

AMENDMENTS TO APPENDICES I AND II OF THE CONVENTION

Other Proposals

A. PROPOSAL

Transfer from Appendix I to Appendix II of *Manis temminckii* and inclusion of *Manis gigantea*, *Manis tetradactyla* and *Manis tricuspis* in Appendix II.

B. PROPONENT

The Swiss Confederation.

C. SUPPORTING STATEMENT

1. Taxonomy

11. Class: Mammalia
12. Order: Pholidota
13. Family: Manidae
14. Species: a) *Manis temminckii* (Smuts, 1832)
b) *Manis gigantea* Illiger, 1815
c) *Manis tetradactyla* Linné, 1766
d) *Manis tricuspis* Rafinesque, 1821
15. Common Names: English: a) Cape pangolin
b) Giant pangolin
c) Phatagin, Long-tailed or Black-bellied pangolin
d) Three-pointed, White-bellied or Tree pangolin
French: a) Pangolin terrestre du Cap
b) Grand pangolin
c) Pangolin à longue queue
d) Tricuspidé
Spanish: a) Pangolín del Cabo
b) Pangolín gigante
c)
d)
16. Code Numbers: a) A-108.001.001.006
b) A-108.001.001.002
c) A-108.001.001.004
d) A-108.001.001.007

2. Biological Data

21. Distribution: *Manis temminckii* are widely distributed in eastern to southern Africa and occur in Angola, Botswana, Chad, perhaps Ethiopia, Kenya, Malawi, Mozambique, Namibia, South Africa, southern Sudan, probably Swaziland, United Republic of Tanzania, Zambia and Zimbabwe. There has been no documented reduction in range of *Manis temminckii* although it must certainly be affected by expanding human populations. The range includes major conservation areas, such as Kruger NP, Kalahari Gemsbok NP, Gemsbok NP, Etosha NP,

Hwange NP, Gonarezhou NP, Ruaha NP, Serengeti NP, Masai Mara GR, Tsavo NP, Kidepo NP and many others.

Manis gigantea: Angola, Benin, Burkina Faso, Burundi (?), Cameroon, SW Central African Republic (?), Chad, Congo, Equatorial Guinea, Gabon, Gambia (?), Ghana, SE Guinea (?), Guinea-Bissau (?), Côte d'Ivoire, W Kenya, Liberia, Mali (?), Mauritania (?), SW Niger, Nigeria (?), Rwanda, Senegal, Sierra Leone, Sudan, United Republic of Tanzania (?), Togo (?), Uganda, Zaïre.

Manis tetradactyla: Angola, Benin, Burkina Faso (?), Burundi (?), Cameroon, SW Central African Republic (?), Congo, Equatorial Guinea, Gabon, Gambia, Ghana, Guinea (?), Côte d'Ivoire, Liberia, Mali (?), Nigeria (recorded only from one locality in 1939), Rwanda (?), Senegal, Sierra Leone, Sudan, Togo (?), W Uganda, Zaïre.

Manis tricuspis: Angola, Benin, Burkina Faso (?), Cameroon, SW Central African Republic (?), Congo, Equatorial Guinea (incl. Fernando Poo), Gabon, Gambia (?), Ghana, SE Guinea, Guinea-Bissau (?), Côte d'Ivoire, W Kenya, Liberia, Nigeria, Senegal (?), Sierra Leone, Sudan, United Republic of Tanzania, Togo (?), Uganda, Zaïre, NW Zambia.

(Information taken from Dorst and Dandelot (1970), Happold (1987), Meester and Setzer (1971), Smithers (1983), Stocker (1986), WCMC (1993), and COP 8 delisting proposal and its review)

22. Population

221. Wild Population

Manis temminckii: Largely unknown. Believed to be declining in most parts of its range (Burton & Pearson, 1987), or considered very rare (Richardson, 1991), although no major surveys have ever been carried out. Rated vulnerable in South Africa where some research using radio transmitters has been done in the 1980ies (Jacobsen *et al.*, 1991). In the "Analyses of Proposals to Amend the CITES Appendices" prepared COP 8 (IUCN, 1992), the reviewers concurred with the proposal's supporting statement that there is no evidence that the species' range is contracting to any great extent.

For the Western African species, a questionnaire survey was conducted by the African representative on the Animals Committee in 1993 and provided information on status and trends in some countries. No population information was available, but the general sense of overall trends was reported as one of decline.

Manis gigantea: Largely unknown; insular and not abundant; possibly threatened due to hunting. Chad, Ghana, Guinea and Niger reported a population decline, Nigeria no recent record, Rwanda confirmed the presence of the species in the Akagera NP and Nyungwe Forest Reserve but stated that it was close to extinction, Senegal indicated that the status in the south of the country was unknown.

Manis tetradactyla: Largely unknown; probably rare; possibly threatened due to hunting. Believed to be declining in Ghana and reported as having declined due to habitat destruction in Guinea. Mohr (1961) indicates that its population density is everywhere lower than that of *M. tricuspis*.

Manis tricuspis: Largely unknown, but obviously the most common species in the entire rainbow belt. Regionwise possibly threatened due to hunting and habitat destruction. Believed to be declining in Ghana, reported as having declined due to

habitat destruction in Guinea, and restricted to dense forest (at Nyungwe) and protected areas in Rwanda.

In Nigeria probably not uncommon in suitable undisturbed forest habitats (Happold, 1987). Sodeinde & Adedipe (1994) calculated for the Nigerian pangolins an extinction risk index of 0.68, i.e. the species have to be rated vulnerable although little is known about their population dynamics and ecology. *M. tetradactyla* is rare in the surveyed area (Ogun State) and *M. tricuspis* is becoming so. Among the external factors responsible for the high index, hunting pressure and habitat alteration / destruction seem especially important.

222. Captive Population: Not relevant. No specimens recorded in the International Zoo Yearbooks' (vols. 30 and 31) census of rare animals and list of mammals bred in captivity. Can be suitably exhibited only in nocturnal houses which limits the demand.

23. Habitat

Manis temminckii: Savanna woodland and thorn scrub with rainfall regimes from 250 mm per annum to 1400 mm per annum (Smithers, 1983).

Manis gigantea: A terrestrial species inhabiting forest and savanna in areas of good rainfall and high humidity that are not characterized by a long dry season. Swamps and moist river valleys are favourite areas in plains, hills and at lower mountain altitudes (Mohr, 1961; Sodeinde & Adedipe, 1994).

Manis tetradactyla and *Manis tricuspis*: Arboreal, living in the high forest zone. In Nigeria (and probably elsewhere), the forest habitats have been extensively modified by deforestation for timber, urban development, road and oil-pipeline construction. Secondary forests and plantations may be suitable for *M. tricuspis* (Mohr, 1961; Sodeinde & Adedipe, 1994).

3. Trade Data

31. National Utilization: All species: Hunted for medicinal use of various body-parts and for food. In the "Analyses of Proposals to Amend the CITES Appendices" prepared for COP 8 (IUCN, 1992), it is stated that large numbers of pangolins are killed for their meat and scales throughout Africa, and various examples of national utilization are given (see also Sodeinde & Adedipe, 1994). Wright (1954, quoted by Kingdon, 1971) and Mohr (1961) note that one of the eastern African local names for *M. temminckii* is "bwana mganga", i.e. Mr. Doctor, as all parts of the body are thought to have some healing property.

Consumptive use of pangolin parts and derivatives was highlighted in the majority of responses to the questionnaire survey conducted by the African representative on CITES Animals Committee in 1993. The exceptions were Rwanda and Senegal where neither trade nor utilization for medicinal purposes was reported for any of the species.

Contrary to the situation in some other countries, bushmeat market surveys in Zaïre revealed that pangolins figured amongst the least frequently captured groups of animals for bushmeat. This was attributed to both the animals' elusive nature and to the fact that, in some areas, the consumption of pangolins is considered a taboo (Colyn *et al.*, 1987).

The value of pangolin scales appears to be very high, e.g. during 1993, in Pretoria, the scales of *M. temminckii* were being sold for ca. USD 15 each (Newton and Mulliken, *in litt.*, to TRAFFIC Taipei, 1993) and in Namibia live pangolins were worth ca. USD 150 each (Griffin, pers. comm., to Mulliken). In SW Nigeria, Anadu *et al.* (1988) identified "tree

pangolin" (i.e. *M. tetradactyla* or *M. tricuspis*) as the second most expensive bush meat item selling in 1982 for 7.55 Niara (USD 4.72) per kilogramme.

Manis temminckii: In Zimbabwe, pangolins were traditionally caught and presented alive to the chief or king, in return for a reward. There may be some trade in body parts within the country.

32. Legal International Trade: CITES annual report data show very minor international trade: No live specimens of any of the species concerned have been recorded by CITES Parties from 1982 to 1984 (Stocker, 1986). From 1985 to 1992, some minor trade in live specimens was reported, including 23 *Manis* sp., 103 *M. tetradactyla* and 50 *M. tricuspis*, most of them originating in Togo and sent to the USA. During the same period, a total of 26 dead specimens were reported from various range states. U.S. import data for 1990 recorded 226 *M. temminckii* skins originating in Lao PDR, where the species does not occur. Also in 1990, the export of 100 kgs of *Manis* sp. scales from Madagascar (extralimital) to Republic of Korea was reported.
33. Illegal Trade: Much of the recorded internal trade in pangolins in Africa is apparently illegal due to protective legislation in the countries concerned. Namibian authorities confiscated at least 20 animals as well as an indeterminate number of dead animals and scales in 1993 (Mulliken, *in litt.*, to IUCS/SCC Trade Specialist Group). In response to the Animals Committee's questionnaire survey, Niger stated that there was illegal trade in giant pangolins between Niger and Nigeria. Illegal international trade, as documented by CITES, is not significant, e.g. from 1975 to 1992, the Swiss MA confiscated only one stuffed *Manis tricuspis* in 1977, and, in 1990, two live *Manis tricuspis* were confiscated at Schiphol Airport by the MA of the Netherlands.
34. Potential Trade Threats
 341. Live Specimens: None known.
 342. Parts and Derivatives: There is no solid evidence for trade in pangolin scales for the traditional medicine across African borders, but a potential for such trade within Africa certainly exists. There is also a possibility that an intercontinental trade could develop, as, in certain Asian markets, prices for *Manis* scales have risen continuously since the 1980ies. Such trade could easily go along with illegal trade in rhino horn and/or ivory (Mulliken, *in litt.*, to IUCS/SCC Trade Specialist Group).

4. Protection Status

41. National: *Manis temminckii* is specially protected or protected in South Africa, and is totally protected in Botswana (under the Wildlife Conservation and National Parks Act), Kenya, Mozambique, United Republic of Tanzania and Zimbabwe with possession and/or national and international trade prohibited or regulated. According to IUCN-ELC (1988), it is totally protected in Ethiopia, Mozambique, Sierra Leone, Somalia, and partially protected in Zaïre. Protected in Zambia where an export fee has been established. Trade is prohibited in Chad.

Manis gigantea is partially protected in Cameroon and Equatorial Guinea, totally protected in Congo and Sierra Leone, and totally protected in the Central African Republic, Kenya, Mali, Rwanda, Senegal, United Republic of Tanzania, Togo and Zaïre with possession and/or national and international trade prohibited or regulated. Trade is prohibited in Chad.

Manis tetradactyla is totally protected in Ghana under the Wildlife Conservation Regulations, 1971, and in Guinea Bissau. It is partially protected in Côte d'Ivoire, in Liberia and in Togo (IUCN-ELC, 1988), classified "game" in Sierra Leone, and totally protected in Guinea-Bissau.

Totally protected in Mali, Rwanda and Senegal with possession and/or national and international trade prohibited or regulated.

Manis tricuspis is totally protected in Ghana, and partially protected in Congo, Côte d'Ivoire, Liberia and Togo (IUCN-ELC, 1988). Totally protected also in Kenya and United Republic of Tanzania with possession and/or national and international trade prohibited or regulated. Classified "game" in Sierra Leone. Protected in Zambia where an export fee has been established.

All three West African species are protected in Nigeria under Schedule 1 of Decree No. 11: Control of International Trade in Endangered Wild Fauna and Flora (Sodeinde & Adedipe, 1994). They are totally protected in Benin, Burkina Faso, Ghana and Liberia with possession and/or national and international trade prohibited or regulated, and are fully protected in Guinea.

All four species are totally protected in Angola and Uganda and partially protected in the Sudan. In all three countries possession and/or national and international trade are prohibited or regulated.

No specific protection is afforded to pangolins in Gabon, Gambia, Malawi, Mauritania, Namibia (but see under 33 above) and Niger (no hunting allowed).

42. International: All four species are listed in class B of the 1968 African Convention on Nature and Natural Resources. *Manis temminckii* has been listed in Appendix I of CITES since 01/07/75. *Manis gigantea*, *Manis tetradactyla* and *Manis tricuspis* are listed in Appendix III (Ghana) of CITES since 26/02/76.
43. Additional Protection Needs: Improved enforcement of national legislation, for the West African species also conservation of suitable habitat.

5. Information on Similar Species

Trade in mis- and unidentified - and unreported - pangolin skins and, more importantly, scales, has been the focus of attention within the context of CITES for many years.

All Asian pangolin species, i.e. *Manis crassicaudata*, *Manis javanica* and *Manis pentadactyla* are listed in Appendix II. Skins and scales of the Asian species are in legal and illegal international trade. At its 9th meeting (Brussels, August 1993), the Animals Committee reviewed international trade in pangolins. It concluded that the identification of pangolin scales represented a "look-alike" problem which influenced effective regulation of international trade in the species. Identification of pangolin skins would be easily possible if controlling agents would make use of the CITES Identification Manual.

6. Comments from Countries of Origin

Manis temminckii: After having discussed the issue with the Director of the Transvaal Management Authority in February/March 1994, and with the Namibian, South African and Zimbabwean representatives at the 31st Standing Committee meeting, a draft supporting statement was sent to the proponents of the COP8 *Manis temminckii* proposal and to South Africa.

Botswana, Namibia and South Africa responded prior to May 31. They agree with the proposal, although some of these countries feel that the species should not be listed at all.

Western African Species: By a memorandum from the Chairman of Animals Committee, dated 8 November 1992, the following range states were invited to comment on the proposal to list all African pangolins in Appendix II: Angola, Benin, Botswana, Burkina Faso, Burundi, Cameroon, Central African Republic, Chad, Congo, Côte d'Ivoire, Equatorial Guinea, Ethiopia, Gabon, Gambia, Ghana, Guinea, Guinea-Bissau, Kenya, Liberia, Malawi, Mali, Mauritania, Mozambique, Namibia, Niger, Nigeria, Rwanda, Senegal, Sierra Leone, Somalia, South-Africa, Sudan, United Republic of Tanzania, Togo, Uganda, Zaïre, Zambia, Zimbabwe.

Although the majority of respondents expressed views in favour of listing, the reasons provided were highly variable and mostly subjective. Support for inclusion was expressed by: Chad, Ghana, Guinea, Niger (especially for *Manis gigantea*) and Rwanda. Only Senegal specifically opposed inclusion on the grounds that there is no known trade of these species in Senegal nor in the West African subregion. Several countries of the southern African subregion, where only *M. temminckii* occurs, expressed views: Zambia supported the listing based on concerns that heavy trade in Asian species might shift to African species. Malawi, Mozambique, South Africa and Zimbabwe did not support the listing, the general view being that domestic and regional trade were the real problems and that CITES listing would have no impact on these, while, in addition, domestic legislation was felt to be strong enough to combat illegal trade.

7. Additional Remarks

As *Manis temminckii* has been listed in Appendix I prior to the adoption of the Berne Criteria, Resolution Conf. 2.23 on Special Criteria for the Deletion of Species and other Taxa applies.

At the Standing Committee Meeting held at Geneva from March 21 to 25, 1994, Switzerland was requested by the Chairman of Animals Committee to prepare and submit the present proposal.

At COP 8, Botswana, Malawi, Namibia and Zimbabwe submitted a proposal for the deletion of *Manis temminckii* from Appendix I, stating that the original listing was made before the adoption of the Berne Criteria, and that it appeared unnecessary to list the species in Appendix I since there is no evidence to suggest that it is endangered or that potential trade is likely to threaten its survival. The Secretariat and TRAFFIC suggested the proponents to amend the proposal in order to transfer the species to Appendix II. While the proponents, supported by South Africa, stressed that national legislation and enforcement were the key instruments for conserving this species, as most trade was domestic, some other delegations felt that the species should remain in Appendix I in order to strengthen the case for national legislation, or awaiting the results of further research.

The observer from IUCN also recommended further research but felt that, as the species did not meet the criteria for Appendix-I listing, it should be transferred to Appendix II. Concern over the similarity of *Manis temminckii* to Asian pangolins led the delegations of Japan, Portugal on behalf of the EC, Switzerland and the United States of America to support transfer to Appendix II rather than the deletion from the appendices. In the light of these discussions the proponents withdrew the proposal.

In the "Analyses of Proposals to Amend the CITES Appendices" (IUCN, 1992), the reviewers refer to mis-reporting of trade which is related to identification problems. This supports the inclusion of all four *Manis* species in Appendix II under Article II.2.b of the Convention.

8. References

- Anadu, P.A., Elamah, P.O. and Oates J.F. (1988). The Bushmeat Trade in Southwestern Nigeria: A Case Study. *Human Ecology* 16(2): 199-208.
- Burton, J.A. and Pearson, B. (1987). *Collins Guide to the Rare Mammals of the World*. Collins, London.
- Colyn, M., Dudu, A. and Mankoto M.M. (1987). Données sur l'exploitation du "petit et moyen gibier" des forêts ombrophiles du Zaïre. *Proc. Int. Symp. Wildl. Mgmt. in Sub-Saharan Africa*: 110-145.
- Dorst, J. and Dandelot P. (1970). *A Field Guide to the Larger Mammals of Africa*. Collins, London.
- IUCN (1992). *Analyses of Proposals to amend the CITES Appendices*. Prepared by IUCN/SSC Trade Specialist Group, World Conservation Monitoring Centre, and the TRAFFIC Network for the Eighth Meeting of the Conference of the Parties. IUCN - The World Conservation Union, Gland, Switzerland.
- IUCN-ELC (1988). *African Wildlife Laws*. IUCN Environmental Policy & Law Occasional Paper No. 3.
- Happold, D.C.D. (1987). *The Mammals of Nigeria*. Clarendon Press, Oxford.
- Kingdon, J. (1971). *East African Mammals, Vol. I*. Academic Press, London / New York.
- Jacobsen, N.H.G., Newbery, R.E., de Wet, M. J., Viljoen P.C. & Pietersen, E. (1991). A contribution to the ecology of the Steppe pangolin *Manis temminckii* in the Transvaal. *Z. Säugetierkunde* 56, 94-100.
- Meester, J. and Setzer, H.W. (1971). *The Mammals of Africa. An Identification Guide*. Smithsonian Institution Press, Washington D.C.
- Mohr, E. (1961). *Schuppentiere. Die Neue Brehm Bücherei, Vol. 284*. Ziemsen, Wittenberge-Lutherstadt.
- Richardson, P.R.-K. (1991). *in litt.* to IUCN/SSC Trade Specialist Group.
- Smithers, R.H.N. (1983). *The Mammals of the Southern African Subregion*. University of Pretoria. Pretoria.
- Sodeinde O. A. & Adedipe, S. R. (1994). Pangolins in south-west Nigeria - current status and prognosis. *Oryx* 28,1: 43-50.
- Stocker, G. (1986). *Manidae*. In: *CITES Identification Manual, Vol. 1*.
- WCMC (1993). *World Checklist of Threatened Mammals*. Joint Nature Conservation Committee, Peterborough.

