



NOTIFICATION TO THE PARTIES

No. 2018/068

Geneva, 19 July 2018

CONCERNING:

Support for Elephant Trade Information System (ETIS)

1. In the context of its supervision of the Elephant Trade Information System (ETIS), established under Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17) on *Trade in elephant specimens*, the Standing Committee, at its 69th meeting (SC69, Geneva, November 2017), requested TRAFFIC, contingent on the provision of external funding, to:
 - a) *make available the programming code in the ETIS analysis through a repository hosting service, together with appropriate annotations and supporting documentation. This will be augmented with links to existing documents explaining the methods used in the analyses;*
 - b) *finalise the delivery of an on-line facility for Parties to access, download or upload seizure data in a timely manner. Access will be restricted to designated individuals of CITES Management Authorities. Access to data will be provided in accordance with the data access policy outlined in Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17);*
 - c) *send the ETIS report to CoP18 to all Parties identified as potentially requiring attention in the NIAP process at least 30 days prior to the release of the report on the CITES website; and*
 - d) *produce materials that explain in a stepwise manner the ETIS analysis and conceptual framework. Materials will be targeted at a non-technical audience, in three languages, and made freely and widely available.*
2. The Standing Committee requested all Parties to take note that the recommended activities concerning ETIS are priorities, but will only take place if additional funding can be provided to TRAFFIC.
3. TRAFFIC developed a funding strategy that contains detailed information on the resources required to implement the Standing Committee's recommendations. It is attached as an Annex to this Notification (English only).
4. Since SC69, Belgium has indicated that it would provide funding to support the development of the ETIS website as an on-line facility (recommendation b) of the Standing Committee). The European Union, through the MIKES project, is also contributing to the implementation of the recommended activities.
5. The Secretariat hereby invites Parties, donor agencies, intergovernmental and non-governmental organizations, and other appropriate donors to provide financial support to TRAFFIC for its implementation of the above-mentioned recommendations concerning ETIS. Further information can be obtained from: tom.milliken@traffic.org.

PROJECT NAME:	Implementing the Requests to ETIS in SC69 Com. 11
PROJECT EXECUTANT:	TRAFFIC International
PROJECT SUPERVISOR:	Tom Milliken, TRAFFIC Elephant and Rhino Programme lead and ETIS Director
PROJECT COLLABORATORS:	CITES Secretariat /CITES Parties
PROJECT DURATION:	01 January 2018 – 31 December 2019
TOTAL BUDGET REQUESTED:	USD262,442 over two years (of which USD87,734 is already at hand through funding support from the European Union and the Government of Belgium; balance to fund USD174,708)

BACKGROUND:

The CITES Parties, at the tenth meeting of the Conference of the Parties in June 1997, mandated in Resolution Conf. 10.10 the creation of two elephant monitoring programmes to support future decision-making under the Convention. The Elephant Trade Information System (ETIS), which from its inception has been developed and operated by TRAFFIC on behalf of the Parties, tracks illegal trade in ivory, whilst Monitoring the Illegal Killing of Elephants (MIKE), which is run by the CITES MIKE programme, addresses the issue of elephant poaching. These two long-term programmes are charged with meeting the following objectives:

- *measuring and recording levels and trends, and changes in levels and trends, of illegal elephant killing [i.e. MIKE] and trade in ivory and other elephant specimens [i.e. ETIS] in elephant range States, ivory consumer States and ivory transit States;*
- *assessing whether and to what extent observed trends are related to measures concerning elephants and trade in elephant specimens taken under the auspices of CITES, changes in the listing of elephant populations in the CITES Appendices, or the conduct of legal international trade in ivory;*
- *establishing an information base to support the making of decisions on appropriate management, protection and enforcement needs; and*
- *building capacity in elephant range States and, as applicable, countries involved in trade in elephant specimens, to implement and make use of MIKE and ETIS in managing elephants and enhancing enforcement.*

From the outset, Annex 1 to Resolution Conf. 10.10 established a framework under which ETIS operates, with paragraph 7 stating: “A funding mechanism will be established to ensure that ETIS is fully operational.” However, over the more than two decades of its operation, a formal funding mechanism has never been established for ETIS under the Convention. The operation and management of ETIS is not part of the Secretariat’s budget, although the Secretariat has made some

resources available to ETIS on occasions in the past. More recently, joint proposals have been developed in collaboration with the CITES MIKE Programme to secure part of the ETIS funding needs under cooperative arrangements. For the most part, however, TRAFFIC has independently sought funding to support the bulk of the ETIS operation since its inception. In this regard, TRAFFIC would like to acknowledge with gratitude the support from the Governments of the United Kingdom (Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs – DEFRA and the Darwin Initiative), the United States (the Department of State, and the Fish and Wildlife Service's African Elephant Conservation Fund), the European Union through support to the MIKES Project, and WWF, all of which have financially supported the ETIS programme to fulfil its mandate in recent years.

THE PRESENT CHALLENGE:

At the 69th meeting of the CITES Standing Committee (SC69), the Parties adopted SC69 Com. 11 which, in paragraph 5, included the following four requests to TRAFFIC:

5. *Contingent on the provision of external funding, the MIKE and ETIS Subgroup recommend that Standing Committee request TRAFFIC to:*
 - a) *Make available the programming code in the ETIS analysis through a repository hosting service, together with appropriate annotations and supporting documentation. This will be augmented with links to existing documents explaining the methods used in the analyses.*
 - b) *Finalise the delivery of an on-line facility for Parties to access, download or upload seizure data. Access will be restricted to designated individuals of CITES Management Authorities. Access to data will be provided in accordance with the data access policy outlined in Resolution Conf. 10:10 (Rev. CoP17).*
 - c) *Send the ETIS report to CoP18 to all Parties identified as potentially requiring attention in the NIAP process at least 30 days prior to the release of the report on the CITES website.*
 - d) *Produce materials that explain in a stepwise manner the ETIS analysis and conceptual framework. Materials will be targeted at a non-technical audience, in three languages, and made freely and widely available.*

This funding proposal is directed to the CITES Parties and seeks to obtain the external funding necessary to action and implement three of the four activities that are mandated in paragraph 5 of SC69 Com. 11. In terms of the funding request, TRAFFIC believes that the execution of item b) in the paragraph above will result in the greatest long-term benefit to the CITES Parties as it will allow them access to their data whenever they need it.

JUSTIFICATION:

ETIS aims to be an exemplary 'best practice' trade monitoring system and to provide a solid platform for evidence-based decision-making within CITES. One of the analytical techniques used to help define countries most heavily implicated in illegal ivory trade is a statistical method called cluster analysis. Through cluster analysis, countries with similar characteristics concerning their roles in the illegal ivory trade become grouped together, and the country groups that link to the greatest quantities of illegal ivory observed in the ETIS trade patterns in specific periods of time have been classified as priorities for further examination of underlying trade dynamics and causative factors. As a consequence of the cluster analysis presented in ETIS reports to CITES CoPs, since CoP16 in 2013, the Parties have instigated a National Ivory Action Plan (NIAP) process which is now governed by the framework established in Annex 3 of Resolution Conf. 10.10 (Rev. CoP17). Accordingly, Step 1 on the "Identification of Parties to participate in the National Ivory Action Plans Process" states that "the

foundation for identifying Parties to participate in the National Ivory Action Plans Process (NIAP) process is the ETIS report submitted to each meeting of the Conference of the Parties under this Resolution". The cluster analysis in the ETIS report serves to define potential participants in the NIAP process, whilst the CITES Parties through the Standing Committee determine participation in the NIAP process following an independent review led by the CITES Secretariat. The NIAP countries are charged with developing national action plans that examine the adequacy of legislation and policy, law enforcement strategies and implementation, public awareness, corruption and various other factors that might facilitate illegal trade in elephant ivory.

Delivering the four components mandated by the CITES Parties in SC69 Com. 11 serves to foster greater understanding of the methodological approaches used by TRAFFIC in the delivery of ETIS results into CITES processes. Achieving the SC69 requests to ETIS will also result in greater and immediate access by the Parties to the ETIS data that relates to their countries. Following six years of record high levels of illegal ivory trade, it is imperative to support ETIS at a moment of continuing crisis for elephant conservation. Further, progress and delivery of this project is particularly important in the build-up to the 70th meeting of the CITES Standing Committee in October 2018 and the 18th meeting of the CITES Conference of the Parties (CoP18) to be held in May 2019.

OUTPUTS:

The specific outputs of this project will be the delivery, over the next two years, of the four activities described in SC69 Com. 11. TRAFFIC's approach and budget for delivering each activity is described as follows:

Activity 1: Provision of the ETIS Code

Issue and Work Plan: It is recognised that neither TRAFFIC nor the CITES Secretariat currently make the codes that underpin the ETIS or MIKE analyses that are delivered into CITES fora publicly available. However, it is agreed that there is a need to address this issue going forward in the broader interest of transparency and openness. Prior to SC69, the Singapore government requested the R programs used to carry out the analysis of seizure data for the CITES CoP17 ETIS report, but a lack of financial resources to perform this task prevented successful engagement. TRAFFIC agrees with the SC69 decision to make the R files available as a useful step promoting transparency and providing an opportunity for the code to be scrutinised by all Parties who wish to corroborate our methods and/or suggest potential improvements to make the analysis more robust. Achievement of this goal will involve several steps. Firstly, a suitable platform to host the R programmes needs to be found that is accessible to all Parties. As an example, already the code for the ETIS database software can be found on Github at <https://github.com/rfc2616/etis>, but it needs to be recognised that there are other suitable options, such as Open Science Framework (www.osf.io), SourceForge (www.sourceforge.net) and probably other potential platforms to be reviewed. TRAFFIC will evaluate the efficacy of the various options out there and select a suitable repository for the future posting of the ETIS code used in analyses presented in CITES CoP reports. Secondly, TRAFFIC will need to resolve any issues concerning license agreements and legal notices that may be attached to the code that is used in the ETIS analyses. For example, for the ETIS database software, the original license is a GNU General Public License, Version 3 that carries a set of legal agreements¹. There may also be licenses and legal notices for the R programs that are part of the code. Thirdly, the statistical consultants who were/will be engaged to undertake the ETIS analysis will need to be contracted to consolidate and prepare the code

¹ Legal Notices for ETIS software are described as follows:

The development of this database was funded by United Kingdom Government's Department of Environment, Food and Rural Affairs (Defra) pursuant to a Darwin Initiative grant with the University of Reading in collaboration with TRAFFIC.

The software on this site are Copyright © 2011 University of Reading

Copyright of the content is owned by TRAFFIC International or, where it belongs to a third party, it is used by TRAFFIC with permission. All rights reserved; redistribution prohibited.

used in the analysis conducted for CoP17 report in 2016 and for that which will underpin the CoP18 report. In this regard, the code will need to be annotated together with documentation on the modelling process so that interpretation is clear and consistent. It will be important to review each file carefully, and make sure that all relevant points are clearly explained and any exceptions or oddities duly noted. In addition, a narrative (or README file) will need to be created to accompany the code so that further explanation is part of the total package. It is envisaged that the code for the CoP17 analysis (which comprises 24 files) will be made available in 2018, and the code for the CoP18 analysis in 2019 (hopefully prior to the convening of that meeting).

Budget and Status of Funding: The total budget for this undertaking is US\$30,184 over two years and entails staff time cost recovery, the fees of the consultants to organise, annotate and prepare the documentation for the code, the costs of hosting, uploading and managing the data on a publicly accessible platform, and an admin/management fee of 12%. To date, no funding has been committed to this activity and the total budget is being sought from the CITES Parties.

Activity 2: Developing an ETIS Online Facility for the CITES Parties

Issue and Work Plan: This activity aims to launch an online facility to make the ETIS seizure data directly accessible to the CITES Parties whenever they require its use. This undertaking builds on a former initiative funded under the U.K. government's Darwin Initiative programme which supported the creation of an in-house ETIS website through which TRAFFIC manages the ETIS data. The plan is to take this facility a step further in order to offer the CITES Parties, in the three languages of the Convention, on-line access to all seizure records that relate to their country. It is envisaged that the CITES Parties would then be able to review and download their ETIS data whenever they need to, and to create new records on-line either individually or as part of a specially-designed ETIS Excel template that allows multiple seizure records to be submitted and integrated into the database at a single time. Training materials and other resources will also be made available for using the system. It needs to be appreciated that this facility is not for the general public, but rather designated officials who have been selected by their governments to represent their countries. In this regard, the CITES Secretariat and the countries themselves will govern exactly who has access to the ETIS facility for a specific country, and TRAFFIC will simply regulate access pursuant to precise instructions received from the CITES Secretariat. For each CITES Party, access will be limited to all data that involves that particular country in some role in the trade chain. To achieve this goal, various website features need to be further developed and tested by technical experts who will be engaged for such purposes. Arrangements with the CITES Secretariat, including the development of automated procedures for identifying and validating government officials to be formally recognised as 'Data Providers' with access to their country's seizure records, need to be reassessed, tested and finalised. Further, all aspects of the database system with the Parties will need to be functional in the three languages of the Convention (English, French and Spanish), thus investment in appropriate translation will be necessary. This is a considerable undertaking that will require focused planning to deliver within the next year.

Budget and Status of Funding: The total budget is US\$138,564 over two years and entails staff time cost recovery for the management and guidance of staff and consultants, the issuance of contracts, ongoing liaison with the CITES Secretariat and website developers (including regional and international travel costs), development and specification of structural components, software programmes, content and security features, and the rigorous review and testing of website functionality and features; consultancy fees to support development, testing, maintenance, upgrades and trouble-shooting as appropriate and the translation of website features, programming (R scripts,

etc.) and written, visual and graphical content; recurrent server hosting, internet costs and other operational expenses; banking and audit costs; and an admin/management fee of 12%².

Since SC69, the Belgium Government has contributed EUR25,000 towards this activity. Additionally, a total of US\$21,119 will be directed towards this activity from existing funding of the “*Minimising the Illegal Killing of Elephants and other Endangered Species (MIKES)*” under UNEP Project No: XT 6020-14-03 between the CITES MIKE programme and TRAFFIC, which is funded by the European Union pursuant to EC Project No. FED/2014/342-884. An additional US\$84,557 in funding is still being sought from the CITES Parties.

Activity 3: Liaison with the CITES Parties Prior to CoP18

Issue and Work Plan: Resolution Conf. 10.10 mandates a comprehensive report on the ETIS data to each meeting of the Conference of the Parties, but does not otherwise prescribe a process for this important undertaking. The ETIS report helps to shape decision-making for elephant conservation under the Convention and, in particular, identifies countries who are most heavily implicated in illegal ivory trade over specified periods of time. At SC69, it was agreed that the next ETIS report to CoP18 should be circulated to those Parties who were identified as “*potentially requiring attention in the NIAP process at least 30 days prior to the release of the report on the CITES website*”. To satisfy this directive, it is TRAFFIC’s intention to send the CoP18 ETIS analysis to these Parties some 30 days in advance of its final delivery to the CITES Secretariat. The schedule for this anticipates circulating the report accordingly in early to mid-November 2018 to the prescribed Parties.

Budget and Status of Funding: This activity will cost US\$16,290, but existing funding of the “*Minimising the Illegal Killing of Elephants and other Endangered Species (MIKES)*” under UNEP Project No: XT 6020-14-03 between the CITES MIKE programme and TRAFFIC, which is funded by the European Union pursuant to EC Project No. FED/2014/342-884 will be used.

Activity 4: Production of Explanatory Materials on the ETIS Conceptual Framework and Methods for Non-technical Audiences

Issue and Work Plan: Although ETIS is recognized globally as an exemplary trade monitoring programme that has developed the pioneering use of seizure data to elicit unbiased, objective patterns of illegal trade in elephant ivory, it is nonetheless acknowledged that a high degree of complexity characterizes the ETIS data and its analytical methods. The methods used to produce ETIS analyses have been published in peer-reviewed scientific journals to promote transparency and allow for independent validation of ETIS results³. Further, the ETIS reports to CITES CoPs are reviewed by the MIKE-ETIS Technical Advisory Group which has been appointed by the CITES Secretariat. On the other hand, most participants at CITES events come from non-technical backgrounds and experience difficulty in understanding the science behind ETIS. The Parties are asking for simple explanatory tools to be developed so that the conceptual framework of ETIS and the specific steps of the analytical methodology are more readily understood. TRAFFIC aims to engage skilled writers and graphic designers to prepare a stepwise explanatory approach to the ETIS analysis that distils technical complexity into a series of readily understandable presentations. It is hoped that funding for this task

² Note by the Secretariat: An admin/management fee of 12% is not applicable to the activities conducted by TRAFFIC that are funded by the European Union, through the MIKES project.

³ In this regard please see:

Underwood, F.M., Burn, R.W., Milliken, T. (2013). *Dissecting the Illegal Ivory Trade: An analysis of ivory seizures data*. PLoS One 8(10): e76539.

Burn, R.W. and Underwood, F.M. (2012). *A New Statistical Modelling Framework to Interpret Ivory Seizures Data: A technical report describing the new modelling framework for analysing seizures data from the Elephant Trade Information System*. Mathematics Report series (1/2013), Department of Mathematics and Statistics, University of Reading, UK.

will become available in a timely manner so that these materials can be available to the CITES Parties in advance of the report issued to CoP18.

Budget and Status of Funding: The total budget for this undertaking is US\$75,449 over two years and entails staff time cost recovery, the fees of the consultants (writers and graphic designers) to review and distil the ETIS analysis into a series of modules for presentation with appropriate illustrative graphics and illustrations, and an admin/management fee of 12%⁴. A total of US\$14,063 will be directed towards this activity from existing funding of the “*Minimising the Illegal Killing of Elephants and other Endangered Species (MIKES)*” under UNEP Project No: XT 6020-14-03 between the CITES MIKE programme and TRAFFIC, which is funded by the European Union pursuant to EC Project No. FED/2014/342-884. An additional US\$61,386 in funding is still being sought from the CITES Parties.

⁴ Note by the Secretariat: An admin/management fee of 12% is not applicable to the activities conducted by TRAFFIC that are funded by the European Union through the MIKES project

ACTIVITY BUDGETS:

Budget to Implement SC69 Com. 11

Activity 1. ETIS Code: USD

Budget Line	YR 1 2018	YR 2 2019	Total	YR 1 2018	YR 2 2019	Total Secured	Balance To Fund	Comments
1. ETIS Code Provision – Budget				ETIS Code Provision - Secured Funding				
Personnel								
- Staff	5,035	5,035	10,070	0	0	0	10,070	
- Consultants	8,000	6,400	14,400	0	0	0	14,400	
Travel	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Operational	600	600	1,200	0	0	0	1,200	
Establishment Costs	640	640	1,280	0	0	0	1,280	
Office Supplies	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Field Running	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Professional Services	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Subtotal	14,275	12,675	26,950	-	-	0	26,950	
12% Admin/Finance⁵	1,713	1,521	3,234	0	0	0	3,234	
Total	15,988	14,196	30,184	-	-	0	30,184	

⁵ Note by the Secretariat: An admin/management fee of 12% is not applicable to the activities conducted by TRAFFIC that are funded by the European Union through the MIKES project

Activity 2. ETIS Website Development: USD

Budget Line	YR 1 2018	YR 2 2019	Total	YR 1 2018	YR 2 2019	Total Secured	Balance To Fund	Comments
2. ETIS Website Development – Budget				ETIS Website Development - Secured Funding				
Personnel								
- Staff	34,809	19,345	54,154	24,542	0	24,542	29,612	BE Govt
- Consultants	24,160	8,960	33,120	15,000	6,119	21,119	12,001	EU CITES MIKES Africa
Travel	6,200	3,000	9,200	0	0	0	9,200	
Operational	10,000	5,700	15,700	0	0	0	15,700	
Establishment Costs	4,608	2,560	7,168	2,560	0	2,560	4,608	BE Govt
Office Supplies	576	0	576	0	0	0	576	
Field Running	1,800	0	1,800	0	0	0	1,800	
Professional Services	0	2,000	2,000	0	0	0	2,000	
Subtotal	82,153	41,565	123,718	42,102	6,119	48,221	75,497	
12% Admin/Finance⁶	9,858	4,988	14,846	5,052	734	5,786	9,060	
Total	92,011	46,553	138,564	47,154	6,853	54,007	84,557	

⁶ Note by the Secretariat: An admin/management fee of 12% is not applicable to the activities conducted by TRAFFIC that are funded by the European Union through the MIKES project

3. ETIS Liaison with CITES Parties: USD

Budget Line	YR 1 2018	YR 2 2019	Total	YR 1 2018	YR 2 2019	Total Secured	Balance To Fund	Comments
3. ETIS Liaison with CITES Parties – Budget				ETIS Liaison with CITES Parties - Secured Funding				
Personnel								
- Staff	3,240	10,810	14,050	3,240	10,810	14,050	0	<i>EU CITES MIKES Africa</i>
- Consultants	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Travel	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Operational	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Establishment Costs	640	1,600	2,240	640	640	2,240	0	<i>EU CITES MIKES Africa</i>
Office Supplies	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Field Running	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Professional Services	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Total	3,880	12,410	16,290	3,880	12,410	16,290	0	

Activity 4. ETIS Awareness Materials: USD

Budget Line	YR 1 2018	YR 2 2019	Total	YR 1 2018	YR 2 2019	Total Secured	Balance To Fund	Comments
4. ETIS Awareness Materials - Budget				ETIS Awareness Materials - Secured Funding				
Personnel								
- Staff	14,974	11,999	26,973	2,543	0	2,543	24,430	EU CITES MIKES Africa
- Consultants	19,900	9,900	29,800	5,600	1,600	7,200	22,600	EU CITES MIKES Africa
Travel	3,000	0	3,000	0	0	0	3,000	
Operational	2,100	2,100	4,200	2,000	2,000	4,000	200	EU CITES MIKES Africa
Establishment Costs	1,856	1,536	3,392	320	0	320	3,072	EU CITES MIKES Africa
Office Supplies	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Field Running	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Professional Services	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Subtotal	41,830	25,535	67,365	10,463	3,600	14,063	53,302	
12% Admin/Finance⁷	5,020	3,064	8,084	1,256	432	1,688	6,396	
Total	46,850	28,599	75,449	11,719	4,032	15,751	59,698	

⁷ Note by the Secretariat: An admin/management fee of 12% is not applicable to the activities conducted by TRAFFIC that are funded by the European Union through the MIKES project

All Components Grand Total: USD

Budget Line	YR 1 2018	YR 2 2019	Total	YR 1 2018	YR 2 2019	Total Secured	Balance To Fund	Comments
Budget for All Components - Grand Total				All Components Grand Total - Secured Funding				
Personelle								
- Staff	58,058	47,189	105,247	30,325	10,810	41,135	64,352	
- Consultants	52,060	25,260	77,320	20,600	7,719	28,319	49,001	
Travel	9,200	3,000	12,200	0	0	0	12,200	
Operational	12,700	8,400	21,100	2,000	2,000	4,000	17,100	
Establishment Costs	7,744	6,336	14,080	3,520	640	5,120	8,960	
Office Supplies	576	0	576	0	0	0	576	
Field Running	1,800	0	1,800	0	0	0	1,800	
Professional Services	0	2,000	2,000	0	0	0	2,000	
Subtotal	142,138	92,185	234,323	56,445	21,169	78,334	155,989	
12% Admin/Finance⁸	16,591	9,573	26,164	6,773	2,540	9,400	18,719	
Total	158,729	101,758	260,487	63,218	23,709	87,734	174,708	

⁸ Note by the Secretariat: An admin/management fee of 12% is not applicable to the activities conducted by TRAFFIC that are funded by the European Union through the MIKES project