YES
99	Maldives	0	NA
100	Malta	1	NO
101	Mauritania	1	NO
102	Mauritius	0	NA
103	Mexico	0	NA
104	Monaco	1	NO
105	Mongolia	0	NA
106	Montenegro	1	NV
107	Morocco	1	ABST
108	Mozambique	1	NV
109	Myanmar	1	NV
110	Namibia	1	NO
111	Nepal	1	NO
112	Netherlands	1	NO
113	New Zealand	1	ABST
114	Nicaragua	0	NA
115	Niger	1	YES
116	Nigeria	0	NA
117	Norway	1	NO
118	Oman	1	ABST
119	Pakistan	1	NO
120	Palau	0	NA
121	Panama	1	YES
122	Papua New Guinea	0	NA
123	Paraguay	1	ABST
124	Peru	1	NO
125	Philippines	1	NVP
126	Poland	1	NO
127	Portugal	1	NO
128	Qatar	1	NO
129	Republic of Korea	1	NO
130	Republic of Moldova	1	NO
131	Romania	1	NO
120			
132	Russian Federation	1	YES
132	Russian Federation Rwanda	1 0	YES NA

135	Saint Lucia	1	ABST
136	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	1	NV NV
137	Samoa	1	NO
138	San Marino	0	NA
139	Sao Tome and Principe	1	NO
140	Saudi Arabia	0	NA
141	Senegal	1	YES
142	Serbia	1	NV
143	Seychelles	1	NV
144	Sierra Leone	1	NVP
145	Singapore	1	NO
146	Slovakia	1	NO
147	Slovenia	1	NO
148	Solomon Islands	0	NA
149	Somalia	1	NV
150	South Africa	1	NO
151	Spain	1	NO
152	Sri Lanka	1	NVP
153	Sudan	1	NVP
154	Suriname	1	YES
155	Swaziland	1	ABST
156	Sweden	1	NO
157	Switzerland	1	NO
158	Syrian Arab Republic	0	NA
159	Thailand	1	NVP
160	The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	0	NA
161	Togo	1	NO
162	Trinidad and Tobago	0	NA
163	Tunisia	1	YES
164	Turkey	1	NO
165	Uganda	1	YES
166	Ukraine	1	NO
167	United Arab Emirates	1	ABST
168	United Kingdom	1	NO
169	United Republic of Tanzania	1	YES
170	United States of America	1	YES
171	Uruguay	1	YES
172	Uzbekistan	0	NA
173	Vanuatu	1	NO
174	Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela	1	NVP
175	Viet Nam	1	NO
176	Yemen	1	NO
177	Zambia	1	NV
178	Zimbabwe	1	NO

# VOTE ON AMENDMENT PROPOSAL COP16 PROP. 3 [URSUS MARITIMUS (POLAR BEAR)], AS AMENDED BY IRELAND, ON BEHALF OF THE MEMBER STATES OF THE EUROPEAN UNION AND CROATIA

2	Afghanistan Albania	0	NA
	Albania		
3		0	NA
	Algeria	1	NO
4	Antigua and Barbuda	1	NV
5	Argentina	1	YES
6	Armenia	1	NO
7	Australia	1	YES
8	Austria	1	YES
9	Azerbaijan	1	YES
10	Bahamas	1	NO
11	Bahrain	1	ABST
12	Bangladesh	0	NA
13	Barbados	0	NA
14	Belarus	1	NO
15	Belgium	1	YES
	Belize	1	YES
17	Benin	1	ABST
18	Bhutan	1	NO
19	Plurinational State of Bolivia	0	NA
	Bosnia and Herzegovina	1	NV
	Botswana	1	YES
22	Brazil	1	YES
23	Brunei Darussalam	1	NO
24	Bulgaria	1	YES
	Burkina Faso	1	NV
26	Burundi	1	ABST
27	Cambodia	1	YES
28	Cameroon	1	NO
29	Canada	1	NO
	Cape Verde	0	NA
	Central African Republic	1	NV
	Chad	0	NA
	Chile	1	ABST
	China	1	YES
	Colombia	<u>.</u> 1	NO
	Comoros	1	NO
	Congo	<u>.</u> 1	NV
	Costa Rica	<u>.</u> 1	ABST
	Côte d'Ivoire	0	NA
- 55	Croatia	<u>0</u> 1	YES

41	Cuba	1	NO
42	Cyprus	0	NA
43	Czech Republic	1	YES
44	Democratic Republic of the Congo	1	NVP
45	Denmark	1	YES
46	Djibouti	0	NA
47	Dominica	0	NA
48	Dominican Republic	1	YES
49	Ecuador	1	YES
50	Egypt	1	YES
51	El Salvador	1	YES
52	Equatorial Guinea	0	NA
53	Eritrea	0	NA
54	Estonia	1	YES
55	Ethiopia	1	NO
56	Fiji	0	NA
57	Finland	1	YES
58	France	1	YES
59	Gabon	0	NA
60	Gambia	1	YES
61	Georgia	1	NO
62	Germany	1	YES
63	Ghana	1	YES
64	Greece	1	YES
65	Grenada	1	ABST
66	Guatemala	1	NV
67	Guinea	1	YES
	Guinea-Bissau	0	NA NA
68 69		1	
	Guyana		NO NO
70	Honduras	1	YES
71	Hungary		
72	Iceland	1	NO
73	India	1	NO
74	Indonesia	1	ABST
75	Islamic Republic of Iran	0	NA NEC
76	Ireland	1	YES
77	Israel	1	NO
78	Italy	1	YES
79	Jamaica .	1	YES
80	Japan	1	NO
81	Jordan	1	NO
82	Kazakhstan	0	NA
83	Kenya	1	YES
84	Kuwait	1	NO
85	Kyrgyzstan	0	NA
86	Lao People's Democratic Republic	1	ABST

87	Latvia	1	YES
88	Lesotho	0	NA
89	Liberia	1	NO
90	Libya	1	NO
91	Liechtenstein	1	ABST
92	Lithuania	1	YES
93	Luxembourg	1	YES
94	Madagascar	1	YES
95	Malawi	0	NA
96	Malaysia	1	YES
98	Mali	1	YES
99	Maldives	0	NA
100	Malta	1	YES
101	Mauritania	1	YES
102	Mauritius	0	NA
103	Mexico	0	NA
104	Monaco	1	ABST
105	Mongolia	0	NA
106	Montenegro	1	YES
107	Morocco	1	NVP
108	Mozambique	1	YES
109	Myanmar	1	YES
110	Namibia	1	NO
111	Nepal	1	YES
112	Netherlands	1	YES
113	New Zealand	1	YES
114	Nicaragua	0	NA
115	Niger	1	NO
116	Nigeria	0	NA
117	Norway	1	YES
118	Oman	1	NO
119	Pakistan	1	ABST
120	Palau	0	NA
121	Panama	1	NO
122	Papua New Guinea	0	NA
123	Paraguay	1	YES
124	Peru	1	YES
125	Philippines	1	NVP
126	Poland	1	YES
127	Portugal	1	YES
128	Qatar	1	ABST
129	Republic of Korea	1	NO
130	Republic of Moldova	1	NO
131	Romania	1	YES
132	Russian Federation	1	NO
133	Rwanda	0	NA

		1	
134	Saint Kitts and Nevis	1	NV
135	Saint Lucia	1	ABST
136	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	1	NV
137	Samoa	1	NO
138	San Marino	0	NA
139	Sao Tome and Principe	1	ABST
140	Saudi Arabia	0	NA
141	Senegal	1	NO
142	Serbia	1	YES
143	Seychelles	1	NV
144	Sierra Leone	1	NVP
145	Singapore	1	NO
146	Slovakia	1	YES
147	Slovenia	1	YES
148	Solomon Islands	0	NA
149	Somalia	1	NV
150	South Africa	1	YES
151	Spain	1	YES
152	Sri Lanka	1	NVP
153	Sudan	1	NO
154	Suriname	1	ABST
155	Swaziland	1	NO
156	Sweden	1	YES
157	Switzerland	1	ABST
158	Syrian Arab Republic	0	NA
159	Thailand	1	NVP
160	The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	0	NA
161	Togo	1	YES
162	Trinidad and Tobago	0	NA
163	Tunisia	1	NO
164	Turkey	1	YES
165	Uganda	1	NO
166	Ukraine	1	NO
167	United Arab Emirates	1	ABST
168	United Kingdom	1	YES
169	United Republic of Tanzania	1	NO
170	United States of America	1	NO
171	Uruguay	1	NO
172	Uzbekistan	0	NA
173	Vanuatu	1	NO
174	Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela	1	YES
175	Viet Nam	1	YES
176	Yemen	1	NO
177	Zambia	1	NV
178	Zimbabwe	1	YES
-170		<u>'</u>	5

## VOTE ON THE ORIGINAL AMENDMENT PROPOSAL COP16 PROP. 3 [URSUS MARITIMUS (POLAR BEAR)]

1       Afghanistan       0       NA         2       Albania       0       NA         3       Algeria       1       ABST         4       Antigua and Barbuda       1       NV         5       Argentina       1       YES         6       Armenia       1       YES         7       Australia       1       YES         8       Austria       1       ABST         9       Azerbaijan       1       ABST         10       Bahamas       1       NO         11       Bahrain       1       NO         12       Bangladesh       0       NA         13       Barbados       0       NA         14       Belarus       1       YES
3       Algeria       1       ABST         4       Antigua and Barbuda       1       NV         5       Argentina       1       YES         6       Armenia       1       YES         7       Australia       1       YES         8       Austria       1       ABST         9       Azerbaijan       1       ABST         10       Bahamas       1       NO         11       Bahrain       1       NO         12       Bangladesh       0       NA         13       Barbados       0       NA
4       Antigua and Barbuda       1       NV         5       Argentina       1       YES         6       Armenia       1       YES         7       Australia       1       YES         8       Austria       1       ABST         9       Azerbaijan       1       ABST         10       Bahamas       1       NO         11       Bahrain       1       NO         12       Bangladesh       0       NA         13       Barbados       0       NA
5         Argentina         1         YES           6         Armenia         1         YES           7         Australia         1         YES           8         Austria         1         ABST           9         Azerbaijan         1         ABST           10         Bahamas         1         NO           11         Bahrain         1         NO           12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA
6       Armenia       1       YES         7       Australia       1       YES         8       Austria       1       ABST         9       Azerbaijan       1       ABST         10       Bahamas       1       NO         11       Bahrain       1       NO         12       Bangladesh       0       NA         13       Barbados       0       NA
7       Australia       1       YES         8       Austria       1       ABST         9       Azerbaijan       1       ABST         10       Bahamas       1       NO         11       Bahrain       1       NO         12       Bangladesh       0       NA         13       Barbados       0       NA
8         Austria         1         ABST           9         Azerbaijan         1         ABST           10         Bahamas         1         NO           11         Bahrain         1         NO           12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA
9       Azerbaijan       1       ABST         10       Bahamas       1       NO         11       Bahrain       1       NO         12       Bangladesh       0       NA         13       Barbados       0       NA
10         Bahamas         1         NO           11         Bahrain         1         NO           12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA
11         Bahrain         1         NO           12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA
12         Bangladesh         0         NA           13         Barbados         0         NA
13 Barbados 0 NA
14 Belarus 1 YES
15 Belgium 1 ABST
16 Belize 1 NO
17 Benin 1 ABST
18 Bhutan 1 YES
19 Plurinational State of Bolivia 0 NA
20 Bosnia and Herzegovina 1 NV
21 Botswana 1 ABST
22 Brazil 1 ABST
23 Brunei Darussalam 1 NO
24 Bulgaria 1 ABST
25 Burkina Faso 1 NV
26 Burundi 1 NO
27 Cambodia 1 YES
28 Cameroon 1 YES
29 Canada 1 NO
30 Cape Verde 0 NA
31 Central African Republic 1 NV
32 Chad 0 NA
33 Chile 1 YES
34 China 1 NO
35 Colombia 1 YES
36 Comoros 1 YES
37 Congo 1 NV
38 Costa Rica 1 YES
39 Côte d'Ivoire 0 NA
40 Croatia 1 ABST
41 Cuba 1 NO

	_		
42	Cyprus	0	NA
43	Czech Republic	1	ABST
44	Democratic Republic of the Congo	1	YES
45	Denmark	1	NO
46	Djibouti	0	NA
47	Dominica	0	NA
48	Dominican Republic	1	NO
49	Ecuador	1	NO
50	Egypt	1	YES
51	El Salvador	1	NO
52	Equatorial Guinea	0	NA
53	Eritrea	0	NA
54	Estonia	1	ABST
55	Ethiopia	1	YES
56	Fiji	0	NA
57	Finland	1	ABST
58	France	1	ABST
59	Gabon	0	NA
60	Gambia	1	NO
61	Georgia	1	YES
62	Germany	1	ABST
63	Ghana	1	ABST
64	Greece	1	ABST
65	Grenada	1	NO
66	Guatemala	1	NV
67	Guinea	1	NO
68	Guinea-Bissau	0	NA
69	Guyana	1	NO
70	Honduras	1	ABST
71	Hungary	1	ABST
72	Iceland	1	NO
73	India	1	YES
74	Indonesia	1	ABST
75	Islamic Republic of Iran	0	NA
76	Ireland	1	ABST
77	Israel	1	YES
78	Italy	1	ABST
79	Jamaica	1	NO
80	Japan	1	NO
81	Jordan	1	YES
82	Kazakhstan	0	NA
83	Kenya	1	YES
84	Kuwait	1	NO
85	Kyrgyzstan	0	NA
86	Lao People's Democratic Republic	1	ABST
87	Latvia	1	ABST

88	Lesotho	0	NA
89	Liberia	1	YES
90	Libya	1	YES
91	Liechtenstein	1	NO
92	Lithuania	1	ABST
93	Luxembourg	1	ABST
94	Madagascar	1	NO
95	Malawi	0	NA
96	Malaysia	1	NO
98	Mali	1	YES
99	Maldives	0	NA
100	Malta	1	ABST
101	Mauritania	1	YES
102	Mauritius	0	NA
103	Mexico	0	NA
104	Monaco	1	ABST
105	Mongolia	0	NA
106	Montenegro	1	ABST
107	Morocco	1	NVP
108	Mozambique	1	NO
109	Myanmar	1	ABST
110	Namibia	1	NO
111	Nepal	1	YES
112	Netherlands	1	ABST
113	New Zealand	1	ABST
114	Nicaragua	0	NA
115	Niger	1	YES
116	Nigeria	0	NA
117	Norway	1	NO
118	Oman	1	YES
119	Pakistan	1	YES
120	Palau	0	NA
121	Panama	1	YES
122	Papua New Guinea	0	NA
123	Paraguay	1	ABST
124	Peru	1	NO
125	Philippines	1	NO
126	Poland	1	ABST
127	Portugal	1	ABST
128	Qatar	1	ABST
129	Republic of Korea	1	NO
130	Republic of Moldova	1	YES
131	Romania	1	ABST
132	Russian Federation	1	YES
133	Rwanda	0	NA
134	Saint Kitts and Nevis	1	NV

135	Saint Lucia	1	NO
136	Saint Vincent and the Grenadines	1	NV
137	Samoa	1	ABST
138	San Marino	0	NA
139	Sao Tome and Principe	1	ABST
140	Saudi Arabia	0	NA NA
141	Senegal	1	YES
142	Serbia	1	ABST
143	Seychelles	1	NV
144	Sierra Leone	1	NVP
145	Singapore	1	NO
146	Slovakia	1	ABST
147	Slovenia	1	ABST
148	Solomon Islands	0	NA NA
149	Somalia	1	NV
150	South Africa	1	NO
151	Spain	1	ABST
152	Sri Lanka	1	YES
153	Sudan	1	NVP
154	Suriname	1	NO
155	Swaziland	1	NO
156	Sweden	1	ABST
157	Switzerland	1	NO
158	Syrian Arab Republic	0	NA
159	Thailand	1	ABST
160	The former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia	0	NA
161	Togo	1	NO
162	Trinidad and Tobago	0	NA
163	Tunisia	1	YES
164	Turkey	1	NO
165	Uganda	1	NO
166	Ukraine	1	YES
167	United Arab Emirates	1	ABST
168	United Kingdom	1	ABST
169	United Republic of Tanzania	1	NO
170	United States of America	1	YES
171	Uruguay	1	YES
172	Uzbekistan	0	NA
173	Vanuatu	1	NO
174	Bolivarian Republic of Venezuela	1	NO
175	Viet Nam	1	YES
176	Yemen	1	YES
177	Zambia	1	NV
178	Zimbabwe	1	NO