

CONVENTION ON INTERNATIONAL TRADE IN ENDANGERED SPECIES
OF WILD FAUNA AND FLORA



Sixty-fifth meeting of the Standing Committee
Geneva (Switzerland), 7-11 July 2014

Interpretation and implementation of the Convention

Species trade and conservation

Elephants

NATIONAL IVORY ACTION PLANS

1. This document has been prepared by the Secretariat.
2. At its 63rd meeting (SC63, Bangkok, March 2013), the Standing Committee requested the Secretariat to use its best endeavours during the course of the 16th meeting of the Conference of the Parties (CoP16, Bangkok, 2013) to assist eight Parties¹ to which the Committee had directed recommendations on their implementation of CITES provisions regarding control of trade in ivory to develop national ivory action plans (NIAPs).
3. In accordance with this request, the Secretariat worked closely with representatives of all eight Parties within the margins of CoP16. At its 64th meeting (SC64, Bangkok, March 2013), the Standing Committee directed recommendations on the development and implementation of NIAPs to the eight Parties and the Secretariat as follows²:
 - a) *China, Kenya, Malaysia, Philippines, Thailand, Uganda, the United Republic of Tanzania and Viet Nam should finalize their national ivory action plans, with time frames and milestones, and submit them to the Secretariat by 15 May 2013.*
 - b) *The Secretariat will share the national ivory action plans received with the Standing Committee, and inform the Chair of the Standing Committee if any of the above Parties fails to submit its plan by the above deadline.*
 - c) *The eight Parties are requested to take urgent measures to implement their national ivory action plans between SC64 and SC65.*
 - d) *The eight Parties should keep the Secretariat updated via electronic means about progress made against timeframes and milestones.*
 - e) *The Secretariat shall monitor progress and will keep the Standing Committee informed intersessionally via electronic means. The Secretariat shall, upon request, advise the Parties concerned on the implementation of their respective plans. In the light of progress with the implementation, the Secretariat may undertake missions to one or more of the Parties mentioned in paragraph a), pending invitations from these Parties and the availability of external funding.*

¹ Kenya, Uganda and the United Republic of Tanzania were identified as source countries for illegal elephant ivory; Malaysia, the Philippines and Viet Nam as transit countries of such ivory; and China and Thailand as destination countries. In addition, Hong Kong, China, was considered an important transit place.

² <http://www.cites.org/sites/default/files/eng/com/sc/64/E-SC64-02.pdf>

- f) *The eight Parties are requested to submit reports on progress in the implementation of their national ivory action plans by the deadline for submission of documents at SC65.*
- g) *The Secretariat shall evaluate the reports submitted in compliance with the recommendation in paragraph f)³ above and convey its findings and recommendations at SC65.*
4. The eight Parties duly developed and submitted their NIAPs to the Secretariat in accordance with the recommendations adopted at SC64, demonstrating a strong commitment to take immediate and decisive action to combat the illegal trade in elephant ivory.
 5. In accordance with the provisions of recommendation b), the Secretariat shared the submitted NIAPs with the Standing Committee electronically.
 6. The Secretariat also shared the NIAPs among the eight Parties that prepared them, so that they could identify potential opportunities to collaborate on implementation through regional, subregional and international cooperation. At the same time, the Secretariat shared with all eight Parties a list of NIAP focal points that the Secretariat had compiled to facilitate this collaboration.
 7. To support the effective implementation of the NIAPs, the Secretariat sent letters to the eight Parties in May, June and October 2013, reminding them of the recommendations from SC64 and inviting them to submit reports to the Secretariat on progress made against timeframes and milestones to enable the Secretariat to monitor progress and keep the Standing Committee informed intersessionally in accordance with the provisions of recommendation e).
 8. At the same time, the Secretariat also provided comments on some of the NIAPs for Parties' consideration, including substantive matters that could be considered for inclusion within their NIAP and the structure and reporting framework of the plans themselves. A number of Parties were encouraged to indicate clearer milestones and timeframes within their NIAP. In response to the Secretariat's comments, Malaysia submitted a revised NIAP to the Secretariat in August 2013. Thailand was encouraged to continue to implement activities to improve ivory trade controls as detailed in document SC63 Doc.18, Annex 6, and to make them an integral part of its NIAP. The feedback that the Secretariat provided to each Party was shared with the Standing Committee.
 9. The eight Parties duly prepared and submitted reports to the Secretariat on progress with the implementation of their NIAP. These varied in their level of detail and the frequency with which they were submitted, in part reflecting the different milestones and timeframes that were established in the individual plans. The Secretariat appreciates the efforts undertaken by all the Parties concerned in providing reports on implementation in accordance with the provisions of recommendation f) and would like to take this opportunity to thank them for the progress reports. The Secretariat kept the Standing Committee informed intersessionally via electronic means, in accordance with recommendation e), and provided the Chair of the Standing Committee with progress reports that were received from Parties in August 2013 and December 2013, for sharing with Standing Committee members.
 10. In accordance with the provisions of recommendation g), the Secretariat has completed an evaluation of the reports on progress with the implementation of NIAPs. This evaluation is attached to the present document as Annex. It includes a summary of the activities implemented by Parties, as detailed by Parties in their progress reports. The Secretariat has evaluated the information provided by the Parties against any specified milestones, timeframes or targets in each NIAP, and assigned to each action a progress rating of 'substantially achieved', 'on track', 'challenging' or 'unclear'. The Secretariat would like to note that it is providing its evaluation to the Standing Committee at the same time that it is being shared with the Parties that submitted NIAPs, and that these Parties have not yet been given an opportunity to respond to the Secretariat's evaluation.
 11. The progress reports received from the eight Parties outline a wide range of measures and activities that have been delivered by Parties in support of the implementation of NIAPs. The Secretariat's evaluation indicates that, across the nine NIAPs (two separate NIAPs were provided by China: one for China and another for Hong Kong, China), over 65% of actions (or 80 of 121) have either been 'substantially achieved' or are 'on track' for achievement.

³ *Corrected by the Secretariat. Incorrectly referred to as e) in Document SC64 Doc.2.*

12. This assessment indicates that good progress has been made in the implementation of NIAPs, in support of efforts to combat elephant poaching and the illegal ivory trade. The on-ground outcomes that these enhanced efforts are supporting are also worth highlighting. For example, there was a clear increase in the number of large-scale ivory seizures made in Africa during 2013, which suggests that there has been an enhanced enforcement effort over the past 12 months. Findings from ETIS, as reported in Annex 1 to document SC65 Doc. 42.1 on Elephant conservation, illegal killing and ivory trade prepared for the present meeting, indicate that 80% of large-scale ivory seizures in Africa during 2013 were made in either Kenya, Uganda or the United Republic of Tanzania; the three African countries that were requested to take urgent measures to implement their NIAPs between SC64 and SC65.
13. Levels of elephant poaching remain alarmingly high. The MIKE data from 2012 and 2013 suggest that the aggregated upward poaching trends witnessed in Africa since the mid-2000s appear to be levelling off but at levels that are likely unsustainable and resulting in a continuing decline in African elephant numbers. Reports from MIKE and ETIS, as contained in Annex 1 to document SC65 Doc. 42.1, show that nearly two-thirds of dead elephants found in MIKE sites during 2013 are thought to have been illegally killed.
14. The Secretariat believes that the NIAPs have significantly enhanced efforts to combat elephant poaching and the illegal ivory trade, and that, in light of the ongoing high levels of poaching and illegal activity, it is critical that the eight Parties continue the implementation of their NIAPs between SC65 and SC66.

Recommendations

15. The Secretariat recommends that the Standing Committee:
 - a) note the Secretariat's evaluation of the progress reports submitted by China, Kenya, Malaysia, the Philippines, Thailand, Uganda, the United Republic of Tanzania and Viet Nam on the implementation of their NIAPs, as presented in the Annex;
 - b) encourage the eight Parties to review and, as necessary, revise their NIAPs, including the milestones and timeframes, based upon any new identified needs and these Parties' own evaluations of progress. In doing so, the eight Parties are further encouraged to take into consideration the evaluation of the Secretariat, in particular the actions where progress was rated as 'challenging' or 'unclear';
 - c) request the eight Parties to continue to implement their NIAPs between SC65 and SC66, in accordance with the milestones and timeframes in each NIAP, and including any revisions made to their NIAPs as referred to in recommendation b) above;
 - d) request the eight Parties to report on the further measures taken to implement their NIAPs to the Secretariat by 30 May 2015 and in the format used for the Secretariat's evaluation of the progress reports as presented in the Annex, so that the Secretariat can make the reports available to the Standing Committee and convey any recommendations it may have, as appropriate, at SC66; and
 - e) consider taking any further decisions, as appropriate, after noting the Secretariat's review of the progress reports submitted by the eight Parties on the implementation of their NIAPs and any responses provided thereto by these Parties at SC65.

National ivory action plans

EVALUATION OF PROGRESS REPORTS

The CITES Secretariat has evaluated the reports on progress in the implementation of national ivory action plans (NIAPs) that were submitted by Parties, in accordance with the provisions of recommendation g) on *National ivory action plans* adopted by the Standing Committee at its 64th meeting.

The Secretariat's evaluation of progress has been completed for every action included within an NIAP. Each of the nine plans (two separate NIAPs were provided by China: one for China and another for Hong Kong, China) includes targeted actions that Parties undertook to complete under different implementation categories (e.g. national enforcement, international collaboration, outreach).

The Secretariat's evaluation reviews the extent to which the actions put forward by Parties in their NIAPs have been delivered, as advised by each Party in their progress reports. In this manner, the assessment of progress is based on whether or not a Party implemented the activities that it committed to do, rather than evaluating the appropriateness or scope of the actions themselves, which was not requested by the Standing Committee's recommendations.

The information provided in progress reports and any other reporting shared with the Secretariat was reviewed and an evaluation of progress towards each action made based on i) observed or perceived progress towards any specified milestones, timeframes or targets for that particular action, and ii) observed or perceived progress towards the intent of the action itself. There were three instances where a plan did not list any specific actions under an implementation category. In these cases, the range of activities completed was assessed against the intent of the broader implementation category and any related milestones, timeframes or targets established for the category.

On the basis of this evaluation, each action was then assigned one of the following progress ratings:

1. *Substantially achieved* – there has been excellent progress with implementation and specified milestones and timeframes have been achieved or substantially achieved;
2. *On track* – there has been good progress with implementation and specified milestones and timeframes appear to be on track or largely on track for achievement;
3. *Challenging* – there has been limited progress with implementation or progress has been impeded by delays or challenges, and achievement of the specified milestones and timeframes appears unlikely unless these issues are resolved;
4. *Unclear* – insufficient information was available to conduct an evaluation of progress or actions and milestones were not specified in a way that allowed for an evaluation of progress to be completed.

A guide to how information is presented in this document is provided in Figure 1. Alongside summarizing the progress ratings, this document provides the detail that underpins the assessments. It includes a summary of the progress made against each action as detailed by Parties in their progress reports, along with the Secretariat's comments on progress that have informed the allocated progress ratings. A synthesis of the Secretariat's findings for each plan is also provided. Parties may wish to supplement this information at the present meeting.

Finally, it is worth noting that the Secretariat's evaluation only compares each plan against itself. While the evaluation has been completed in a consistent fashion this does not mean that the individual assessments are necessarily directly comparable. The level of ambition and the scope of action varies considerably among the nine plans. Thus, an ambitious action listed in one plan where progress is rated as 'on track' could have delivered more activity than a less ambitious action from a different plan that was reported as 'substantially achieved'. The frequency and amount of reporting that was provided to the Secretariat has also influenced the evaluation exercise. For this reason, the assessments of individual plans should not be directly compared.

CHINA

Findings

There are 11 actions in China's NIAP. In the Secretariat's evaluation, seven actions were rated as 'substantially achieved', two 'on track' for achievement and two were rated as 'unclear'.

The positive evaluation reflects the efforts and commitment demonstrated by China in the delivery of its NIAP. In particular, the substantial progress made with the implementation of actions under the category of international enforcement collaboration is acknowledged. China took a leadership role in the development and implementation of Operation COBRA II and continues to display close collaboration with the Lusaka Agreement Task Force (LATF) and others to share information in support of follow-up investigations. There has also been a range of activity to strengthen collaboration with range and transit States and to provide enforcement assistance to range States in Africa, and these actions are all 'substantially achieved'.

Many other actions are rated as either 'substantially achieved' or 'on track' for achievement based on the reported progress. For some actions the evaluation of the progress made would have benefited from clearer milestones and more specific timeframes. As timeframes in the plan have been allocated against groups of activities rather than individual steps it was at times difficult to fully evaluate progress.

The progress ratings are summarized in Table 1 with the detailed evaluation shown in Table 2.

Information used for the evaluation

The Secretariat received two progress reports from China covering the periods June to November 2013 and June to April 2014, and these were used as the basis of this evaluation.

TABLE 1: Summary evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – CHINA

CATEGORY	PROGRESS RATING			
	Substantially achieved	On track	Challenging	Unclear
1. Legislation and regulations				1.1 Ivory card system ?
2. National-level enforcement action and collaboration	2.2 Use of specialized investigation techniques 2.3 Investigative actions large-scale seizures	2.1 Violations of ivory card system		2.4 Analyze ivory trade database ?
3. International enforcement collaboration	3.1 International enforcement operation 3.2 Collaboration with range and transit States 3.3 Enforcement assistance to Africa			
4. Outreach, public awareness and education	4.1 Raise awareness of illegal ivory trade 4.3 Publicize penalties for offences	4.2 Promote card system for legal trade		

TABLE 2: Detailed evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – CHINA

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>Secretariat comments</i>)
CATEGORY 1: Legislation and regulations		
1.1 Perfect the ivory certification card system	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The implementation of this action is based upon prohibiting the sale of ivory without a certificate card, revoking the qualification of ivory retailers as required, handing over to the forest police for investigations and reporting to the CITES Secretariat about violations. • Reporting indicates that the system of designated ivory processor, designated ivory retailer and selling ivory without a certificate has been implemented. Reporting notes that this implementation has resulted in four designated ivory processors and 27 designated ivory retailers having their qualifications revoked. • <i>The measures listed under this action relate to the enhanced implementation of the existing certification system. The fact that qualifications have been revoked indicates that further action is being taken. It is difficult to assign a progress rating without more detailed information on the specific activities that have been conducted or the particular milestones that have been set.</i>
CATEGORY 2: National-level enforcement actions, investigations and national inter-agency coordination		
2.1 Targeted law enforcement actions with a particular focus on violations of the certification card system for selling ivory within China	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The State Forestry Administration held two national teleconferences on wildlife enforcement and asked wildlife authorities to conduct at least three inspection activities each year. • The State Forestry Administration organized 12 missions to inspect arts, tourism and antique markets as well as designated ivory processors and retailers. These were still underway at the time of last reporting. • The Forest Police Bureau organized national operations in May and August 2013. Since the beginning of 2013, the Chinese Forest Police have had 60 ivory-related cases and confiscated 1,073 kg of ivory. • <i>The progress made with law enforcement operations in accordance with milestones is noted. Further information on the inspections of arts and crafts markets and designated ivory manufacturers and retailers that took place would be valuable.</i>
2.2 Use specialized investigative techniques, particularly sniffer dogs and related technologies at major airports, container ports	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Sniffer dogs were successfully used to detect illegal ivory at Ruili Border Check Point and Guangzhou Baiyun International Airport, and X-ray devices and container scanners were used at airports, ports and border crossings. • Reporting notes that risk assessment techniques were widely used by Chinese Customs officials to identify suspect shipments and that inspections by Customs were enhanced. • <i>The progress that has been made in accordance with milestones is positively noted. China's success at risk profiling and using controlled delivery techniques is also noted. The number of seizures that are made each month provides further evidence of the effectiveness of delivered activities.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>Secretariat comments</i>)
2.3 Investigative actions focusing on those involved in large-scale seizures including through international collaborations on such things as controlled deliveries and forensic work including sampling and DNA analysis	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Information sharing between Customs of Mainland China, Malaysia and Hong Kong SAR was reported on, as well as the detailed information sharing among countries that took place during Operation COBRA II. China also reported on the submission of information on its ivory seizures to TRAFFIC for inclusion in the ETIS database. • DNA samples were collected from some seized ivory and submitted to a German laboratory for analysis. The collection of samples from further seizures was underway at the time of last reporting. • <i>Based on the provided reporting clear progress has been made. The international collaborations reported against other actions are also noted, as is China's success with the use of controlled delivery techniques.</i>
2.4 Analyze the ivory trade database that is used to monitor the legal trade in ivory, and follow up on any anomalies	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Both implementation reports note that the ivory trade database is being analyzed and that further steps will be taken to perfect it if necessary. • The State Forestry Administration authorized designated ivory processors to use 4498 kg of raw ivory in 2013. • <i>The action is in progress. This action is difficult to evaluate as the steps required to perfect the database system have not been detailed. It is not clear if any anomalies were found or how they were followed up on.</i>
CATEGORY 3: International enforcement collaboration		
3.1 Envisage a regionally or internationally coordinated enforcement action that focuses on the illegal trade in ivory in China, Asia and Africa	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • China took a leadership role in Operation COBRA II, participated in the operation, assisted the Lusaka Agreement Task Force (LATF) in organizing and executing the operation, and also participated in training associated with Operation COBRA II. Reporting notes that China has maintained close links with members of the International Coordination Team of Operation COBRA II to share information and support follow-up investigations. • An MoU between China's National Inter-agency CITES Enforcement Coordination Group (NICECG) and the LATF is under development to support bilateral cooperation in CITES enforcement. • An international meeting on combating transnational wildlife crime was held in 2013 in Kunming, Yunnan. • Two three-week training seminars for African and Asian wildlife officers will be held in Hangzhou in late 2014, with an anticipated attendance of 50 officers. • <i>Specified milestones have been achieved and additional activity beyond the milestones has been completed, which is commendable. The leadership role that China took in Operation COBRA II is also acknowledged.</i>
3.2 Collaborate with range and transit States	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • China participated in many international and regional meetings including the ASEAN-WEN Annual Meeting, the SINO-NEPAL Bilateral Meeting, the CITES Rhino Enforcement Task Force, the Gaborone African Elephant Summit, and London and EU conferences on wildlife trafficking. • Further collaborative measures underway include the preparation of the 3rd dialogue on combating wildlife crime under the China-US Strategic and Economic Dialogue and the development of an MoU between China and Viet Nam. • Intelligence sharing and collaboration supported a seizure by Hong Kong Customs and the arrest of 23 Chinese suspects connected with a syndicate operating across China and Kenya. • <i>Numerous activities have been completed that support collaboration in accordance with specified milestones.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>Secretariat comments</i>)
3.3 Assist African countries with law enforcement actions	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A Chinese CITES officer was seconded to ASEAN-WEN for three months at the beginning of 2013 and a further two officers (a CITES officer and a Customs officer) were seconded to LATF from December 2013 to February 2014. • Anti-poaching equipment has been provided to some Central, East and South African countries and discussions are underway regarding China sponsoring wildlife conservation in some range States. • A delegation from Kenya, Tanzania, Uganda and LATF visited China on 19-25 April 2014 to exchange intelligence and explore potential collaborative strategies to combat wildlife smuggling among China and Eastern African countries. • Capacity building in Africa will also be supported through the participation of African wildlife enforcement officers in the training detailed against Action 3.1. • <i>A diversity of measures have been detailed and reported against in accordance with specified milestones.</i>
CATEGORY 4: Outreach, public awareness and education		
4.1 Collaborate in raising awareness of the link between buying illegal ivory and illegal killing of elephants in Africa	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Since July 2013, a cell phone message is sent to all Chinese nationals arriving at foreign countries reminding them not to illegally purchase, transport or use endangered species and their products including ivory. • Chinese Customs and the CITES Management Authority organized an online discussion where the public could ask questions on the control of ivory trade. This was supported by other public awareness-raising activities such as national campaigns organized by government agencies in partnership with NGOs, a "Truth Behind Illegal Ivory Trade" program broadcast on national television, World Wildlife Day celebrations and posters on CITES provided with TRAFFIC on display at tourism, antique, arts and crafts markets and shops. • An ivory crush that destroyed over 6 tonnes of confiscated ivory in Donguan, Guangdong, on 6 January 2014, drew international and national media attention. • The CITES Management Authority, Chinese Embassy in Kenya, LATF and TRAFFIC held a seminar on wildlife conservation in Nairobi, Kenya, on 17 January 2014. Seventy representatives from Chinese companies and overseas Chinese associations attended. • <i>A broad range of activities have been completed to raise awareness.</i>
4.2 Promote card system for legal ivory trade	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tens of thousands of posters on the card system have been produced and are displayed in markets and outlets throughout China and information on the system is also available on the internet. • Designated ivory retailers are asked to display their ivory certificate and share education materials with customers. • <i>The efforts taken to promote the card system are positive. Further assessment of the effectiveness of these measures, and the level of awareness of the card system, would be valuable.</i>
4.3 Publicize the penalties for violators	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All significant ivory seizures and the penalties handed down to criminals engaged in illicit trade in ivory have been publicized on the internet and on mass media. Strong deterrent penalties, including potential life imprisonment, have been repeatedly emphasized by enforcement agencies in various fora and media opportunities. • <i>The action has progressed in accordance with the established milestones.</i>

HONG KONG, CHINA

Findings

There are six actions (including one action that has been specified for the purposes of the evaluation) in the Hong Kong, China, NIAP. In the Secretariat's assessment, three actions were rated as 'substantially achieved', one as 'on track' for achievement and two were rated as 'unclear'.

The enforcement actions of Hong Kong, China, are particularly commendable. The three actions related to import control, intelligence exchange and international collaboration have all been rated as 'substantially achieved'. Hong Kong, China, participated in Operation COBRA II and has displayed exemplary information sharing with other Parties to support follow-up investigations.

Progress was unclear for actions related to the domestic regulation of ivory trade as the provided reporting was generic in nature.

The Secretariat is also aware of other activities completed by Hong Kong, China, that were related to the implementation of their NIAP but not included in reporting to the Secretariat. In particular the Secretariat notes the recent commencement of the incineration of the 28 tonne stockpile of seized ivory in Hong Kong. In support of follow-up investigations, Hong Kong, China, also collaborated with South Africa to return a large number of ivory and rhinoceros horn specimens to that country.

The progress ratings are summarized in Table 3 with the detailed evaluation shown in Table 4.

Information used for the evaluation

The Secretariat received a progress report on implementation from Hong Kong, China, covering the period April to October 2013. Hong Kong, China, also shared additional information on specific issues related to their NIAP with the Secretariat. Both the progress report and the issues-based reporting were used as the basis of the evaluation.

TABLE 3: Summary evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – HONG KONG, CHINA

CATEGORY	PROGRESS RATING			
	Substantially achieved	On track	Challenging	Unclear
1. Regulation of trade				<div style="background-color: #d9d9e3; padding: 2px; border: 1px solid #ccc;">1.1 Legislation and licensing control ?</div> <div style="background-color: #d9d9e3; padding: 2px; border: 1px solid #ccc;">1.2 Compliance monitoring ?</div>
2. Enforcement	<div style="background-color: #92d050; padding: 2px; border: 1px solid #ccc;">2.1 Import control</div> <div style="background-color: #92d050; padding: 2px; border: 1px solid #ccc;">2.2 Intelligence exchange</div> <div style="background-color: #92d050; padding: 2px; border: 1px solid #ccc;">2.3 International collaboration</div>			
3. Publicity and education		<div style="background-color: #d9ead3; padding: 2px; border: 1px solid #ccc;">(No specified actions)¹</div>		

¹ No actions were specified and thus the assessment of progress has been based on the description of the overall category provided in the plan.

TABLE 4: Detailed evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – HONG KONG, CHINA

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and comments)
CATEGORY 1: Regulation of trade		
1.1 Legislation and licensing control	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No reporting was provided against this action. • <i>The specified target was to maintain existing licensing controls. On the basis of the information provided progress is unclear.</i>
1.2 Compliance monitoring	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No reporting was provided against this action. • <i>The specified target was to conduct a series of inspections of premises licensed to trade ivory as well as risk-based assessments of art and craft and antique shops that may be selling ivory. On the basis of the information provided progress is unclear.</i>
CATEGORY 2: Enforcement		
2.1 Import control	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hong Kong SAR authorities from the CITES Management Authority and Customs jointly participated in Operation COBRA II. • <i>The completed activity meets the specified target requiring the CITES Management Authority and Hong Kong Customs to conduct a joint operation in the first quarter of 2014, or to join an international operation coordinated by the WCO.</i>
2.2 Intelligence exchange	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hong Kong SAR authorities used WCO communication platforms during Operation COBRA II. • Intelligence exchange is also supported by the comprehensive reporting on seizures and INTERPOL-based reporting shown under Action 2.3. • <i>The information sharing exhibited by Hong Kong, China, is positively noted. This action relates to increased sharing of information between the CITES Management Authority and Hong Kong Customs, and between Hong Kong Customs and members of the WCO and other national Customs administrations, including through the use of communication platforms hosted by the WCO. The Secretariat notes that good collaboration and information sharing that has been exhibited between the CITES Management Authority and Hong Kong Customs.</i>
2.3 International collaboration	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Information on three significant ivory seizures by Hong Kong Customs were communicated to implicated countries and shared via the INTERPOL Ecomessage system. • DNA samples were obtained from the Togo seizure and provided to a forensic laboratory for analysis. • <i>Hong Kong, China, has completed a range of activity to support international collaboration and information sharing. The Secretariat notes the comprehensive nature of the reporting that Hong Kong, China, shared with other Parties.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
CATEGORY 3: <i>Publicity and education</i>		
No specified actions	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The ivory seizures mentioned in Action 2.3 were all publicized through press releases. • A partnership has been established with the tourist industry. Training programmes on the control of ivory under CITES targeted to inbound and outbound tourist guides are under development. • <i>The reported activity shows clear progress towards the specified milestone. Some activities were not reported on in detail.</i>

KENYA

Findings

There are 14 actions in Kenya's NIAP. In the Secretariat's assessment, six actions were rated as 'substantially achieved', five 'on track' for achievement, one 'challenging' and two were rated as 'unclear'.

Kenya prepared a comprehensive and commendable NIAP with a broad range of actions and milestones to deliver, often within ambitious timeframes. Accordingly, the received progress reports show that there are many good initiatives underway in support of Kenya's NIAP. In particular the Secretariat would like to highlight the revision of the national legislative framework for wildlife and the new *Wildlife Conservation and Management Act 2013* that came into force on 10 January 2014. This legislative enhancement is supported by increased enforcement capacity, such as through the establishment of an Elite Anti-Poaching Unit in August 2013, that has since been deployed in poaching hot spots and at border points, and the recruitment of an additional 575 rangers to enhance investigation capacity and anti-poaching operations. The range of national and international campaigns that have been delivered to raise awareness of elephant poaching and illegal ivory trade and achieve a reduction in global demand for illegal ivory products, is also worthy of acknowledgement.

The Secretariat is also aware of other activities completed by Kenya related to the implementation of their NIAP but not included in progress reports. In particular the Secretariat would like to note the collaborative activities that Kenya has conducted in cooperation with China, which included among other things an event hosted at China's Embassy in Nairobi in January 2014 to raise the awareness of Chinese nationals based in Africa. Kenya also worked in close cooperation with China to target an ivory smuggling syndicate operating between the two countries. This collaboration resulted in the arrest of two suspects of Chinese nationality in Kenya, followed by their extradition to China in early 2014.

The progress ratings are summarized in Table 5 with the detailed evaluation shown in Table 6.

Information used for the evaluation

The Secretariat received progress reports from Kenya for the periods March to June 2013, July to September 2013, October to December 2013 and January to April 2014. These four reports were used as the basis of this evaluation.

The Secretariat would like to acknowledge the comprehensive and detailed nature of both Kenya's NIAP and its submitted progress reports, which assisted the evaluation process.

TABLE 5: Summary evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – KENYA

CATEGORY	PROGRESS RATING			
	Substantially achieved	On track	Challenging	Unclear
1. Legislation and regulations	<p>1.1 Monitoring illegal trade</p> <p>1.2 Review and gazettal of legislation</p>	<p>1.3 Reduce period for prosecution of crime</p>		
2. National-level enforcement action and inter-agency collaboration	<p>2.2 Local interagency collaboration</p> <p>2.3 Equip law enforcement agencies</p>	<p>2.1 Stockpile registration and marking</p> <p>2.4 Wildlife crime reporting system</p>		
3. International and regional enforcement collaboration		<p>3.3 International investigative collaboration</p>	<p>3.1 Strengthen regional policy collaboration</p>	<p>3.2 Cross-border collaboration ?</p>
4. Outreach, public awareness and education	<p>4.2 International demand reduction campaigns</p>	<p>4.1 Strengthen local enforcement capacity</p>		<p>4.3 Sensitize airlines and couriers ?</p>
5. Reporting	<p>5.1 Reporting to SC</p>			

TABLE 6: Detailed evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – KENYA

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and comments)
CATEGORY 1: Legislation and regulations		
1.1 Monitoring illegal trade in ivory	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • There has been progress with the review of operating procedures for the management of seized/confiscated ivory, such as the revision of the Specimen Charges Booklet for law enforcement officers in light of the new <i>Wildlife Conservation and Management Act 2013</i>. • A 4-day training workshop for prosecutors and members of the judiciary was held to sensitize them to the revised Specimen Charges Booklet and Standard Operating Procedures on the management of illegally-trafficked wildlife. • <i>The reported revision and associated training shows progress in accordance with milestones. The seizures that Kenya has made since CoP16 are also relevant to this action and show further good progress towards its implementation.</i>
1.2 Review and gazettal of legislation to enhance wildlife crime prosecution	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A national inter-agency working group was established to complete a strategic analysis of wildlife crimes in Kenya. Opportunities to use other laws to enhance penalties for serious wildlife crime were identified. • The wildlife regulatory framework was reformed with a new law, the <i>Wildlife Conservation and Management Act 2013</i>, enacted on 10 January 2014. This law significantly increases penalties for wildlife crime, with a fine of not less than Ksh. 20 Million (USD 235,000) and/or live imprisonment for trafficking elephant ivory or rhinoceros horn. • <i>Substantial progress has been made with legislative reform in accordance with milestones.</i>
1.3 Reduce period for prosecution of wildlife crime	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A February 2013 directive from the National Economic and Social Council requires that cases of wildlife crime are forwarded to the Director of Public Prosecution within 48 hours. The plan aims to reduce this to 24 hours for major wildlife seizures and arrests. • The process of training and gazetting 20 wildlife crime prosecutors was underway but not yet completed at the time of evaluation. • A milestone to deploy wildlife investigation units to wildlife crime hotspots was achieved ahead of time. • <i>Multiple activities are underway that will support progress towards the 24-hour target.</i>
CATEGORY 2: National-level enforcement actions, investigation and national inter-agency collaboration and coordination		
2.1 All stockpile ivory registered and marked	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Two phases of DNA sampling were conducted on ivory that was seized at Mombasa Port from 2011 to 2013. • A national ivory inventory was initiated in August 2013 using an electronic data system. The inventory was still underway at the time of last reporting. • Modernization of the National Wildlife Forensic Laboratory is underway. • <i>Many milestones have been achieved. An ambitious range of milestones were included in the plan and further information on some of them would be valuable.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
2.2 Strengthen at local levels interagency collaborations on matters of wildlife enforcement	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Multiple multi-agency meetings and joint enforcement operations were reported on. Inter-agency coordination was also supported by the Rapid Results Initiative established by the Office of the President in November 2013 to increase collaboration in anti-poaching activities among security agencies. This Initiative coordinates enforcement agencies with the Wildlife Authority taking the lead. An Elite Interagency Anti-Poaching Unit comprising officers from Kenya Administration Police, General Service Unit of the Kenya Police Service and Kenya Wildlife Service was established in August 2013 and members trained in anti-poaching operations. The team has been deployed in poaching hotspots and at border points. <i>A substantial array of activity took place to support interagency collaboration, including those activities specified within the plan and the additional reported activity.</i>
2.3 Strengthen and equip law enforcement agencies to detect and report wildlife crime	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The profiling of container traffic at airports and ports was achieved ahead of time and continued across reporting periods, with a number of seizures resulting from the activity. An additional 575 rangers were recruited to enhance investigation capacity and anti-poaching operations. Training of the new rangers was underway at the time of last reporting. A fleet of customized vehicles were procured in April 2014 and the use of digital radio technology adopted to modernize the wildlife security force. <i>Significant progress was reported, with some milestones achieved ahead of time and additional activity reported.</i>
2.4 Establish wildlife crime reporting system for rapid response and coordination	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The establishment of a hotline at Kenya Wildlife Service to enable the public to report wildlife crimes commenced through senior management discussions in May 2013. Networks of informers were established to help direct enforcement efforts. These networks have helped provide intelligence to profile containers at Mombasa Port, which resulted in a seizure of Malagasy rosewood in May 2014. <i>The establishment of networks of informers and the resulting seizure is positively noted. Further information on progress with the establishment of the hotline for public reporting of wildlife crimes would be valuable.</i>
CATEGORY 3: International and regional wildlife enforcement collaboration		
3.1 Strengthen at regional level collaborations of policy makers	CHALLENGING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regional meetings to build collaboration included a delegation participating in an East African Community Meeting in Burundi on 3-5 July 2013, a meeting with the LATF on 24 June 2013 to plan for an investigation in Singapore, and meetings between the Wildlife Authority and the LATF Secretariat. A meeting of Ministers under the auspices of the LATF was due to take place in December 2013. <i>The specified milestones relate to high-level policy makers such as Directors and Ministers. While the ongoing collaboration with the LATF is positively noted, there has been limited reporting against activities held at such a high-level. There was a delay in the planned Ministerial meeting and it is not known whether the meeting and subsequent milestones (e.g. plan of action) have been completed. It is noted that Kenya participated in the African Elephant Summit in Botswana in December 2013.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
3.2 Enhance Kenya-Tanzania wildlife officers' cross-border consultative meetings and Kenya-Uganda cross-border ecosystem management initiative	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cross-border measures for Kenya-Tanzania included a cross-border security meeting to control illegal trafficking of ivory and joint elephant censuses for the Amboseli-Kilimanjaro, Tsavo-Mkomazi and Serengeti-Masai Mara ecosystems. • No cross-border measures completed for Kenya-Uganda were reported on. • <i>The specified milestone is 'implement synchronized cross-border strategic operations' for both Kenya-Tanzania and Kenya-Uganda. On the basis of the information provided progress is unclear.</i>
3.3 International collaboration in investigation to identify the actors and <i>modus operandi</i> both at local and national level for illegal trade in large confiscated and seized shipments of ivory	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Examples of collaborating and sharing information with other countries were reported on, including seizure data and intelligence shared with Malaysia, Hong Kong, Singapore, Indonesia, and Malaysia, collaboration with Philippines Customs officials and the Philippines CITES Management Authority, and the DNA sampling of ivory repatriated to Kenya from the Philippines conducted by both CITES Management Authorities. • Collaboration with the Philippines and Singapore has helped progress the profiling of national and international criminals involved in the trafficking of wildlife. • <i>Significant progress has occurred including collaboration not mentioned in reporting such as Kenya's participation in Operation COBRA II and cooperation with China which resulted in an extradition. An ambitious range of milestones were included in the plan and for some of them additional information would be valuable.</i>
CATEGORY 4: Outreach, public awareness and education		
4.1 Strengthen the capacity of relevant local enforcement community	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interagency awareness and sensitization meetings and workshops were held including meetings with the Kenyan Ambassador to the UN Office in Nairobi, an African Diplomatic Corp sensitization meeting on 15-16 August 2013, and a stakeholder forum at Mombasa Port on 29 August 2013. • Anti-poaching campaigns for local audiences were also developed and delivered. The success of these sensitization measures was reported on through a prior serial poacher turning himself in to authorities in December 2013. • <i>The reported activity is positive and the contribution of capacity-building activities reported against Actions 2.2 and 2.3 is also noted. Further information on some milestones, such as undertaking joint operations, would be valuable.</i>
4.2 Expand international campaigns targeting ivory demand reduction	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • National and international campaigns were delivered, including "Ivory Belongs to Elephants" and "Hands Off Ivory" led by the First Lady and involving renowned wildlife conservationists, and a campaign targeting Chinese citizens using Chinese celebrities Yao Ming and Li Bing. • The most recent campaign was a Jim Nyamu Elephant Walk in April 2014 from Shimla Falls National Reserve to Lamu. • Celebrations for World Wildlife Day on 3 March 2014 were also conducted. • <i>The specified milestone was to undertake at least one campaign focusing on demand reduction using internationally-recognized persons and this was exceeded.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
4.3 Sensitize all international airlines and couriers on consequences of handling contraband wildlife products	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A new partnership with Kenya Airways was developed in September 2013 to support anti-poaching campaigns and to support efforts to raise the awareness of courier service companies of wildlife trade and illicit trafficking. • <i>The positive collaboration with Kenya Airways is noted. It is not known how specified milestones to carry out a joint inspection of shipments of major courier companies or training for courier staff have been progressed.</i>
CATEGORY 5: National reporting		
5.1 Reporting to Standing Committee on implementation of Actions requested	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Implementation reports for all quarters were received by the Secretariat in accordance with specified timeframes. Kenya provided the Secretariat with detailed and comprehensive progress reports, which greatly assisted the Secretariat with its evaluation and are highly appreciated.</i>

MALAYSIA

Findings

There are 12 actions in Malaysia's NIAP. In the Secretariat's assessment, six actions were rated as 'substantially achieved', three 'on track' for achievement and three were rated as 'unclear'.

The assessment indicates that particular progress has been made with actions related to national-level enforcement, legislative review, international demand reduction campaigns and managing the confiscated ivory stockpile. Many capacity-building activities have been successfully completed, with milestones related to training workshops to build skills in investigation techniques, identification skills, and wildlife-related legislation all met or exceeded. National enforcement capacity has also been significantly enhanced through the appointment of over 40 new enforcement and prosecution staff and the revision of the terms of reference for CITES officers in all Customs administrations to clarify roles and responsibilities.

Progress with a couple of actions was unclear on the basis of the information provided.

The progress ratings are summarized in Table 7 with the detailed evaluation shown in Table 8.

Information used for the evaluation

The Secretariat provided feedback to Malaysia on its NIAP in June 2013 and Malaysia submitted a revised plan to the Secretariat in August 2013. The Secretariat appreciates that its comments were considered and notes that the clear actions and milestones included in the revised plan have assisted the evaluation process.

Malaysia's revised national ivory action plan, the status updates contained within the revised plan, and a progress report dated 15 November 2013 that was received by the Secretariat were used as the basis of this evaluation.

TABLE 7: Summary evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – MALAYSIA

CATEGORY	PROGRESS RATING			
	Substantially achieved	On track	Challenging	Unclear
1. Legislation and regulation	1.1 Capacity building for ID and other techniques			
2. National-level enforcement action, investigation and inter-agency coordination	2.1 Enforcement activity at entry and exit points 2.2 Local interagency collaboration			
3. International enforcement collaboration		3.1 Regional collaboration 3.2 International collaboration		
4. Outreach, public awareness and education	4.2 International demand reduction campaigns			4.1 Public awareness-raising activities ?
5. Additional priority activities	5.2 Wildlife enforcement capacity building 5.4 Stockpile management	5.5 ID expertise at border crossing points		5.1 Forensic technology ? 5.3 Additional investigation tools ?

TABLE 8: Detailed evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – MALAYSIA

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and comments)
CATEGORY 1: Legislation and regulation		
1.1 Capacity building for enforcement officers on species identification, investigation technique, prosecution and other related skills (tagging, marking, inventory)	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Seven capacity-building seminars or workshops covering a range of enforcement-related matters were conducted by national enforcement organizations, including workshops on wildlife and forestry related laws, and workshops on CITES enforcement activities, exhibit management and ivory workshops for Customs and Royal Malaysian Customs Department (RMCD) staff. <i>Based on the activity reported, the specified milestone to hold three capacity-building seminars has been exceeded.</i>
CATEGORY 2: National-level enforcement: Action, investigation and national inter-agency coordination		
2.1 Strengthened inter-agency enforcement activity at the entry points, airport and port. Includes Royal Custom, Royal Police, Malaysia Maritime Enforcement Agency and Department of Wildlife and National Parks (DWNP)	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Enforcement activity at entry and exit points includes 61 Department of Wildlife and National Parks (DWNP) enforcement officers placed at 14 designated entry/exit points, RMCD officers located at all legal landing places and five anti-smuggling unit checkpoints at designated trans-border locations. Five random operations were conducted at Kuala Lumpur International Airport, and three random operations were conducted at both Customs and Immigration Quarantine Complex (CIQ) Gelang Patah, Johor, and Senair International Airport, Johor. Forty-three new enforcement and prosecution officer posts at DWNP were filled, and the terms of reference of RMCD CITES Officers in all 16 Customs administrations in 12 States and four Federal territories were updated to clarify job responsibilities relating to CITES enforcement. An annual coordination meeting of the Management, Scientific and Enforcement Authorities of the Act 686 was held on 3-4 October 2013. <i>A significant number of activities were delivered and specified milestones achieved or exceeded.</i>
CATEGORY 3: International enforcement collaboration		
3.1 Regional collaboration (Asian and ASEAN)	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regional collaboration was supported by Malaysia attending the ASEAN Wildlife Enforcement Network meeting in Chiang Mai, Thailand, in July 2013, and the development of a wildlife training module for Customs officers in ASEAN member states with TRAFFIC South-East Asia's assistance. Four ivory surveillance operations, resulting in three seizures, had been conducted by RMCD at the time of last reporting. Daily joint operations (random inspections) conducted in Padang Besar were also noted. It is not clear whether these were joint cross-border enforcement operations in accordance with the specified milestone. <i>Reporting indicates that some specified targets on regional collaboration, such as the number of operations to be held in a year, were exceeded, yet for others progress is less clear.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
3.2 International / inter-regional	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participation in international seminars and workshops included attendance at the Asian Development Bank-CITES Symposium on Combating Wildlife Crime held during CoP16 in Bangkok, Thailand, and involvement in pre-operational training and planning meetings for Operation COBRA II, and participation within the operation itself. • International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICWC) workshops and training events, such as a DNA experts workshop, were also attended to build international collaboration. • <i>The positive collaboration in international meetings is noted. Further information on collaboration with the Regional Intelligence Liaison Offices of the WCO would be valuable.</i>
CATEGORY 4: Outreach, public awareness and education		
4.1 Placement of publication and public service announcement to increase public awareness on international wildlife trade	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Publication of brochures, buntings and/or video (detail not provided) took place at Kuala Lumpur International Airport and the Low Cost Carrier Terminal in Kuala Lumpur. • <i>It is apparent that some activity under this action has been completed. Reporting is very generic and the detail of the activity is not known.</i>
CATEGORY 5: Additional priority activities		
5.1 Enhancing the utilization of forensic technology	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Wildlife DNA Forensic Unit is due to be upgraded by September 2014. • <i>Malaysia's participation in an ICCWC international experts meeting on DNA analysis for ivory as reported under Action 3.2 is noted. It is not known what progress has been made towards the interim milestones against this action, including the procurement of new equipment and appointment of a new staff post at the Wildlife DNA Forensic Unit.</i>
5.2 Wildlife enforcement capacity building	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Two investigation courses were conducted by DWNP to improve investigation techniques and prosecution processes, the first involving 20 participants on 29 August 2013 and the second involving 10 participants on 22 October 2013. • <i>The specified milestone of holding two courses was achieved, and the additional capacity-building courses to build investigation skills reported under Action 1.1 are also noted.</i>
5.3 Investigation	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reporting notes that anti-money laundering will be included as an additional investigation tool and that the use of controlled deliveries as a tool to fight wildlife crime will be reviewed. • <i>It is not clear what activities have taken place and whether milestones have been achieved.</i>
5.4 Seized/confiscated ivory stockpile	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All seized ivory has been marked and tagged and information on the level of stock was provided to the CITES Secretariat in accordance with Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP16). • As of November 2013, 253 ivory samples had been collected for DNA analysis. • <i>The progress against this action and the achievement of specified milestones is noted.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
5.5 Identification and verification expert in border crossing points	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Capacity building in the identification of endangered species included training 70 RMCD officers in the identification of ivory in September 2013 in collaboration with TRAFFIC, and 11 RMCD officers in the identification of endangered species in November 2013. • Twenty-eight DWNP officers were to be designated as identification experts by December 2013, but the completion of this activity had not yet been confirmed at the time of last reporting. • <i>The positive capacity-building efforts are noted. An update on delivered activities would be valuable.</i>

PHILIPPINES

Findings

There are eight actions in the Philippines NIAP. In the Secretariat's assessment, two actions were rated as 'substantially achieved', one 'on track' for achievement, four 'challenging', and one was rated as 'unclear'.

In particular, national-level enforcement actions have progressed well. The establishment of the cross-agency Philippines Operations Group on Ivory (POGI) comprising representatives from Police, Customs, the Department of Environment and Natural Resources, and the Office of the President of Philippines, is of particular significance. The allocation of an operational budget to POGI is also acknowledged. Progress has also been made with managing confiscated ivory and taking samples for DNA analysis.

While noting the enhanced national efforts to combat illegal ivory trade, some challenges remain. Four of the actions listed in the NIAP – related to policy development, capacity building and public awareness – were at the time of last reporting reliant upon the submission and approval of a funding proposal to the Asian Development Bank. This appears to have led to implementation delays and the uncertainty over funding means that the achievement of milestones could be challenging. The Secretariat notes that it was intended that NIAPs would list activities that could be delivered with nationally available funds and were not meant to be reliant upon additional external resources.

The progress ratings are summarized in Table 9 with the detailed evaluation shown in Table 10.

Information used for the evaluation

The Secretariat received a progress report from the Philippines covering implementation over the period June to October 2013, and this was used as the basis of the evaluation.

TABLE 9: Summary evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – PHILIPPINES

CATEGORY	PROGRESS RATING			
	Substantially achieved	On track	Challenging	Unclear
1. Legislation and regulations			1.1 Registration of ivory and ivory products	
2. National-level enforcement actions, investigation and inter-agency coordination	2.1 Philippine Operations Group on Ivory (POGI) 2.2 Seized ivory destruction and repatriation			2.3 Criminal cases ?
3. International enforcement collaboration		3.2 Information sharing	3.1 Training on intelligence-led surveillance	
4. Awareness and education			4.1 Policy seminars for air and sea ports 4.2 Information and educational materials	

TABLE 10: Detailed evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – PHILIPPINES

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and comments)
CATEGORY 1: Legislation and regulations		
1.1 Registration of ivory and ivory products in compliance with Res. Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP16)	CHALLENGING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The development of an ivory registration policy has commenced including review of experiences in other countries. Reporting notes that a funding proposal will be submitted to the Asian Development Bank (ADB) in early 2014. <i>The requirement for external funding to complete the ivory registration policy has delayed progress. The development of the policy has been pushed out to the third of fourth quarter and ADB funding for the project was not yet confirmed at the time of last reporting.</i>
CATEGORY 2: National-level enforcement actions, investigation and national inter-agency coordination		
2.1 Creation and capacity building of the Philippine Operations Group on Ivory (POGI) and training of concerned DENR Field personnel on ivory ID and marking	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Philippine Operations Group in Ivory (POGI) was created by Special Order No. 2013-354 of 21 June 2013. The group is comprised of representatives from Philippine National Police, Office of the President of the Philippines, Bureau of Customs and the Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR). An operational budget has been approved. Up to 31 October 2013, POGI had conducted two law enforcement operations (in Tondo, Manila on 3 July 2013, and Lucena City on 21 July 2013) and was providing assistance to other enforcement efforts. Training for POGI officers, including on the identification of ivory, was due to be held in December 2013. <i>The established milestones for this action have been achieved or substantially achieved.</i>
2.2 Repatriation of confiscated ivory under government's (DENR) custody to known country of origin or destruction through burning, if repatriation does not work	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A total of 1,552 pieces of ivory weighing over 4,200 kg were crushed in Quezon City on 21 June 2013. The event was attended by multiple organizations, NGOs, government agencies and local media networks. Crushed ivory was then incinerated. 428 DNA samples were taken from the stockpile prior to destruction and samples were sent to the University of Washington for analysis. Prior to the crush, ivory originating from Kenya was repatriated to that country. Other source countries were also contacted regarding their potential interest in repatriating ivory. <i>The established milestones for this action were achieved.</i>
2.3 Pursue the filing of criminal cases/follow up criminal cases filed against illegal ivory traders	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No reporting was provided against this action. <i>This action is based on a milestone of submitting case status reports to CITES whenever applicable.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
CATEGORY 3: International enforcement collaboration		
3.1 Training on intelligence-led surveillance in collaboration with INTERPOL	CHALLENGING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proposed training on intelligence-led surveillance in collaboration with INTERPOL will be included within the ADB proposal referred to under Action 1.1. • <i>The reliance on ADB funding for the proposed training has delayed timeframes and it appears unlikely that training would have been completed by April 2014 in accordance with specified milestones.</i>
3.2 Sharing of information on illegal ivory trade	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • On 28 February 2013, an ETIS report was submitted to the Secretariat and then forwarded to TRAFFIC for inclusion in the ETIS database. • <i>This action is only measured via an ongoing milestone to submit ETIS reports to the Secretariat as applicable. Broader milestones on information sharing and an understanding of other information-sharing activities would be valuable.</i>
CATEGORY 4: Awareness and education		
4.1 Conduct of seminars on national and international policies governing ivory for authorities at major air and sea ports	CHALLENGING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • National and international policies relating to ivory were included in the training for POGI officers reported against Action 2.1. • Further activities to raise awareness of ivory-related policies were to be included within the proposal for ADB funding. • <i>The progress that has been made through training POGI officers is noted. Additional training appears reliant on the ADB funding proposal. This has the potential to restrict the achievement of the 30 June milestone of training at least 50 representatives from key enforcement agencies.</i>
4.2 Production of information and educational materials (tarpaulins) on ivory with focus on existing national and international policies	CHALLENGING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial copies of twelve educational 'tarpaulins' were produced and exhibited during the 21 June 2013 ivory crush. • Production of additional tarpaulins to display in major air and sea ports will be included in the ADB funding proposal. • <i>Based on the implementation reporting, achievement of the specified milestones appears reliant upon the success of the ADB funding proposal. This could lead to implementation delays. It appears unlikely that the milestone of 500 tarpaulins being displayed at air and sea ports and DENR regional offices by December 2013 would have been achieved unless an alternative delivery strategy was adopted.</i>

THAILAND

Findings

There are 10 actions in Thailand's NIAP (including two actions that have been specified for the purposes of this evaluation). In the Secretariat's assessment, two actions were rated as 'substantially achieved', two 'on track' for achievement, two 'challenging', and four were rated as 'unclear'.

The assessment indicates that a number of actions are underway, such as the revision of livestock moving Regulations, the management of the national ivory stockpile, and activities to compile and monitor information on ivory traders.

There also appear to be challenges. Thailand has made limited progress with its planned legislative amendments and the political situation in Thailand has presented an implementation challenge. Progress with actions related to law enforcement and monitoring data on ivory traders and levels of trade is unclear.

The Secretariat notes that some of the milestones in Thailand's NIAP are longer-term and not due for completion until 2016 or 2017. Without information on the interim steps that need to be met to achieve these longer-term milestones, it has sometimes been difficult to evaluate whether progress is on track. Where it appears that actions have been delayed, the Secretariat has taken a conservative approach to the allocation of progress ratings.

The progress ratings are summarized in Table 11 with the detailed evaluation shown in Table 12.

Information used for the evaluation

The Secretariat received a progress report from Thailand covering implementation up to 30 October 2013 and a subsequent report on implementation progress in early May 2014. Both reports were used as the basis of this evaluation.

TABLE 11: Summary evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – THAILAND

CATEGORY	PROGRESS RATING			
	Substantially achieved	On track	Challenging	Unclear
1. Related legislations and regulations	1.3 Revision livestock moving regulations		1.1 Revision Draught Animals Act 1.2 Revision Wild Animals Reservation... Act	
2. Database system	2.1 Information on traders	2.2 Stockpile data and marking		
3. Monitoring system				3.1 Monitoring data on traders ? 3.2 Checking and compiling trade data ? 3.3 Preparation of Annual Report ² ?
4. Law enforcement				(No specified actions) ¹ ?
5. Public relations campaigns		(No specified actions) ¹		

¹ No actions were specified and thus the assessment of progress has been based on the description of the overall category provided in the plan.

² This action was not yet due for completion at the time of last reporting and consequently this action is not yet measurable.

TABLE 12: Detailed evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – THAILAND

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and comments)
CATEGORY 1: Related legislations and regulations		
1.1 Revision of the Draught Animals Act B.E. 2482 (1939)	CHALLENGING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Legislative amendments to remove domesticated elephants from the Draught Animals Act are being drafted by the Department of Provincial Administration following in-principle endorsement of the amendments at an advisory meeting. A new regulation to introduce a new elephant identification book system has been drafted by the Department of Provincial Administration following government agency and stakeholder consultation and is being considered by the relevant departmental committee. <i>The progress to date is noted. Reporting notes that proposed legislative amendments have been delayed due to the political situation in Thailand. The plan aims for these activities to be completed in March 2015 (new book system) and April 2016 (new law). While the activities could still feasibly be within reach of achievement, the Secretariat has conservatively rated progress as challenging as interim milestones have not been established in the plan and it is uncertain to what extent the activity has been delayed.</i>
1.2 Revision of the Wild Animals Reservation and Protection Act B.E. 2535 (1992)	CHALLENGING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> This activity takes place alongside Action 1.1 to add domesticated elephants as a 'protected species' under this law. Draft amendments were used as the basis of a public hearing in September 2013 and public consultation is continuing via the Department of National Parks, Wildlife and Plant Conservation's (DNP) website. The Ministry of National Resources and Environment has agreed in principle to include African elephant in the list of protected species. By law this amendment requires the approval of a national committee that will not be established until a new government is formed. Provisions to control the possession of African elephant ivory also need to be drafted (currently the law only controls import and export of African elephant ivory). <i>Reporting notes that proposed legislative amendments have been delayed due to the political situation in Thailand. The plan aims for these laws to take effect in May 2016 (addition as protected species) and December 2017 (addition of provisions for controlling possession). While the activities could still feasibly be within reach of achievement, the Secretariat has conservatively rated progress as challenging as interim milestones have not been established in the plan and it is uncertain to what extent the activity has been delayed. The Secretariat notes that this action was reported as subject to delay prior to the establishment of the NIAP, as detailed in document SC63 Doc.18 Annex 6.</i>
1.3 Revision of the Department of Livestock Development's regulations on moving animals and their carcasses regarding marking of raw ivory under the Animal Epidemics Act	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The regulation to assign a new marking system for ivory (by means of punching unique identification numbers on whole tusks or pieces of raw ivory) was signed on 1 May 2014 by the Director General and was in the process of being gazetted at the time of last reporting. <i>The reported progress indicates that this action has been substantially achieved.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
CATEGORY 2: Database system		
2.1 Compiling information of ivory traders and control of them	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The nationwide survey of ivory traders was completed. At the time of last reporting (May 2014) there were 205 registered ivory wholesalers, retailers and carvers. Important provinces of ivory trade are Surin, Bangkok, Nakornswan, Buriram and Uthairat. <i>The milestone to complete the nationwide survey has been achieved.</i>
2.2 Compiling data and marking of confiscated ivory	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> An inventory of confiscated ivory has been completed and marking of ivory is well underway. <i>Good progress has been made. The completion of the marking had not yet been confirmed at the time of last reporting.</i>
CATEGORY 3: Monitoring system		
3.1 Monitoring of data on ivory traders and control of them	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The October 2013 report noted that information on traders was being compiled by DNP with the process due for completion in March 2014. Reports also note that changes in numbers of ivory traders are being monitored. <i>This is an annual activity scheduled to take place in the first quarter of each year. Reporting indicates that the annual process commenced but its completion has not yet been confirmed. It is also not clear how the data is being used to control ivory traders as indicated in the action itself.</i>
3.2 Checking of ivory accounts and compiling ivory trade data	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reporting notes that DNP regional offices continually monitor ivory trade and check the accounts of ivory traders, particularly their stock accounts. <i>This action is drafted as an ongoing activity without specified milestones or steps required under the action.</i>
3.3 Preparation of annual report	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No reporting provided against this action. <i>This activity is due to occur between April to June each year. As this is the first year of implementation of the plan, this action is not yet measurable.</i>
CATEGORY 4: Law enforcement		
No specified actions	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> From 2013 to April 2014, Thai enforcement authorities intercepted eight cases of ivory smuggling, confiscating 109 tusks/pieces of raw ivory and 1,054 pieces of worked ivory, with a total weight of almost 900 kg. <i>The seizures above are positively noted. There are no actions or milestones for this category which makes it difficult to evaluate progress.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
CATEGORY 5: Public relation campaigns		
No specified actions	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A variety of media targeting foreign tourists have been produced including warning stickers for ivory shops, brochures and foreign language posters. In addition a public information booth displaying videos in six languages has been established at Chatujak Weekend Market. • Campaigns to reduce internal ivory consumption and efforts to inform ivory entrepreneurs not to sell illegal ivory were mentioned generically but not detailed. • Cooperation with airport authorities and the Tourism Authority of Thailand was noted in reports. • <i>In particular, the progress with activities that target foreign tourists is noted. Further information on the detailed activities conducted for all target audiences, and their effectiveness, would be valuable.</i>

UGANDA

Findings

There are 20 actions in Uganda's NIAP. In the Secretariat's assessment, five actions were rated as 'substantially achieved', five 'on track' for achievement, three 'challenging' and seven were rated as 'unclear'.

Uganda has developed an ambitious and comprehensive plan covering a diverse range of activities. Clear progress with implementation has been observed in many areas. A significant development and commendable achievement is the recruitment of an additional 80 staff for the Ugandan Wildlife Authority's Intelligence Enforcement Unit. This additional enforcement capacity has been deployed across the country including at border posts and Entebbe International Airport to strengthen national enforcement actions. It is noted that since the deployment of this additional capacity, the rate of seizures in Uganda has increased, with large seizures recorded in October and December 2013. Enforcement capacity is also supported by the establishment of an Inter-agency Task Force comprised of Police, Customs, INTERPOL, the Ugandan Wildlife Authority, the Civil Aviation Authority and the Chieftaincy of Military Intelligence has also been established.

Policy and legislative improvements appear to be progressing well. A new National Wildlife Policy was approved by Uganda's Cabinet in March 2014 and amendments to strengthen national wildlife legislation are underway.

There also appear to be some challenges. The three actions in the plan related to capacity building and training – including the critical action of building the capacity to successfully implement Uganda's NIAP – appear reliant upon Uganda securing external resources for implementation. Limited progress has been reported on these actions and the uncertainty around resourcing presents an implementation challenge. The Secretariat notes that it was intended that NIAPs would list activities that could be delivered with nationally available funds and were not meant to be reliant upon additional external resources.

Progress with a number of actions could not be evaluated based on the information provided.

The Secretariat is also aware of other activities that are related to the implementation of Uganda's NIAP but not included in progress reports. The Secretariat would like to note the injunction granted to the Ugandan Wildlife Authority and Ugandan Revenue Authority halting the release of ivory confiscated last year, and the visit to the Secretariat by the Minister of Wildlife Tourism and Antiquities, the Honourable Maria Mutagamba, and her delegation in May 2014.

The progress ratings are summarized in Table 13 with the detailed evaluation shown in Table 14.

Information used for the evaluation

The Secretariat received a progress report from Uganda in early May 2014. This report was used as the basis of this evaluation.

TABLE 13: Summary evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – UGANDA

CATEGORY	PROGRESS RATING			
	Substantially achieved	On track	Challenging	Unclear
1. Legislation		<p>1.1 Revise National Wildlife Act</p> <p>1.2 Develop guidelines and regulations</p>		
2. Intelligence and enforcement (national level)	<p>2.1 Strengthen Intelligence Enforcement Unit at UWA</p> <p>2.4 Create National Task Force</p>	<p>2.3 Explore use of sniffer dogs</p>		<p>2.2 Enforcement staff at border points ?</p>
3. Coordination and collaboration (national and international)	<p>3.4 Ivory DNA samples</p>	<p>3.2 Regional cooperation and information exchange</p>		<p>3.1 Law enforcement collaboration ?</p> <p>3.3 Capacity for international investigations ?</p>
4. Awareness creation	<p>4.1 Inter-agency seminars and workshops</p>			<p>4.2 Awareness-raising materials ?</p> <p>4.3 National awareness-raising programme ?</p> <p>4.4 Linkages with development partners ?</p>
5. Management of confiscated ivory	<p>5.1 Secure storage of confiscated ivory</p>	<p>5.3 Regular stocktakes of wildlife specimens</p>		<p>5.2 Develop procedures for stockpile ?</p>
6. Training and capacity development			<p>6.1 Capacity in investigation techniques</p> <p>6.2 Capacity to deliver ivory action plan</p> <p>6.3 Capacity-building programmes</p>	

TABLE 14: Detailed evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – UGANDA

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and comments)
CATEGORY 1: Legislation		
1.1 Complete the revision of the National Wildlife Act to address gaps in legislation	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The revised National Wildlife Policy was approved by Cabinet in March 2014. Principles for the Wildlife Act Amendment Bill have been approved by Cabinet and a Bill is being drafted. <i>The completion of the National Wildlife Policy is acknowledged and the progress with legislative amendments noted.</i>
1.2 Formulate guidelines and regulations to operationalize provisions of the amended Uganda Wildlife Act to address specific gaps and issues relating to prosecution and stronger/deterrent penalties for wildlife crime offenders	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Draft Orders and Regulations to better incorporate CITES provisions in domestic wildlife legislation have been finalized and are awaiting approval by Cabinet. <i>Established milestones are to have the new Regulations and Orders in place by the end of June 2014 and this is considered within reach.</i>
CATEGORY 2: Intelligence and enforcement (national level)		
2.1 Strengthen the Intelligence Enforcement Unit at Uganda Wildlife Authority (UWA) to curb the illegal wildlife trade in the country	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> An Intelligence Unit of the Ugandan Wildlife Authority was established in March 2013. This involved recruiting and training 80 staff, which have since been deployed in various areas of the country including border posts and the international airport. <i>The action has progressed in accordance with milestones. It is also noted that since deployment of the intelligence unit, the rate of seizures in Uganda has increased.</i>
2.2 Deploy wildlife law enforcement staff at key/major entry and exit border points	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Activity reported against Action 2.1 indicates that staff have been deployed at key border points. <i>Some activity has been reported. It is not clear what progress there has been against established milestones such as roadblock surveillance checks along highways from the Democratic Republic of the Congo and South Sudan.</i>
2.3 Explore the possibility of acquiring and deploying sniffer dogs at key transit routes	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A proposal requesting funding of USD 30,000 to create a canine section within the intelligence unit was accepted by the African Elephant Fund. <i>The first milestone for this action was to acquire external funds and this has been completed.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
2.4 Create a National Task Force on illegal ivory and other wildlife contraband	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An inter-agency task force comprised of Uganda Police, Uganda Revenue Authority (Customs), INTERPOL, Uganda Wildlife Authority, Civil Aviation Authority and the Chieftaincy of Military Intelligence was established in April 2013. To date the committee has only met irregularly. A number of organizations have expressed interest in supporting or facilitating the work of the Task Force and this is now being pursued. • The Minister for Internal Affairs has in principle agreed to have the Uganda Wildlife Authority represented at the National Security Committee. • <i>The Task Force has been established in accordance with the specified milestones.</i>
CATEGORY 3: Coordination and collaboration (at both national level and international level)		
3.1 Strengthen collaboration with other law enforcement agencies including Customs, Police, the National Army, INTERPOL, and LATF to fight illegal ivory trade and other wildlife-related crimes	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Task Force reported against Action 2.4 will strengthen collaboration among law enforcement agencies. • No other reported activities could be easily aligned against this action. • <i>The specified milestone for this action was to undertake joint operations with Police and LATF. The Secretariat notes that Uganda participated in Operation COBRA II. On the basis of the information provided progress is unclear.</i>
3.2 Strengthen regional cooperation and exchange information as a tool to curb ivory syndicate	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strong coordination between Uganda Wildlife Service, Police, Customs, INTERPOL, LATF and Kenya Wildlife Service was reported. • Reporting notes the information sharing that has taken place including the provision of information to Kenya, Malaysia and Sri Lanka that led to the seizure of ivory consignments that passed through Uganda. • <i>Good progress has been made with the sharing of information. Uganda's participation in Operation COBRA II is also positively noted.</i>
3.3 Establish and maintain capacity at the national level to assist in international and regional investigations	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No activities were specifically reported against this action. • The establishment and training of the Task Force against Action 2.4, and the enhancement of the Intelligence Unit against Action 2.1, will help build national capacity to assist in international and regional investigations. • <i>On the basis of the information provided progress is unclear.</i>
3.4 Provide samples from confiscated ivory for DNA analysis to ascertain its origin	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • DNA samples were collected from the two large ivory seizures in October and December 2013 and from 15 rhino horns. Samples were submitted to the University of Washington (ivory) and the University of Pretoria (rhino horns). • <i>This action has progressed in accordance with milestones.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
CATEGORY 4: Awareness creation		
4.1 Hold inter-agency awareness seminars and workshops with especially law enforcement agencies, judiciary officials and other security agencies on the importance of wildlife and the need to fight illegal killing and trafficking of wildlife	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Five inter-agency awareness workshops involving the judiciary, Police, Customs and other security and law enforcement officers have been held since May 2013. The workshops have been held across a number of regions, and some have been conducted in collaboration with L ATF. • Sensitization meetings have been held with Customs staff at Entebbe International Airport and at border posts. • <i>The reported activity exceeds the established milestones.</i>
4.2 Produce/procure awareness materials for display	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • None of the provided reporting could be aligned against this action. • <i>On the basis of the information provided progress is unclear.</i>
4.3 Develop and implement a national awareness-raising programme focused on the importance of wildlife conservation	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • None of the provided reporting could be aligned against this action. • <i>On the basis of the information provided progress is unclear.</i>
4.4 Strengthen linkages between UWA and existing development partners to address wildlife crime among others	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • None of the provided reporting could be aligned against this action. • <i>On the basis of the information provided progress is unclear.</i>
CATEGORY 5: Management of the confiscated ivory including stockpiles		
5.1 Strengthen the security of confiscated ivory	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A secure strong room has been prepared for storing ivory, with a combination of password protected areas. • In collaboration with the Wildlife Conservation Society a consultant is being engaged to help train staff that will manage the strong room. • <i>There has been considerable progress and milestones have been achieved.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
5.2 Develop procedure and implement the structure for record keeping of ivory stockpile	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> None of the provided reporting could be aligned against this action. <i>On the basis of the information provided progress is unclear.</i>
5.3 Conduct regular stocktaking of wildlife specimens	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A stocktaking exercise of the national stockpile has been completed to establish a baseline and to verify the quantities of ivory in the stockpile. In collaboration with the Wildlife Conservation Society a consultant is being engaged to help train staff in marking the ivory stockpiled in the strong room. <i>The stocktaking progress is noted. At the time of last reporting it was not clear how the marking of the stockpile had progressed but this activity was not due for completion until June 2014.</i>
CATEGORY 6: Training and capacity development		
6.1 Develop capacity to address major gaps in crime scene management, sample collection (DNA), seizure stock inventory and specialized investigation techniques for the illegal ivory trade and forensic analysis	CHALLENGING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Uganda has participated in two major international events addressing strategies to combat illegal wildlife trade, namely the African Elephant Summit in Botswana in December 2013 and the London Conference in February 2014. Several funding proposals for capacity-building support have been completed. <i>The participation of Uganda in international events is positively noted. Uganda's participation in crime scene management training at the first international rhinoceros DNA sampling training workshop held in South Africa on 5-6 November 2013 is also noted. The reliance of capacity building upon external funding sources casts some uncertainty over the achievement of the specified milestones.</i>
6.2 Establish capacity required for the sustainable enforcement of the action plan	CHALLENGING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Several funding proposals for capacity-building support have been completed. <i>The reliance of capacity building upon external funding sources casts some uncertainty over the achievement of the specified milestones.</i>
6.3 Develop and implement comprehensive training and capacity-building programmes	CHALLENGING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Several funding proposals for capacity-building support have been completed. <i>The reliance of capacity building upon external funding sources casts some uncertainty over the achievement of the specified milestones.</i>

UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA

Findings

There are 19 actions in the United Republic of Tanzania's NIAP. In this assessment, four actions were rated as 'substantially achieved', seven 'on track' for achievement, two 'challenging' and six were rated as 'unclear'.

The United Republic of Tanzania submitted an ambitious NIAP with a broad scope of actions including wildlife population monitoring and community-based conservation alongside enforcement-related actions. Reporting indicates that substantial progress has been made in delivering many of the activities that have been committed to.

The Secretariat would particularly like to highlight the enhancement of law enforcement capacity that has resulted from the purchase or procurement of new patrol equipment and the progress that has been made towards the challenging milestone of recruiting almost 1,000 game scouts. The activity to survey major elephant populations is also noted, along with the good progress with community-based conservation and outreach and awareness activities.

Progress has also been made with actions related to the amendment of national wildlife legislation and associated regulations, although some of these appear unlikely to be completed on schedule.

The wide range of activity being pursued through the NIAP makes reporting an intensive process and the Secretariat would like to commend the United Republic of Tanzania for its reporting efforts. Some actions were reported on irregularly which has made the evaluation of progress unclear, particularly for law enforcement actions. It is not clear whether limited reporting is based on a lack of implementation resources, noting that full implementation of this ambitious plan could require significant resources. The Secretariat notes that the intent was that NIAPs would be implemented through existing national resources or national resources that would be made available for the purposes of implementation. The Secretariat also notes the recent initiative being undertaken with the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) that could attract significant resources, including through the Global Environment Facility (GEF).

The Secretariat is also aware of other activities completed by the United Republic of Tanzania that are related to the implementation of its NIAP but not included in progress reports. In particular the Secretariat would like to note the *Tanzanian Wildlife Summit to Stop Wildlife Crime and Advance Wildlife Conservation: A Call to Action* that took place on 9-10 May 2014 in Dar es Salaam, and was jointly hosted by the Office of the President of the United Republic of Tanzania, the Ministry of Natural Resources and Tourism and the International Conservation Caucus Foundation (ICCF). A range of actions were discussed at this high-level summit including the establishment of an Inter-Ministerial Task Force to coordinate training and enforcement of wildlife laws, the recruitment of an additional 5,000 rangers by 2018, and the creation of the Tanzanian Wildlife Authority (TAWA).

The progress ratings are summarized in Table 15 with the detailed evaluation shown in Table 16.

Information used for the evaluation

Three progress reports were received by the Secretariat, covering implementation over the periods July to October 2013, October to December 2013, and December to March 2014. All three reports were used as the basis of this evaluation.

TABLE 15: Summary evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA

CATEGORY	PROGRESS RATING			
	Substantially achieved	On track	Challenging	Unclear
1. Legislation and regulations		<p>1.2 CITES Regulation for Zanzibar</p>	<p>1.1 Amend Wildlife Conservation Act</p> <p>1.3 Review Wildlife Conservation Regulations</p>	
2. Law enforcement	<p>2.3 Purchase of patrol equipment</p>	<p>2.2 Recruitment of game scouts</p> <p>2.9 Enforcement capacity at exit points</p>		<p>2.1 Increase surveillance coverage ?</p> <p>2.4 Intelligence information system ?</p> <p>2.5 Prosecution training ?</p> <p>2.6 Speed of prosecutions ?</p> <p>2.7 Inter-agency workshop ?</p> <p>2.8 Conduct special operations ?</p>
3. Ivory stockpile database management		<p>3.1 Stockpile registration and marking</p>		
4. Monitoring and evaluation	<p>4.1 Aerial and ground wildlife census</p>	<p>4.2 Demographic surveys</p> <p>4.3 National genetic map</p>		
5. Cross-border cooperation		<p>5.1 Cross-border cooperation</p>		

CATEGORY	PROGRESS RATING			
	Substantially achieved	On track	Challenging	Unclear
6. Public awareness and education	6.1 National awareness-raising campaign			
7. Community-based conservation	7.1 Wildlife Management Areas			

TABLE 16: Evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – UNITED REPUBLIC OF TANZANIA

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and comments)
CATEGORY 1: Legislation		
1.1 Amendment of Wildlife Conservation Act No.5 of 2009	CHALLENGING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The December 2013 report noted that draft legislation had been submitted to the Attorney General for review by Parliamentary draftsmen. There has been no reporting on this matter since this time. <i>The milestone was to have this legislation approved by 30 December 2013 and this appears unlikely to have been achieved. More up-to-date information on progress would be valuable.</i>
1.2 Preparation of CITES Implementation Regulation for Zanzibar	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The CITES Secretariat's comments on draft implementing legislation for Zanzibar were received by the United Republic of Tanzania at the end of January 2014. A joint meeting with the CITES Secretariat to finalize draft implementation regulations is anticipated. <i>The progress with this action is noted. The Secretariat's comments to the United Republic of Tanzania were delayed. Despite this delay, completion of the action in accordance with specified milestones remains feasible.</i>
1.3 Review of Wildlife Conservation (CITES Implementation) Regulations 2005	CHALLENGING	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The December 2013 report noted that draft legislation had been submitted to the Attorney General for review by Parliamentary draftsmen. There has been no reporting on this matter since this time. <i>The milestone was to have this legislation approved by 30 December 2013 and this appears unlikely to have been achieved. More up-to-date information on progress would be valuable.</i>
CATEGORY 2: Law enforcement		
2.1 Increase surveillance area coverage in and outside protected areas	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No reporting provided against this action. <i>On the basis of the provided information progress is unclear.</i>
2.2 Increase recruitment of game scouts	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> At the time of last reporting (March 2014), 96 game scouts had been recruited and 437 vacancies advertised. <i>A very ambitious milestone of recruiting 964 game scouts by 30 June was established. The progress to date is impressive and it is still feasible that the milestone could be met.</i>
2.3 Purchase of patrol equipment	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Twenty-eight 4WD vehicles have been acquired along with one helicopter donated by the Howard Buffett Foundation. Five hundred new automatic firearms were purchased ahead of the proposed milestone. <i>All established milestones have been met or exceeded.</i>
2.4 Strengthen intelligence information system on illegal ivory trade	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> This action relates to the training of staff in intelligence gathering techniques, recruitment of intelligence agents and the improvement of intelligence information network. No reporting was provided against this action. <i>On the basis of the provided information progress is unclear. The Secretariat is aware that the United Republic of Tanzania is one of four East African countries that currently use the Wildlife Enforcement Monitoring System (WEMS), a centralized database for collection of information on wildlife crime.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
2.5 Train staff in prosecution in wildlife cases	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No reporting provided against this action. <i>On the basis of the provided information progress is unclear.</i>
2.6 Collaborate with High Court Registrar and Director of Public Prosecutions to speed up pending poaching cases	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A meeting to discuss challenges facing wildlife cases was held on 7 February 2014. <i>The progress through the above meeting is noted. This action does not have any specified milestones making it difficult to evaluate progress.</i>
2.7 Conduct inter-agency workshop to develop strategies for combating illegal ivory trade	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> No reporting provided against this action. <i>On the basis of the provided information progress is unclear.</i>
2.8 Conduct special operations	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A countrywide operation was launched on 2 October 2013. <i>The progress through the launch of the countrywide operation is noted. The milestone was to conduct anti-poaching patrols in all elephant stronghold ecosystems by 30 June 2014. Based on the information provided the progress towards this milestone is unclear. Further information would be valuable.</i>
2.9 Improve enforcement capacity at exit points	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reporting notes that regular patrols are conducted at exit points. Enforcement capacity has also been enhanced through activities delivered against Actions 2.2 and 2.3. <i>The Secretariat notes the progress that has been made with improving enforcement capacity. Additional information on the training that has been completed would be valuable.</i>
CATEGORY 3: Ivory stockpile database management		
3.1 Strengthen ivory stockpiles database by registering and marking based on the source (natural death, poached and crop control)	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The marking of ivory and the database update commenced in late December. <i>Based on progress to date it appears likely that the milestones to complete ivory marking and database updates by 30 June 2014 will be achieved. More up-to-date information would be valuable.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
CATEGORY 4: Monitoring and research		
4.1 Conduct aerial and ground wildlife census	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Aerial surveys have been conducted at West Kilimanjaro Ambelosi, Lake Natron-Magadi, Selous-Mikumi, Selous Niassa wildlife corridor, Rungwa Ruaha ecosystem and Itigi thickets. <i>A range of surveys have been completed. The decline in some elephant populations is noted with concern.</i>
4.2 Conduct demographic survey of major elephant populations	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demographic surveys have been conducted at Selous-Mikumi ecosystem and Rungwa Ruaha ecosystem. Other planned surveys appear to have been postponed due to funding shortages. <i>Progress has been made and some surveys conducted. Information on which surveys had been postponed in accordance with the overall survey programme would be valuable.</i>
4.3 Establish a genetic map of elephant tusks countrywide	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A DNA sequencing machine has been acquired through resources provided by Germany and the collection of tusks from dead elephants countrywide has commenced in collaboration with German partners. <i>Reporting notes the lack of in-house capacity to deliver this action. The progress made through the partnership approach with Germany is positively noted.</i>
CATEGORY 5: Cross-border cooperation		
5.1 Strengthen cross-border cooperation on combating illegal ivory trade	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Some quarterly cross-border cooperation meetings have been held, such as one between the United Republic of Tanzania and Zambia on 17-20 September 2013. Other planned meetings have been delayed due to lack of funds. Strategies developed for combating illegal ivory trade between the United Republic of Tanzania and Kenya were used during Operation COBRA II. A trans-frontier conservation area agreement between Mozambique and the United Republic of Tanzania was implemented under Southern African Development Community (SADC) agreement at Selous Niassa Corridor. The WEMS database is being implemented as part of a collaborative program under the LATF. <i>There has been progress with cross-border cooperation and information sharing. It is noted that funding shortages have the potential to limit progress towards some milestones.</i>
CATEGORY 6: Public awareness and education		
6.1 Conduct countrywide conservation education and awareness-raising campaign	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A general public sensitization on combating illegal ivory trade took place on 3 February 2014 when a roundtable discussion hosted by the Minister for Natural Resources and Tourism, and attended by over 50 participants, took place. The President launched a billboard on illegal ivory trade at Julius Nyerere International Airport on 12 February 2014. Education programs are delivered through 2071 school Malihai clubs, with 297 of these established since June 2013. Twenty thousand magazines have been distributed countrywide since June 2013. <i>The range of activity reported above, and the progress towards specified milestones, is positively noted.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
CATEGORY 7: Community-based conservation		
7.1 Establish three new Wildlife Management Areas (WMA) and facilitate 21 WMAs to acquire wildlife user rights in order to maintain elephant range and protection on village land including migratory, dispersals and corridor areas	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Two new WMAs are in the process of being established. • Eighteen WMAs had acquired user rights by March 2014. • Between June 2013 and March 2014, a total of Tsh. 13,600,000 (USD 8,250) in consolation had been disbursed to 16 families whose relatives were injured or died as a result of problem animals, and Tsh. 99,131,500 (USD 60,135) had been disbursed across 811 families that had crops raided by problem animals. • In the same period, 1,116 patrol man days were used to control problem animals. • <i>The significant progress towards milestones is noted along with the additional activity reported. The Secretariat also notes that it appears that the United Republic of Tanzania intends to revise its NIAP so that this activity will be split across two actions, with a new action of 'interventions to prevent human-wildlife conflicts' to be added.</i>

VIET NAM

Findings

There are 21 actions in Viet Nam's NIAP. In the Secretariat's assessment, 13 actions were rated as 'substantially achieved', six 'on track' for achievement and two were rated as 'unclear'.

The Secretariat notes the ambitious range of actions in Viet Nam's NIAP and the positive nature of the Secretariat's evaluation, with over half of the actions evaluated as 'substantially achieved'. In particular, the Secretariat acknowledges the progress that has been made with reforming Viet Nam's policy and legislative framework for elephant conservation and regulation of illegal ivory trade, with all seven listed actions being rated as 'substantially achieved' or 'on track'. This includes a number of governmental Decrees and Directives along with the establishment of a national program for elephant conservation from 2013 to 2020. The clear progress with these actions reflects the commitment from the highest political level to combat illegal ivory trade in Viet Nam.

The Secretariat is also aware of a other activities related to the implementation of Viet Nam's NIAP that were not included in progress reports. The Secretariat would like to note the Prime Minister of Viet Nam's Directive of 20 February 2014 on *Strengthening the direction and implementation of measures for controlling and protecting endangered, rare and precious wild animals* that acknowledges the serious threat that illegal trade in wildlife brings to Viet Nam. Viet Nam will also host the ASEAN Wildlife Enforcement Network (WEN) meeting in Ha Noi in May 2014.

The Secretariat is pleased to note that it received a formal request for the implementation of the *International Consortium on Combating Wildlife Crime (ICCWC) Wildlife and Forest Crime Analytic Toolkit* in the country. Viet Nam also incorporated CITES priorities, including combating illegal wildlife trade, into its revised draft National Biodiversity Strategy and Action Plan (NBSAP), which will open up opportunities to attract Global Environment Facility (GEF) funding.

The progress ratings are summarized in Table 17 with the detailed evaluation shown in Table 18.

Information used for the evaluation

The Secretariat received a progress report from Viet Nam covering implementation of the plan to 31 October 2013. This report was used as the basis of this evaluation.

The well-structured NIAP prepared by Viet Nam includes clear milestones and activities which has assisted the evaluation process.

TABLE 17: Evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – VIET NAM

CATEGORY	PROGRESS RATING			
	Substantially achieved	On track	Challenging	Unclear
1. Legislation and regulations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1.2 Revise inter-agency Directive on forest crimes 1.3 National elephant conservation program 1.4 Develop Decree on list of priority species 1.6 Revise Decree on administrative violations 1.7 Review current legislation and mandates 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1.1 Revise Decree on species protection 1.5 Ministerial Circular on hunting trophies 		
2. Wildlife enforcement capacity building	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2.1 Training courses for enforcement officials 2.2 Stockpile data and marking 			
3. Investigation and law enforcement responses	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3.1 Viet Nam WEN meeting 3.3 DNA samples from large-scale seizures 3.5 Strengthen border control 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3.2 Reporting to ETIS/MIKE 3.4 Control local ivory market 		
4. Strengthening cooperation and sharing information		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 4.1 ASEAN investigation cooperation 4.3 Viet Nam-China MoU 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 4.2 Intelligence sharing ?
5. Anti-corruption	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 5.2 Host multi-sector workshop on corruption 			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 5.1 Engage with national corruption committee ?

CATEGORY	PROGRESS RATING			
	Substantially achieved	On track	Challenging	Unclear
6. Ivory stock management	<p>6.1 Establish national ivory database</p> <p>6.2 Develop proposal for secure ivory stockpile</p>			

TABLE 18: Evaluation of progress towards actions in NIAP – VIET NAM

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and comments)
CATEGORY 1: Legislation and regulations		
1.1 Revise the Government Decree No. 32/2006/ND-CP on management and protection of Endangered, Precious, and Rare forest and aquatic species	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> At the time of last reporting a final draft Decree had been submitted to the government for approval by the Minister of Agriculture and Rural Development. <i>Progress of this action is in accordance with the established schedule. More up-to-date information would clarify whether the Decree has since been approved by government.</i>
1.2 Revise the inter-agency directive on Guide to the application of some Articles of the Criminal Code on crimes in forest management, forest protection and forest products management	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development approved Circular No. 40/2013/TT-BNNPTNT on 5 September 2013. This makes clear that ivory specimens without the required CITES documents constitute an offence. <i>The Circular reported on is relevant to this the action, and accordingly milestones have been achieved.</i>
1.3 Develop national program to conserve elephant in Viet Nam	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A national program for elephant conservation in Viet Nam from 2013 to 2020 was approved by the Prime Minister on 21 May 2013. <i>Milestones were achieved ahead of schedule.</i>
1.4 Develop the Government Decree on list of Endangered, Precious, Rare wild species for priority protection.	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The government approved Decree No. 160/2013/ND-CP on the list of Endangered, Precious and Rare wild species for priority protection on 12 November 2013. <i>All specified milestones for this action have been met.</i>
1.5 Develop a Ministerial Circular on the management of hunting trophies	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Prime Minister signed a Decision banning the importation of hunting trophies of rhino and elephant into Viet Nam. The CITES Management Authority is gathering information and stakeholder input to inform the development of a Circular on the management of hunting trophies in accordance with this Decision. <i>Delivery has progressed in accordance with established timeframes.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
1.6 Revise the Government Decree No. 99/2009/ND-CP on Sanction of Administration violations in the field of forest management, forest protection and forest products management	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> On 11 November 2013 the government approved Decree No. 157/2013/ND-CP which amended Decree No. 99/2009/ND-CP and established new penalties for wildlife crime. Under the new Decree offences of wildlife law carry an administrative fine of up to USD 25,000. <i>All specified milestones for this action have been met.</i>
1.7 Review the current legislation and institutional mandates regarding enforcement of ivory trade through Viet Nam, identifying barriers to prosecution and punishment and make recommendations on required revisions	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The review has been completed and a draft report was attached with the implementation report for October 2013. <i>The progress towards this action is positively noted. More up-to-date information on the review would be valuable.</i>
CATEGORY 2: Wildlife enforcement capacity building		
2.1 Develop training courses to customs, border army, police and prosecutors in key international check points	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> At the time of last reporting (October 2013) five training courses had been held targeting Customs, Police, border army and prosecutors, with 30-40 participants at each class. <i>The reported activity exceeds the target of holding two training courses.</i>
2.2 Provide all key ivory import-export points adequate ivory identification materials and tools	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Customs officers from international airports or border main checkpoints were trained and provided material to identify ivory and other wildlife specimens. The CITES Management Authority is working with airport authorities to distribute wildlife management regulations to passengers on sensitive routes. <i>There is clear progress towards this action. It is not clear whether the milestone of developing and promoting online tools has been achieved as this activity was not reported on.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
CATEGORY 3: Investigation and law enforcement responses		
3.1 Viet Nam WEN meeting focusing on combating illegal trade of ivory	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Two Viet Nam Wildlife Enforcement Network (WEN) meetings were held which resulted in an Inter-agency Action Plan for wildlife crime prevention, specifically rhino, ivory and tiger. <i>Delivery of the action has progressed well.</i>
3.2 Reporting to ETIS/MIKE	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> At the time of last reporting, a database of seizures was being compiled with information from Police and Customs, for sending to the CITES Secretariat once complete. <i>The process that has been made with updating seizure data is noted.</i>
3.3 Take samples from all large-scale ivory seizures and make samples available to CITES-approved laboratories for analysis	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> DNA sampling guidelines were developed in collaboration with the TRACE network. Samples have been collected from all ivory seizures in preparation for analysis. <i>The specified milestones for the action have been achieved.</i>
3.4 Improving the control of local market on ivory	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Prime Minister signed a Directive to improve enforcement activities to control the local ivory market. <i>The importance of the Directive and high-level support outlined above is noted. Information on the law enforcement activities that have been delivered would be valuable.</i>
3.5 Strengthen border control in Mong Cai and Hai Phong City	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A meeting of relevant agencies in Mong Cai and Hai Phong was held to develop an annual workplan. Two training courses to improve the capacity of enforcement in Quang Ninh Province (bordering China) were held. <i>Specified milestones for this action have been achieved.</i>
CATEGORY 4: Strengthening cooperation and sharing information		
4.1 Cooperation with other ASEAN countries on wildlife crime investigations and enforcement operations	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Two cases of ivory smuggling originating from Africa were investigated by sharing intelligence. <i>The Secretariat positively notes Viet Nam's efforts in international cooperation. Viet Nam's cooperation through hosting a number of ASEAN-WEN meetings in May 2014 is also noted.</i>
4.2 Increase reporting and sharing of intelligence to INTERPOL ECOMESSAGE, WCO-RILO, LATF and countries of origin	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Information has been shared in the annual meeting of ASEAN-WEN held in Chiang Mai, Thailand, on 3-5 June 2013. No specific reporting was provided on intelligence submitted to INTERPOL Ecomessage. <i>The positive nature of the information sharing that occurred through ASEAN-WEN is noted but other information sharing is unclear. The specified quarterly milestone 'number of reports submitted' is difficult to evaluate.</i>

ACTION	EVALUATION	SUMMARY OF PROGRESS (and <i>comments</i>)
4.3 Enact new MoU between Viet Nam and China on cooperation on int. wildlife trade	ON TRACK	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> At the time of last reporting the MoU had been developed and was awaiting signature. <i>Considerable progress has been made. It is not clear how the milestones the follow the establishment of the MoU (e.g. development of a work plan) have been progressed.</i>
CATEGORY 5: Anti-corruption		
5.1 Engage with the National Anti-Corruption Steering Committee (NACSC) to seek a high priority for addressing corruption of border officials	UNCLEAR	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reporting notes that all government agencies have established anti-corruption plans. <i>Reporting does not include any activities that relate to the established milestones for this action and thus it is unclear whether they have been completed or whether the NACSC has been engaged in this action.</i>
5.2 Host multi-sectorial workshop to identify approaches to address corruption in a cross-border context	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A multi-sector workshop led by the CITES Management Authority, as the coordinator of Viet Nam WEN, was proposed for December 2013. <i>The Secretariat notes that a roundtable meeting took place in Ha Noi on 24 March 2014 to strengthen the coordination of key policy initiatives to combat wildlife crime and to facilitate a discussion on the priorities to be implemented to enhance law enforcement efforts to combat transnational wildlife trafficking.</i>
CATEGORY 6: Ivory stock management		
6.1 Establish national database on ivory management	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relevant data on ivory stockpiles have been gathered and updated. <i>Reporting indicates that milestones have been achieved.</i>
6.2 Develop a proposal to establish a national, centralized, secure stockpile of seized ivory	SUBSTANTIALLY ACHIEVED	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Prime Minister has endorsed the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development establishing a national stockpile to secure ivory and other wildlife products. Possible donors to help construct the store are under investigation. <i>The milestone to submit a proposal to the Minister by 30 April 2014 was achieved ahead of time.</i>