

## CONSIDERATION OF PROPOSALS FOR AMENDMENT OF APPENDICES I AND II

A. Proposal

Transfer of populations of *Loxodonta africana* currently listed in Appendix II to Appendix I. The African population of *Loxodonta africana* as a whole meets the criteria for listing in Appendix I in accordance with Resolution Conf. 9.24, Annex 1, Criterion C(i), C(ii) and D, and in light of Annex 3 on "Split Listing" and Annex 4 on "Precautionary Measures".

B. Proponent

Kenya and India.

**Rationale**

- Poaching of African and Asian elephants for their ivory and the illegal ivory trade continue to pose a serious threat to most African and Asian elephant populations.
- Widespread poaching of elephants for their ivory is at very high levels in many parts of Africa, particularly in areas rendered unstable by political chaos or military activity.
- In Africa, there are reports of organised gangs of elephant poachers, selling elephant meat locally and exporting ivory to Asian markets.
- Tons of African ivory and thousands of African elephant tusks have been seized in the last three years upon entry into - or destined for - Asian countries, particularly China.
- In most cases, existing anti-poaching efforts in Africa and Asia are no match for well-armed poachers.
- The continental population continues to decline. It declined by 15.6% between 1995 and 1998 (the years for which most recent continental-wide population data are available).
- Market studies show that ivory is once more regarded as a desirable commodity and that many of the gains made in consumer education during the 1980s and 1990s may be eroding as new markets develop. Ivory is offered for sale in many Southeast Asian countries, even where such sale is apparently illegal (Martin and Stiles 2002). European and American tourists who purchase ivory trinkets as souvenirs are contributing to the problem by importing large quantities of ivory bought in Asia, some of which originates from African elephants. Consumers are likely to be confused by the mixed message conveyed by split-listings.
- Listing of some elephant populations in Appendix II with a zero quota is not as strong a precautionary measure as listing those same populations in Appendix I. Transfer to Appendix II with a zero quota has been misinterpreted to mean that international ivory trade is imminent.
- These misunderstandings have probably already led to increased illegal trade, or to the poaching of elephants and stockpiling of ivory in anticipation of trade legalisation. Returning all elephant populations to Appendix I would be a precautionary measure that would greatly reduce this threat in future.
- Five years after being agreed by the Parties. Monitoring of Illegal Killing of Elephants (MIKE) is not yet operational in Asia or West Africa and has only just begun in many other parts of Africa. No information regarding trends in illegal killing has yet been provided to the Parties by MIKE.

## C. Supporting statement

### 1. Taxonomy

- 1.1 Class: Mammalia
- 1.2 Order: Proboscidea
- 1.3 Family: Elephantidae
- 1.4 Species: *Loxodonta africana*
- 1.5 Scientific synonyms: None
- 1.6 Common names: English: African elephant  
French: éléphant d'Afrique  
Spanish: elefante africano
- 1.7 Code numbers: CITES A-115.001.002.001  
ISIS 5301415001002001001

### 2. Biological parameters

#### 2.1 Distribution

Thirty-six sub-Saharan African countries, covering a range of 5,772,466 km<sup>2</sup> (Barnes et al. 1998).

#### 2.2 Habitat availability

Increasing human populations and droughts have confined elephants to isolated pockets of national parks and reserves in West Africa. Central Africa contains elephants throughout the lowland rainforest, where individuals are almost impossible to count and the area of suitable habitat extends for thousands of square miles. In Eastern Africa, loss of habitat due to human activity is one factor contributing to the decline, extermination and compression of elephant populations. In Southern Africa, elephant habitat is highly fragmented by human activities.

#### 2.3 Population status

See far right column in Table 1, below, for the most recent population data.

Captive African elephants number fewer than 500 with most of these in zoos in the United States.

#### 2.4 Population trends

The continental population continues to decrease (see Table 1). It decreased from an estimated 1,203,501 in 1981 to 519,461 in 1998, or by 56.8% over this period. The most recent data available (Barnes et al. 1998) demonstrates a continued population decline (although some of the differences between years may represent changes in sampling technique). Between 1995 and 1998, the rate of decline was 15.6%. Regionally, populations are decreasing in West, East and Central Africa. Only in parts of Southern Africa are populations apparently stable.

**Table 1.** Elephant population estimates, by country, 1981 – 1998

	<b>1981</b>	<b>1985</b>	<b>1987</b>	<b>1995*</b>	<b>1998*</b>
<b>West Africa</b>					
Benin	1,250	2,300	2,100	1,550	–
Burkina Faso	3,500	3,500	3,900	2,635	3,708
Ghana	970	1,000	1,100	2,531	2,322
Guinea	800	800	320	1,000	248
Guinea Bissau	–	–	–	–	35
Ivory Coast	4,800	4,800	3,300	2,196	1,191
Liberia	2,000	800	650	1,783	1,783
Mali	780	700	600	807	1,000
Mauritania	40	0	20	0	–
Niger	800	800	800	800	917
Nigeria	1,820	1,500	3,100	1,615	1,253
Senegal	370	100	50	40	30
Sierra Leone	500	500	250	0	0
Togo	150	100	100	228	96
Subtotal	17,780	16,900	16,290	15,220	12,583
<b>Central Africa</b>					
Cameroon	5,000	12,400	21,200	17,213	15,735
CAR	31,000	19,500	19,000	9,284	18,720
Chad	0	2,500	3,100	3,140	1,900
Congo	10,800	59,000	61,000	32,563	0
DRC	376,000	523,000	195,000	83,618	29,693
Equatorial Guinea	0	1,800	500	407	80
Gabon	13,400	48,000	76,000	82,012	61,794
Subtotal	436,200	666,200	375,800	228,237	127,922
<b>East Africa</b>					
Eritrea	0	0	0	100	2
Ethiopia	9,000	9,000	6,650	2,407	1,306
Kenya	65,056	28,000	35,000	26,478	30,696
Rwanda	150	100	70	81	69
Somalia	24,323	8,600	6,000	250	250
Sudan	133,772	32,300	40,000	0	0
Tanzania	203,900	216,000	100,000	98,179	91,690
Uganda	2,320	2,000	3,000	1,848	2,722
Subtotal	438,521	296,000	190,720	129,343	126,735

### Southern Africa

Angola	12,400	12,400	12,400	8,170	170
Botswana	20,000	45,300	51,000	80,174	103,472
Malawi	4,500	2,400	2,400	2,337	3,885
Mozambique	54,800	27,400	18,600	14,900	13,340
Namibia	2,300	2,000	5,000	11,999	9,105
South Africa	8,000	8,300	8,200	10,010	11,905
Swaziland	–	–	–	–	39
Zambia	160,000	58,000	41,000	33,004	29,016
Zimbabwe	49,000	47,000	43,000	81,855	81,289
Subtotal	311,000	202,800	181,600	242,469	252,221
Continental Total	1,203,501	1,181,900	764,410	615,269	519,461

\* Includes all categories in Said et al. (1995) and Barnes et al. (1998): "definite", "probable", "possible", and "speculative" population sizes. A dash (-) indicates that no data were given.

Sources of country data: Cumming and Jackson, 1984; Martin, 1985; AERSG 1987; Burrill and Douglas-Hamilton, 1987; Said et al. 1995; Barnes et al. 1998.

### 2.5 Geographic trends

The range of the African elephant once spanned the entire continent (Mauny, 1956; Douglas-Hamilton, 1979), including North Africa up to the Mediterranean coast where the species is now extinct. Between 1988 and 1995, the range of the African elephant decreased by 144,248 km<sup>2</sup>. However, between 1995 and 1998, the range apparently grew slightly by 714 km<sup>2</sup> (see Table 2) but this is may not be a statistically significant increase.

**Table 2.** Distribution of the African elephant by region, in km<sup>2</sup>

	1995	1998
Central Africa	2,760,277	2,772,397
Eastern Africa	1,074,049	1,063,569
Southern Africa	1,725,238	1,742,037
West Africa	230,188	212,463
<b>Total</b>	<b>5,789,752</b>	<b>5,790,466</b>

Sources: Said et al. 1995; Barnes et al. 1998

### 2.6 Role of the species in its ecosystem

Elephants play a key role in the ecology of their habitats. For example, their feeding habits open up thick bush and forest for grazing species, they maintain waterholes and keep open forest pathways used by wildlife and humans (Carroll, 1988). Elephants are also important dispersal agents for a number of tree species (Alexandre, 1978).

## 2.7 Threats

For decades, the illegal trade in African ivory has been acknowledged as a major contributor to the decline of the species (see Republic of Tanzania proposal to list the African elephant in Appendix I, CITES COP8, 1989).

More recently, a market survey conducted in South and Southeast Asia between November 2000 and March 2001 revealed that over 105,000 ivory items were offered for sale in 521 shops in 17 towns and cities in eight countries (Martin and Stiles 2002). Some of this ivory was of African origin. Tourists from Europe and the United States purchase these ivory items as souvenirs and take them illegally to their home countries, thus contributing to the decline of elephant populations in many Asian countries. Martin and Stiles (2002) estimate that elephant populations in Cambodia, Laos and Vietnam have declined by over 80% between 1988 and 2000, largely as a result of the trade in ivory and other elephant products. In addition, African ivory is smuggled into Thailand in large quantities.

These and other examples of extensive illegal trade in elephant ivory (see sections 3.3.1 and 3.3.2 of this proposal) indicate that the global illegal trade remains a serious threat to both African and Asian elephants.

The trade in ivory has also contributed significantly and intensively to the contraction of the range of the species (Douglas-Hamilton, 1979; AERSG, 1987). Although Africa maintains vast expanses of suitable elephant habitat, pressure from poaching has, in many areas, either eliminated entire elephant populations or reduced population densities to very low levels (Burrill and Douglas-Hamilton, 1987).

Other threats include poaching for meat, habitat destruction, human-elephant conflict, and human-human conflict (war).

## 3. Utilization and trade

### 3.1 National utilization

Elephants are utilised in a variety of ways in Africa: ivory is used for ceremonial purposes, for personal adornment, and for musical instruments; elephant meat is consumed in parts of West, Central and Southern Africa; elephants are hunted for sport; live elephants are kept in captivity for entertainment purposes; skins are made into a variety of products; and hair is used to make jewellery.

### 3.2 Legal international trade

Annotation 604 limits legal international trade from Botswana, Namibia, and Zimbabwe to: 1) export of hunting trophies for non-commercial purposes; 2) export of live animals to appropriate and acceptable destinations (Namibia: for non-commercial purposes only); 3) export of hides (Zimbabwe only); and 4) export of leather goods and ivory carvings for non-commercial purposes (Zimbabwe only). Annotation 605 limits legal international trade from South Africa to: 1) trade in hunting trophies for non-commercial purposes; 2) trade in live animals for re-introduction purposes into protected areas formally proclaimed in terms of legislation of the importing country; and 3) trade in hides and leather goods. It is not legal to trade in ivory or any other specimens for commercial purposes.

### 3.3 Illegal trade

#### 3.3.1 Illegal ivory seizures

Summary of reported ivory seizures, 1 January 2000 to 21 May 2002			
Origin of shipment	No. tusks	No. ivory pieces or objects	Weight*
Africa	690	2,540	4,960 kg
Asia	–	4,776	35 kg
Other/Unknown	1,852	7,332	958.4 kg
<b>Total</b>	<b>2,542</b>	<b>14,648</b>	<b>5,953.4 kg</b>

\* Weight used only when no other quantitative figure (i.e. number of tusks or pieces) is available. Quantitative categories do not overlap. Figures used in this Summary are from seizures detailed below.

#### 2002

**Tanzania.** 1,255 tusks were seized in two houses in Dar es Salaam in January. The origin is unknown. Source: Tanzanian Police. Cited in: The Guardian, 1 February 2002; Reuters, 16 January 2002; and Associated Press, 11 January 2002.

**Chile.** Two tusks were seized in Iquique, Chile, in March. The owner reported that they had been imported from Belgium in 1998. Source: Servicio Arcola y Ganadero, Chile. Cited in: Personal communication, May 2002

**South Africa.** Seven elephant tusks, weighing 90 kg, were seized from one South African and two Botswanan nationals who tried to sell the ivory to undercover detectives. The three ivory dealers were arrested. Source: Police spokesperson, Superintendent Gert Ackron, Endangered Species Protection Unit. Cited in: The Citizen, 10 April 2002.

**Kenya.** Over one ton of ivory, worth millions of Kenya shillings, was seized in April 2002. Several poachers were arrested by the Lusaka Agreement Task Force (LATF). Most of the ivory had been poached from elephants in Kenyan and Tanzanian game parks. Source: Musa Limo, LATF. Cited in: East African Standard, 12 April 2002.

**Kenya.** In addition, between 18<sup>th</sup> March 2000 and 17<sup>th</sup> March 2002, there were 27 separate incidents involving illegal trade in elephant ivory. The total number of raw ivory pieces seized was 236, along with 11 items of worked ivory. The total weight was 744.5 kg. Source: Kenya Wildlife Service data.

**Namibia.** From January to April 2002, eight tusks and four pieces of tusks were seized by government officials. Weights not recorded. Source: Namibian Police Protected Resources Unit. Cited in: Report of the Unit.

**India.** Four large ivory carvings were seized in Kerala in May. One carving was almost four feet (1.2 m) high and weighed over 40 kg. The other three were between 17 inches (43 cm) and 21 inches (53 cm) high. Four people were arrested. One of the ivory traders had mentioned to undercover operatives the availability of African ivory that had been smuggled into India. Source: Belinda Wright, WPSI. Cited in: Wildlife Protection Society of India (WPSI) press release, May 20 2002.

**Thailand.** In May, an Omani national attempted to smuggle 60 large pieces of African ivory weighing 195kg into Thailand and valued at US\$21,000. The ivory was carried in his luggage. Officials also found a further 56 pieces of ivory of similar weight in unclaimed luggage. The smuggler was arrested at Bangkok International airport and charged with smuggling banned goods into Thailand, an offence which carries a fine of 4 times the value of the goods and a maximum jail term of ten years. Source: none given. Cited in: Ananova, May 21 2002.

## 2001

**Zambia.** 19 tusks were seized in anti-poaching operations between January and March 2001. Source: Tourism Minister, Michael Mabenga. Cited in: The Post (Lusaka), 17 May 2001.

**United Kingdom.** Between January 2000 and March 2001, UK Customs seized 6 carved ivory items weighing a total of 32.7 kg and a further 13 worked ivory items of unknown weight. Source: H.M. Customs and Excise ad-hoc report.

**Kenya.** In February, a Pakistani national working as a United Nations peace-keeper, travelling from Rwanda to the United Arab Emirates, was arrested at Jomo Kenyatta International Airport with 26 carved ivory pieces. He pleaded guilty and paid a fine of \$195. A few days later, a Romanian national, travelling from Burundi to Amsterdam, via Kenya, was arrested at the Airport with six ivory carvings. Source: Festus Luvisia, CID Officer in charge of airports. Cited in: The Daily Nation, 13 February 2001 and National Post, 13 February 2001.

**South Africa.** In March, 26 tusks, valued at R250,000 to R500,000, and believed to have come from Botswana, were seized from a North West Province farm, where they were found buried. The owner of the farm was arrested. Source: Endangered Species Protection Unit and Supt. Bernadine Benson. Cited in: Wildnet Africa, 23 March 2001 and News24, 23 March 2001.

**Kenya.** A Chinese businessman was charged before Nairobi Chief Magistrate Boas Olao with possessing two ivory carvings illegally. He denied the charges. Source: None given. Cited in: The Nation, 3 April 2001.

**United Kingdom.** In April, a shipment containing 445 kg of raw ivory was seized at Gatwick Airport. The ivory originated in Kenya and was destined for China. One Chinese person was arrested. Source: ETIS database. Cited in: CITES Animals Committee AC18 Doc. 5.1, Regional Reports: Africa.

**India.** Ivory carvings, including newly carved bangles, buttons and cane handles, weighing 21 kg, were seized in Delhi on 26 April 2001. Two people were arrested. Source: Wildlife Trust of India. Cited in: Personal communication, 27 April 2001.

**United States.** In April, two shipments from Nigeria were found to contain ivory. In one shipment, 22 tusks, ranging from 18-42 inches in length and 150 pieces of tusks, weighing 182 pounds in total, valued at up to US\$ 230,000, were found concealed in chairs. The second shipment, also from Nigeria, contained 14 tusks ranging from 6-20 inches in length, and 200 pieces of tusks, weighing 65 pounds in total, valued at up to US\$ 145,000, which were found concealed in beaded wooden statues. Both shipments arrived at Los Angeles International Airport via Lufthansa Cargo. A Gambian national was convicted of smuggling and sentenced to prison for a day and a year. A Liberian national accomplice was fined US\$ 3000 and ordered to serve four months. According to Customs, this was the largest seizure of ivory in the U.S. since 1989. Source: Court documents, Customs officials. Cited in: Environmental News Service, 6 March 2002 and Associated Press, 3 May 2001.

- India.** An undisclosed number of ivory carvings were seized from a farmer in Mumbai in May, along with a tiger skin and other wildlife contraband. The farmer was arrested, spent 7 days in jail, and was released on bail. Source: Wildlife Trust of India. Cited in: WTI Press Release, 6 June 2001.
- Kenya.** 11 tusks were seized by local police and the Kenya Wildlife Service in Kisumu town on 22 May. Source: Police and Kenya Wildlife Service. Cited in: The Nation, 23 May 2001.
- India.** 47 pieces of ivory bangles, worth Rs 2 lakh, were seized by Mumbai Airport Customs officials from a Congo resident who revealed that he imported such items every three months from Congo and other African countries, claiming them as gifts. Customs officials also seized a parcel originating in Zimbabwe and destined for China, which was labelled as wood carvings but contained ivory weighing 8 kg and valued at Rs 3 lakh. Source: Western Region Deputy Director S.K. Neeraj. Cited in: The Times of India, 25 May 2001.
- India.** 35 kg of ivory tusks were seized from two youths who admitted to poaching elephants in the Corbett Tiger Reserve. They used a 12-bore gun and poisoned darts to kill the elephants. Source: Udham Singh Nagar police, Wildlife Trust of India. Cited in: The Times of India, 8 June 2001.
- Djibouti.** 16 pieces of ivory were seized during a government raid on a city centre marketplace in June 2001. Source: Police and officials from the Ministère de l'Habitat, de l'Urbanisme, de l'Environnement et de l'Aménagement du Territoire Cited in: Environmental News Service, 13 June 2001.
- China.** 244 African ivory "products", weighing 30 kg, and declared as teak from Singapore, were seized by Wenzhou Customs, Zhejiang Province on June 4th. Another shipment, containing three pieces of ivory and four ivory combs, was also seized. Source: Wenzhou Customs. Cited in: People's Daily Online, 9 July 2001.
- Uganda.** 91 tusks, weighing 213 kg, were seized by airport police at Entebbe International Airport in June. A West African, who checked in four bags containing the ivory, escaped capture. Five airport officials and an employee of Ethiopian Airlines were arrested as suspected accomplices. The ivory was destined for Bangkok, Thailand via Addis Ababa on an Ethiopian Airlines plane. Source: Sued Tambwe, police commandant at the airport and Karl Karugaba, Uganda Wildlife Authority law enforcement officer. Cited in: New Vision (Kampala) 12 July 2001 and 2 July 2001; Reuters, 13 July 2001.
- China.** 250 pieces of ivory and ivory products, weighing 40 kg, were seized by Hangzhou Customs officials between 1 June and 1 August. This includes 3.56 kg of ivory that was seized by Hangzhou Customs officials from a parcel that arrived in China on 30 July from Mali. Source: Hangzhou Customs. Cited in: Xinhua, 1 August 2001.
- China.** 1533 pieces of ivory and ivory products were confiscated in 20 smuggling cases conducted by Shanghai Pudong Airport Customs between 1 January and 29 July 2001. In one case in June, a Chinese passenger tried to smuggle dozens of "handicrafts" by hiding them in two milk powder cans. Another passenger had hidden two pieces of ivory in his luggage. Source: Shanghai Pudong Airport Customs and Shanghai Customs. Cited in: People's Daily Online, 29 July 2001 and 30 September 2001.
- China.** Shanghai Customs officials said that they had uncovered 58 cases involving the smuggling of ivory and ivory products, confiscating 39 pieces of ivory and 4700 "handicrafts" since 1 January. Most of the smugglers are Chinese businessmen, workers and visitors returning from Africa. Source: Shanghai Customs Officials. Cited in: Xinhua, 30 August 2001 and People's Daily Online, 30 September 2001.



- Belgium.** A shipment containing 44 – 49 (conflicting accounts) carved and 29 uncarved tusks, weighing 150 kg, and worth almost US\$ 881,100, were intercepted in Brussels. 15 Chinese doctors, who had been working in Mali, were detained on smuggling charges. The tusks were contained in a shipment of personal effects being shipped by air cargo from Mali to China, via Brussels. The doctors were released and returned to China. Chinese authorities vowed to investigate whether the doctors were involved in the illegal ivory trade. Source: Prosecutors in Brussels, Customs officials in China. Cited in: BBC News, 7 August 2001 and China Daily, 17 August 2001.
- Namibia.** A piece of ivory measuring 10 cm, and three rhino horns, were confiscated from an Austrian police officer in August 2001 at the Hosea Kutak International Airport. The man pleaded guilty and was fined N\$5000. Source: Not given. Cited in: The Namibian, 21 August 2001.
- Botswana.** Two tusks were seized from poachers armed with AK-47 rifles in Chobe Forestry Reserve on 12 September. Source: Police Officer Commanding, Senior Superintendent Olefihle Maswabi. Cited in: Botswana Daily News Online, 19 September 2001.
- Switzerland.** 20 tusks, weighing 72 kg, and 3.7 kg of carved ivory were seized from a shipment travelling by Swiss Air from Nairobi to Beijing, China, via Zurich on 24 September. No one was arrested because it was a transit flight. Customs officials said that 300 to 400 kg of ivory is seized annually at the Zurich airport. Source: Swiss customs officials. Cited in: Neue Luzerner Zeitung (New Luzerner Newspaper, Zurich), 22 March 2002.
- Tanzania.** A shipment containing 42 tusks, weighing 580 kg, poached from 21 elephants in the Rifiji Valley part of the Selous Game Reserve, was confiscated by authorities at the airport in October. According to the air way bill, the shipment was destined for the Moroccan Embassy in Bangkok. The shipment was labelled as containing gemstones but airport staff alerted police when the shipment weighed much more than it should have. Source: Airport authorities, police. Cited in: Personal communication, Jo Hastie, Environmental Investigation Agency, 5 October 2001.
- Netherlands.** An ivory necklace, bracelet and two worked tusks were seized by Dutch Customs at Schiphol Airport. Source: ETIS database. Cited in: CITES Animals Committee AC18 Doc. 5.1, Regional Reports: Africa.
- South Africa.** 22 tusks, weighing 140 kg and worth 200,000 Rand, possibly having originated in Botswana, were found in a storeroom in Pietersburg, Northern Province. Source: Captain Ronel Otto, provincial police spokeswoman. Cited in: African Eye News Service, 15 October 2001.
- Thailand.** 30 tusks originating from Kenya, weighing 203 kg, valued at 5 million Baht (US\$ 115,000) were intercepted by customs officers at Don Muang airport on 7 November. Source: Customs officers. Cited in: Bangkok Post, 8 November 2001.
- Egypt.** 230 tusks, weighing 850 kg were seized in Aswan on 10 November and the trader was arrested. The same trader was arrested on 28 March 2000 for possessing 137.4 kg of ivory. Source, Dr. Samy El-Fellaly, Head of Egyptian CITES Management Authority. Cited in: Personal communication.
- India.** Two tusks, measuring 1.37 m, were seized by police in Uttaranchal on 4 December 2001. Source: Wildlife Protection Society of India (WPSI). Four traders and poachers were arrested. Cited in: WPSI press release, 4 December 2001.

**United States.** Over the course of the year 2001, the following elephant ivory objects were seized upon import to the United States: 83 pieces of ivory jewellery, 184 ivory carvings, 556 ivory pieces (includes 402 ivory pieces in a shipment from Nigeria which presumably relate to the case in April, details noted above), 103 ivory piano keys, 240 teeth, 1 trophy, and 13 tusks. Source: U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Law Enforcement Division analysed by The Humane Society of the United States.

**Namibia.** Over the course of the year 2001, 19 tusks were seized by the government; 16 of these weighed a total of 128.3 kg, and three had unrecorded weights. In addition, four ivory pieces weighing 6.10 kg were also seized. Source: Namibian Police Protected Resources Unit. Cited in: Report of the Unit.

## 2000

**Egypt.** 4 raw or worked ivory pieces, weighing 10 kg, were seized from a U.S. national who attempted to export them on 3 January. 2 ivory pieces were seized from a French national who tried to export them on 26 January. Source: Egyptian Management Authority. Cited in: Pachyderm, No. 28, Jan-Jun 2000.

**India.** 16 tusks, worth Rs 80,000 crore from the Teen Hath Naka area in January. Two people were arrested. Source: Police. Cited in: The Times of India , 27 January 2000.

**Kenya.** 3 tusks were seized in Garissa in early January. Source: Kenya Wildlife Service. Cited in: Associated Press, 19 January 2000.

**Egypt.** 7 raw or worked ivory pieces, weighing 30 kg, were seized from a Turkish national who tried to export them on 8 February. 35 raw or worked ivory pieces were seized from a Saudi Arabian national who tried to export them on 13 February. Source: Egyptian Management Authority. Cited in: Pachyderm, No. 28, Jan-Jun 2000.

**Egypt.** 78 pieces of tusks, weighing 137.4 kg, ranging in size from 10-51 inches in length, and worth US\$215,000, were seized in Aswan on 28 March. Source: Dr. Samy El-Fellaly, CITES Management Authority for Egypt. Cited in: Associated Press, 29 March 2000 and personal communication.

**Egypt.** 2 raw or worked ivory pieces were seized from an Egyptian national who tried to export them on 31 March, and 2 additional pieces, weighing 8 kg, were seized from another Egyptian national who tried to export them on 1 April. Source: Egyptian CITES Management Authority. Cited in: Pachyderm, No. 28, Jan-Jun 2000.

**Democratic Republic of the Congo.** In 2001 a United Nations Panel of Experts reported that two tons (sic) of elephant tusks were traced in the Bukavu area late in 2000. By April 2000, about three tons (sic) of tusks - which may or may not include the two tons from Bukavu - were temporarily seized by RCD-ML in Isiro. After strong pressure from Uganda, the cargo was released and transferred to Kampala. Source: United Nations. Cited in: Report of the Panel of Experts on the Illegal Exploitation of Natural Resources and Other Forms of Wealth of the Democratic Republic of the Congo, 2001

**Japan.** 132 sections of tusks, weighing 500 kg, were seized in Tokyo. A Japanese national and a British national of Hong Kong origin were arrested on suspicion of smuggling the ivory from Singapore into Japan by boat. Tokyo Customhouse officials said it was the second-largest seizure of ivory ever made. The Japanese national involved, who is a board member of one of the major ivory industry organisations in Japan, was fined 300,000 yen (about US\$ 2,700). Source: Customs officials and Japan Wildlife Conservation Society (JWCS). Cited in: Yomiuri Shimbun, 27 April 2000; and personal communication with JWCS.

- Thailand.** 112 pieces of raw elephant ivory tusks, weighing 1,078 pounds (490 kg), valued at more than US\$131,000 (5 million bath), were found on April 28th by Thai Customs officials at Bangkok airport. The ivory was concealed beneath layers of uncut gemstones in boxes freighted from Zambia. A Guinean national was arrested when he tried to pick up the shipment, but was later released by Thai authorities. Under Thai law, smugglers can be released if they give the goods to the authorities. Source: Rapee Asumpinpong, Deputy Director General of Thai Customs. Cited in: Nando Times, 1 May 2000 and Independent Online South Africa, 1 May 2000.
- Cameroon.** Two tusks, each measuring 0.9 m (one yard) long were confiscated from a burlap sack in the back of a poacher's truck. The truck was stopped at an anti-poaching roadblock in Yokadouma. Source: Mboh Dandjouma, Cameroonian forest ranger. Cited in: Chicago Tribune, 6 May 2000.
- Taiwan.** 332 raw tusks and cut ivory, weighing 2,160 kg, were seized by the Keelung Customs Bureau at Kaohsiung Harbour in south Taiwan on 5 May from a ship that arrived from Douala, Cameroon. The shipment was labelled as containing wood planks. Customs officials found the ivory concealed under the planks. According to Customs officials, this was the largest haul of smuggled ivory since 1994. Source: Keelung Customs Bureau. Cited in: Society for Wildlife and Nature newsletter, Volume 8, No. 2, June 2000.
- China.** 507 kg of raw ivory of African origin, cut into pieces 1 m in length, was seized on 16 May in Shenzhen, near Hong Kong. Shenzhen Customs officials found it in a truck travelling between Guangzhou and Shenzhen. Two people were arrested. Source: Shenzhen Customs officials. Cited in: XINHUA, 23 May 2000.
- Taiwan.** 3 elephant tusks, weighing 26 kg, were seized by the Keelung Customs Bureau when inspecting a shipment of coir palm seeds. Source: Keelung Customs Bureau. Cited in: Society for Wildlife and Nature newsletter, Volume 8, No. 2 June 2000.
- Vanuatu.** 67 tusks were seized from a French national by the Vanuatu Maritime Authority on 24<sup>th</sup> June. Source: Vanuatu Maritime Authority. Cited in: Personal communication, 28 June 2000.
- Chile.** Eight pieces of ivory were seized in the city of Los Angeles, Chile, in June. Source: Servicio Arcola y Ganadero, Chile. Cited in: Personal communication, May 2002
- Egypt.** 1441 pieces of tusks, weighing 1576 kg, were seized in Kom Ombo on 12 August. Two Egyptian nationals and one Sudanese national were arrested for smuggling the ivory from Sudan. The Ministry of Agriculture said it was the largest seizure ever in Egypt. Source: Ministry of Agriculture. Cited in: Ministry of Agriculture statement, 15 August 2000; Sapa-Associated Press, 15 August 2000; and personal communication.
- Democratic Republic of the Congo.** A United Nations Panel of Experts reported that 800 kg of ivory tusks were found in a vehicle of the Uganda People's Defence Force (UNDF) Col. Mugenyi in Garamba National Park in August 2000. The UNDF denied the allegation. Source: United Nations Panel of Experts, Army Commander Maj. Gen. Jeje Odongo (UNDF). Cited in: The Monitor (Kampala), 13 August 2001.
- Zambia.** 14 pieces of tusks were seized by police from a vehicle travelling on the Mumbwa-Lusaka road toward Lusaka. Five people were arrested. Source: Ryan Chitoba, Central Province police chief. Cited in: Times of Zambia, 23 August 2000.

- Zambia.** 63 tusks were seized in an anti-poaching campaign between January and July. 700 poachers were arrested and 239 firearms were seized. Source: Henry Mwima, Zambian Wildlife Authority. Cited in: Times of Zambia, 29 August 2000.
- Egypt.** 2 pieces of ivory were confiscated on 15 September 2000. Source: Egyptian Customs officials. Cited in: Personal communication.
- Zambia.** 93 tusks were seized in anti-poaching operations between October and December 2000. Source: Tourism Minister, Michael Mabenga. Cited in: The Post (Lusaka), 17 May 2001.
- Canada.** 4,400 pieces of jewellery made from elephant ivory, worth about \$75,000, were seized from a container at the Halifax waterfront. The ivory, including necklaces, bracelets, earrings, small elephant carvings, and Disney characters, was imported from Bremmerhaven, Germany, in August. Based on shipping documents, Customs authorities suspect it originated in Hong Kong and was destined for jewellery shops in Ontario. According to Les Sampson, coordinator of the Wildlife Trade Enforcement section of Environment Canada, this is the most significant ivory seizure ever made in Canada. Source: Customs and Environment Canada officials. Cited in: Halifax Herald, 1 December 2000 and Canada News, 1 December 2000.
- United States.** 72 ivory carvings, valued at more than US\$ 200,000, were seized from a shipment arriving at John F. Kennedy International Airport in New York City from the Ivory Coast in January. The carvings were disguised in a sand and lacquer-like substance and painted to resemble stone carvings. An Ivory Coast national was convicted of smuggling and sentenced to one day and one year in prison. Source: U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, U.S. Customs Service. Cited in: U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service press release, 9 August 2000.
- South Africa.** 8 elephant tusks were seized from five Pretoria men, who were arrested. Source: South African Police Service's Endangered Species Protection Unit. Cited in: The Pretoria News, 12 September 2000.
- China.** 25 pieces of African ivory, weighing 123 kg, were seized from a traveller at Pudong International Airport in October, after he landed there from Benin via Mexico. The man was found guilty, convicted, sentenced to 6 years in prison, and fined 50,000 yuan (about US\$ 6000). Source: Shanghai Customs Officials and the Shanghai No. 1 Intermediate Court. Cited in: Xinhua, 30 August 2001.
- Cameroon.** 42 elephant tusks were seized by officers of the Ministry of Environment and Forests in Lobeke National Park, the biggest seizure ever reported in the area. Six additional tusks were seized in the northern part of the Park. Source: Dr. Leonard Usongon, WWF Project Leader in Lobeke. Cited in: The Independent (Bangladesh), 13 November 2000.
- Kenya.** 16 elephant ivory tusks were confiscated from six Kenya Wildlife Service wardens-turned-poachers on December 11th. The wardens were arrested. Source: John Wanguku, Kenya Wildlife Service. Cited in: Panafrican News Agency, 12 December 2000.
- United States.** Over the course of the year 2000, the following elephant ivory objects were seized upon import into the United States: 96 pieces of ivory jewellery, 170 ivory carvings (not including those mentioned elsewhere in this document), 12 ivory pieces, 2 teeth, 1 trophy and 17 tusks. Source: U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, Law Enforcement Division, analysed by The Humane Society of the United States.
- Namibia.** Over the course of the year 2000, 43 tusks were seized by the government; 16 of these weighed a total of 73.55 kg, while the weight of the remaining 27 tusks was not recorded. Source: Namibian Police Protected Resources Unit. Cited in: Report of the Unit.

### 3.3.2 Poaching Incidents

Summary of reported poaching* incidents, 1 January 2000 to 30 April 2002	
No. African elephants reported poached	965
No. Asian elephants reported poached	39

\* Poaching as a result of human-elephant conflict is not included unless the tusks were taken. Figures used in this summary are from the poaching incidents detailed below.

#### 2002

**Namibia.** One elephant calf was poached in Khorixas on 11 February 2002. Source: Namibian Police Protected Resources Unit. Cited in: Report of the Unit.

**Democratic Republic of Congo.** Villagers along the Adama-Bili road in northern DRC report that all elephants within 150 km of the border with Central African Republic (CAR) have been eliminated by CAR-based poaching gangs, who have killed 500-1000 elephants in the last three years. In mid-March 2002, villagers reported seeing two camel caravans, led by northern Sudanese poaching gangs, in Banangi, CAR (55 km north of Zemio), heading south to Gwane and Ango, DRC, and poaching along the way. Poaching gangs arrive every year at the end of the dry season. They sell elephant meat locally and take the ivory back. Source: Karl Amman. Cited in: Report to Save the Elephants, 28 March 2002.

**Zimbabwe.** 7 elephants were killed by poachers during March 2002. Cited in: The Harare Herald, April 29 2002

**Kenya.** Ten elephants were poached on 28 March 2002 in Tsavo East National Park. The tusks were hacked off and buried one km away. The poachers were tracked down by the Kenya Wildlife Service and one was killed. The tusks were recovered. The deceased poacher carried documents that indicated he had come from Somalia. Source: Kenya Wildlife Service (KWS). Cited in: KWS Press Release, 18 April 2002.

**Kenya.** Five elephants were poached between 18 February and 18 April in the Samburu district. The tusks were recovered by the Kenya Wildlife Service. The poachers were local residents. Source: Kenya Wildlife Service (KWS). Cited in: KWS Press Release, 18 April 2002.

**Zimbabwe.** An elephant was killed by poachers at a lodge in Chewore in April 2002. They were reportedly using a stolen vehicle. Source: Zimbabwe Police. Cited in: The Harare Herald, April 29 2002

**Kenya.** On 28 April, four elephant poachers were killed in an exchange of gun-fire with game rangers at Tsavo East National Park. Source: Kenya Wildlife Service. Cited in: SAPA-AFP Press Report, 28 April 2002.

**Zimbabwe.** Between 1<sup>st</sup> August 2001 and 23<sup>rd</sup> May 2002, 5 elephants were poached in the Save Valley Conservancy. Numerous ranches in the Conservancy are now "no-go" areas, for which no information is obtainable. The 5 elephants should therefore be regarded as the minimum. Source: Save Valley Conservancy. Cited in: Crime Statistics Update

## 2001

**India.** Five male elephants were killed in February in Corbett Tiger Reserve. The elephants were killed with poison-tipped nails fired by poachers. Electric saws were used to remove the tusks. Sources: Vivek Menon, Wildlife Trust of India; B.S. Koshiyari, Uttaranchal Chief Minister, and Anil Raturi, Uttaranchal D.I.G. Cited in: The Times of India, 13 February 2001 and The Indian Express, 14 December 2001.

**Democratic Republic of the Congo.** 300 elephants were killed in Kahuzi-Biega National Park, leaving as few as 5 elephants in the Park. Source: Molemba Mbo, President, Congolese Institute for Nature Conservation. Cited in: Panafrican News Agency, 7 March 2001. A survey by the Wildlife Conservation Society of the elephant population of Kahuzi-Biega National Park revealed that no elephants remain in the Park. In 1996, the Park had 3600 elephants. Source: The Gorilla (published by Berggorilla & Regenwald Direkthilfe, Germany). Cited in: The Saturday Star (SAPA-AFP), 21 May 2001.

**Cambodia.** 2 elephants were poached on 4 August and their tusks removed. The poaching occurred 30 km from the Thai-Cambodian border near Anlong Reap village. Ben Hammond, environmental advisor to the Pursat Department of the Environment who investigated the killings said, "according to rangers, there is more hunting, more organized hunting and more elephants and tigers being killed in the Cardamom Mountains than ever before."

There are unconfirmed reports of two other elephants killed in the area. Source: Ben Hammond, Pursat Department of the Environment. Cited in: Phnom Penh Post, 28 September – 11 October, 2001.

**Kenya.** 38 elephants were poached in the northern part of Kenya in 2001. Source: Kenya Wildlife Service. Cited in: The Guardian, 1 February 2002.

**Kenya.** A further 19 elephants were poached in various parts of Kenya during 2001. Source: Kenya Wildlife Service data

**Cambodia.** Between May 2000 and October 2001, 26 elephants were killed in three of Cambodia's 24 provinces. Two of the elephants were killed in the Phnom Samkos Wildlife Sanctuary, where rangers heard elephant screams and gunfire on 4<sup>th</sup> August. Two days later the carcass of one female and one male were found with tusks and tails missing. Source: Hunter Weiler, Cat Action Treasury; Pursat Department of Environment officials. Cited in: Reuters, 13 December 2001; The Post, 10 September 2001.

**Tanzania.** A large bull elephant was poached on 1 October in the Lake Natron Game Controlled Area, about 15 km from the border with Kenya. Six poachers shot the elephant and removed its tusks with a power saw. Source: African Wildlife Foundation (AWF). Cited in: AWF Press Release, 7 November 2001.

**Democratic Republic of the Congo.** Between August and mid-November 2001, an estimated two dozen elephants were killed by soldiers of the Front for the Liberation of the Congo (a Ugandan-backed rebel movement), camped 120 km southwest of Bili, DRC. In mid-November, the soldiers offered ivory to traders in Bili. In early December, the soldiers left with an estimated 12 tusks, which they planned to export by air from Buta, DRC to Uganda. Source: Karl Amman. Cited in: Report to Save the Elephants, 17 January 2002.

**India.** Two male elephants were killed in Rajaji National Park on 8 December 2001. The elephants were poisoned and their tusks removed with axes. Mud tracks in the forest show that one of the elephants, a sub-adult male, dragged itself on its forelegs for nearly half a mile before collapsing. The second elephant was a 35-five year old bull. Source: B.S. Koshiyari, Uttaranchal Chief Minister, and Anil Raturi, Uttaranchal D.I.G. Cited in: The Indian Express, 14 December 2001 and Environmental News Service, 10 December 2001.

## 2000

**Kenya.** 8 elephants were killed in Kora National Park. Poachers buried the ivory. Source: Kenya Wildlife Service. Cited in: Kenya Wildlife Service Press Release, 19 January 2000 and Reuters, 2 January 2000.

**India.** Two elephants were killed in reserve forests in the Vasudevanallur region in early March. Tusks were removed by a motor-driven saw and driven by jeep to Kerala. Four poachers were arrested. Source: Forest Department officials. Cited in: Hindu, 21 March 2000.

**Zimbabwe.** Two elephants were poached by squatters in the Save Valley Conservancy, and their tusks removed, between April and July 2000. Source: Roger Whittal, whose ranch forms part of the Conservancy. Cited in: Electronic Telegraph, 13 July 2000.

**Zimbabwe.** One elephant was found poached in Save Valley Conservancy in August; one of its tusks was removed. Source: Conservancy officials. Cited in: Independent News, 12 August 2000.

**Zimbabwe.** 14 elephants were poached by a Zambian poaching gang in the Zambezi Valley in August 2000. One poacher was caught and sentenced to three years in jail, while the rest escaped. Cited in: The Harare Herald, April 29 2002

**Democratic Republic of Congo.** Two elephants were killed in August in the Okapi Faunal Reserve. Source: Terese Hart, Wildlife Conservation Society. Cited in: Personal communication, 10 August 2000.

**Angola.** 30 elephants were killed in Bicuar National Park between July and September. Source: Severino Bango, Institute for Forest Development. Cited in: Pan African News Agency, 11 September 2000.

**India.** Three male elephants were killed between October and December in Corbett Tiger Reserve. Source: Vivek Menon, Wildlife Trust of India. Cited in: The Times of India, 13 February 2001.

**India.** One large male elephant was killed with five bullets in Buxa Tiger Reserve and his tusks were taken by poachers. Source: Alipurduar Nature Club secretary A. Dutta. Cited in: Times of India, 17 December 2000.

### 3.4 Actual or potential trade impacts

See "Rationale" on page 1 of this proposal.

### 3.5 Captive breeding for commercial purposes (outside country of origin)

None known. The species does not breed or survive well in captivity, captive populations are not self-sustaining, and most African elephants in zoos were recruited from wild populations.

## 4. Conservation and Management

### 4.1 Legal status

#### 4.1.1 National

Some range States provide the species with full protection from take and trade whilst others allow the legal sale of ivory and other elephant products.

#### 4.1.2 International

All populations are on CITES Appendix I except those of Botswana, Namibia, South Africa and Zimbabwe, which are on Appendix II (subject to the Annotations noted in Section 3.2 above).

### 4.2 Species management

#### 4.2.1 Population monitoring

The ability of range States to monitor elephant populations varies greatly. The African Elephant Database, housed at the United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), stores data from elephant population surveys beginning in 1976. The most recent data are from 1998 (Barnes et al. 1998) (see Table 1).

The Monitoring of Illegal Killing of Elephants (MIKE) project was agreed by the Parties in 1997, as a method of monitoring trends in elephant poaching over a long period. Projected to cost over US\$13 million, the project has begun to operate in East, Central and Southern Africa, but has not yet begun in West Africa or Asia. There are at present no funds available for Asia and only 18 months of funding available for MIKE as a whole (Nigel Hunter, personal communication to Paula Kahumbu, Kenya Wildlife Service). Whilst it is recognized that MIKE will be unable to establish with certainty the cause(s) of any increase in poaching, it may eventually provide useful data on poaching trends. However, this will require many years of data collection due to the lack of existing baseline data. Indeed, in some areas where MIKE is being implemented, baseline data are just now beginning to be collected (*ibid*). In addition, some range States have difficulty in implementing MIKE at all.

#### 4.2.2 Habitat conservation

The issue of habitat conservation, though of vital concern to all elephant range States, is not directly relevant to this proposal.

#### 4.2.3 Management measures

The ability of range States to manage elephant populations, and to regulate legal take, varies greatly.

### 4.3 Control measures

#### 4.3.1 International trade

In addition to CITES, international trade control measures include the Lusaka Agreement on Cooperative Enforcement Operations Directed at Illegal Trade in Wild Fauna and Flora and Interpol.



#### 4.3.2 Domestic measures

Some range States, such as South Africa, have specialised units dedicated to investigating illegal domestic and international trade. However, most do not.

#### 5. Information on Similar Species

The Asian elephant has been listed on CITES Appendix I since 1976.

#### 6. Other Comments

-----

#### 7. Additional Remarks

-----

#### 8. References

African Elephant and Rhino Specialist Group, 1987. Elephant Population Estimates, Trends, Ivory Quotas and Harvests. Report to the CITES Secretariat from the African Elephant and Rhino Specialist Group. Doc. 6.21, Annex 2, sixth meeting of the Conference of the Parties, Ottawa.

Alexandre, D-Y. 1978. Le role disseminateur des elephants en foret de Tai, Cote-d'Ivoire. La Terre et la Vie 32: 47-72.

Barnes, R.F.W., G.C.Craig, H.T.Dublin, G.Overton, W.Simons, and C.R. Thouless. 1998. African Elephant Database 1998. IUCN/SSC African Elephant Specialist Group. IUCN, Gland, Switzerland and Cambridge, UK

Bourgoin, P., 1936. Les principaux Animaux de Chasse de l'Afrique Noire. Edition de Bretagne, Lorient.  
Bryden, H.A., 1903. The decline and fall of the Southern African elephant. Fortnightly Review 79:100-108.

Burrill, A. and I. Douglas-Hamilton, 1987. African elephant database project. Global Information Database, Case Study Series No. 3. Global Environment Monitoring System, United National Environment Programme, Nairobi, Kenya.

Carroll, R.W., 1988. Elephants of the Dzanga-Sangha dense forest of south-western Central African Republic. Pachyderm 10:12-15.

Cumming, D.H.M. and P. Jackson (eds.), 1984. The Status and Conservation of Africa's Elephants and Rhinos. International Union for the Conservation of Nature and Natural Resources, Gland, Switzerland.

Douglas-Hamilton, I., 1979. African Elephant Ivory Trade - Final Report to the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service. Typescript.

Martin, E. 1985. Establishment of African ivory export quotas and associated control procedures. In African Elephants, CITES and the Ivory Trade. CITES Secretariat, Lausanne, Switzerland.

Martin, E. and D. Stiles. 2002. The South and Southeast Asian Ivory Markets. Save the Elephants, Nairobi and London.

Mauny, R.A., 1956. Repartition de la grande fauna Ethiopienne du nord-ouest africaine du peoleolithique a nos jours. Proc. 3rd Pan-African Congr. Prehistory, pp. 102-105.

Said, M.Y., R.N. Chungue, G.C. Craig, C.R. Thouless, R.F.W. Barnes and H.T. Dublin, 1995. African Elephant Database. African Elephant Specialist Group, Species Survival Commission, IUCN-The World Conservation Union, Gland, Switzerland.